2016
Marketing & Public Policy

Fostering Change for Communities and Society

June 23-25, 2016
California Polytechnic State University
San Luis Obispo, CA

Coeditors:
Brennan Davis
Beth Vallen
2016 Marketing and Public Policy Conference Awards

Best Paper in Conference

Soda Tax and Nanny States: Exploring Consumers’ Perceptions of Negative Externalities
Michael Walsh, West Virginia University
Cait Lamberton, University of Pittsburgh
Paula Fitzgerald, West Virginia University

Brenda M. Derby Memorial Award

The Motivation Potential Scale: Integrating Goal Theory into Medication Adherence Prediction
Richard J. Vann, University of Wyoming
Kem P. Krueger, University of Wyoming

The Brenda M. Derby Memorial Award is presented nationally to an outstanding doctoral student who demonstrates excellence as an emerging policy researcher. The award honors a strong advocate of the public policy and marketing subdiscipline and is supported through the generosity of the Center for Marketing and Consumer Insights at Villanova University.
# Table of Contents

**Preface** viii  
**List of Reviewers** ix

## Expanding the Lens: Marketer and Consumer Perceptions of Vulnerable

- Exploring the Consumption Behavior of At-Risk-of-Poverty Citizens  
  *Christina Holweg, Verena Gruber*  
  Page 1  
- Lifestyle Segmentation of Subsistence Consumers  
  *Roland Gau, Tejinder Sharma, Saeed Tajdini*  
  Page 3  
- Changing Lifestyles in the Age of Fear: A Projective Analysis of Social Insecurity and Consumption Patterns  
  *Pável Reyes-Mercado, Julieta Mercado-González*  
  Page 5  
- Acts of Marketplace Omission and Commission  
  *Aronté Bennett, Stacey Menzel Baker, J.P. James, Samantha Cross, Gregory Bartholomew, Akon Ekpo, Geraldine Rosa Henderson, Martina Hutton, Aporov Khare, Abhijit Roy, Tony Stovall, Charles Ray Taylor*  
  Page 7

## Inquiries into Public Policy and Marketplace Inclusion

- The Intersection of Religion and Policy: Business and Consumer Response to Competing Institutional Logics  
  *Elizabeth A. Minton, Frank Cabano, Meryl Gardner, Esi Elliot, Daniele Mathras, Naomii Mandel*  
  Page 9  
- Online Accessibility of Retail Websites for Visually Impaired Consumers: Creating a Dialogue for Policy Change  
  *Alex H. Cohen, Jorge E. Fresneda, Rolph E. Anderson*  
  Page 10  
- The Stigma Turbine: Generating Policy Prescriptions for (De)Stigmatization in the Marketplace  
  Page 12  
- Developing Political Will and Public Will for Equal Pay Around a Common Frame  
  *Amber N.W. Raile, Virginia K. Bratton, Caroline Graham Austin*  
  Page 14

## Emerging Legal and Policy Issues

- Soda Tax and Nanny States: Exploring Consumers’ Perceptions of Negative Externalities  
  *Michael F. Walsh, Cait Poynor Lamberton, M. Paula Fitzgerald*  
  Page 16  
- Vulnerability in Consumer Contracts: Mandatory Arbitration and Policies for Improvement  
  *Cliff Scott, Elise Riker*  
  Page 18  
- Product Category Names: Selection, Strategy, and Control  
  *Ross D. Petty*  
  Page 20  
- Juxtaposing the Persuasion Knowledge Model and Privacy Paradox: An Experimental Look at Ad Personalization, Public Policy, and Public Understanding  
  *Nancy H. Brinson, Matthew S. Eastin*  
  Page 21

## Let’s Eat: Drivers and Outcomes of Food Decision Making

- License to Indulge: Contextual Determinants of Unhealthy Food Choices in Consumption Settings  
  *Kimberlee Weaver, YK Lee, Stephen Garcia*  
  Page 23  
- Can Money Tip the Scale? Social Judgment of Overweight Shoppers and the Role of Form of Payment  
  *Carrie Skinner, Martin Mende, Maura L. Scott*  
  Page 30  
- The Effect of Smiley as Motivational Incentives on Children’s Food Choices: A Field Experiment in European Primary Schools  
  *Wencke Gwodz, Lucia A. Reisch, Marge Eha, Gabrielle Eiben, Monica Hunsberger, Kenn Konstabel, Eva Kovacs, Edyta Łuszczki, Artur Mazur, Edina Mendll, Stefan Rach, Maike Wolters*  
  Page 31
The 101-Calorie Mini Pack: How Distinctiveness in Regulations Influences Food Product Evaluations  
Elizabeth A. Minton, Chris Lee

Drivers of Proenvironmental Attitudes and Behaviors

Lies, Damned Lies, and Statistics: How Process-Based Explanations Increase Belief in Global Warming  
Jeff Rotman, Thomas J. Weber
Using Problem Recognition Branding to Increase Awareness of Climate Change  
William D. Diamond
Social Labeling as a Motivator to Preadolescents’ Proenvironmental Behaviors: Theoretical Explanation to the Moderating Effect of Age Through Self-Concept Clarity  
Karine Charry, Béatrice Parguel, Julien Bourjot
Sustainability of Collaborative Consumption in Question: When Secondhand P2P Platforms Stimulate Green Consumers’ Impulse Buying and Overconsumption  
Béatrice Parguel, Renaud Lunardo, Florence Benoit-Moreau

Consumer Insights for Behavioral Change

Cause-Related Marketing Literacy  
Anne Hamby, David Brinberg
The Motivation Potential Scale: Integrating Goal Theory into Medication Adherence Prediction  
Richard J. Vann, Kem P. Krueger
How Social Influence Can Hinder Goal Pursuit  
Deidre Popovich, Zoey Chen
Understanding Public Service Announcement Receptivity and Behavioral Change Using Bayes Net Drivers Analysis  
Robert A. Petrin, Meghana Raja, Sheri Klein, Daniel Bartolo

Spending, Saving, and Borrowing: Policy Investigations into Financial Planning and Decision-Making

Competitiveness in Retirement Planning: Whoever Dies with the Most Toys, Wins  
Kristin A. Scott, S. Todd Weaver
Veselina Milanova, Peter Maas
The Effects of Perceived Scarcity on Financial Decision Making  
Laurel Aynne Cook, Raika Sadeghein
Assessing the Impact of Intervention Policies in Africa’s Inclusive Finance Programs: How Financial Services Generate Trust and Long-Term Savings Behavior of Rural Entrepreneurs in Ghana  
Charlene A. Dadzie, Kofi Q. Dadzie, Evelyn Winston

Ethics and Consumer Protection

Mechanical Turk Data in Public Policy Research: Replications of Two FTC Experiments Explore Online Sample Use  
Jeff Langenderfer, Alla Akiyeva, Steven W. Kopp
Leading the Way: Motivating Ethical Action Through Perceived Marketplace Influence  
R. Bret Leary, Richard J. Vann, John D. Mittelstaedt
A Primer on Marketing, Policy and Social Change: The ABCs of Five Sub-Areas  
Eric Krszjzaniek, Matthew Lunde, Travis Simkins, Edna Ndichu, Stacey Baker
Big Data and Policy Issues  
Kyungwon (Kyung) Lee, J.P. James, Mingyue Zhang, Jeff Chester, Jerome D. Williams

Explorations of Transparency and Trust on Consumer Evaluations

“Caution: May Contain Brands!”: Effects of Informational and Evaluative Textual Forewarnings of Product Placement  
Tina Tessitore, Maggie Geuens, Leen Adams
“Twitter in Prosocial Communication”: The Mediating Role of Influence of Presumed Influence

Karine Charry, Tina Tessitore

To Disclose or Not to Disclose? Bloggers and the Consequences of Transparency About the Nature of the Relationship with the Brands They Recommend

Alice Audrezet, Karine Charry

The Double-Edge Effect of Donation Size in Retailers’ Charity Promotions: When Skepticism Cools the Warm-Glow Effect

Aïda Mimouni Chaabane, Béatrice Parguel

Demarketing Campaigns

When Should a Nudge Become a Shove? Young Adult Smokers’ Perceptions of Tobacco Endgame Strategies

Janet Hoek, Jude Ball, Heather Gifford, Teresa Taylor, Stephanie Erick

The Effects of Demarketing Campaigns on Consumer Attitudes and Actual Consumption

Edward Ramirez, Saeed Tajdini

Unpacking Co-Creation in a Smokefree Program: A Service Perspective

Nadina R. Luca

Predictors of Effectiveness of Public Service Announcements (PSA): A Systematic Analysis of Campaigns

Aysha Keisler

Unwrapping Green Products and Packaging

Trait Transference: Inferring Product Traits from Environmentally Conscious Packages

Jessica Rixom, Debra L. Scammon

A Tale of Two Goods, Green Versus Non-Green: The Effects of Apathy and Myopia on Purchase Intentions

Ayşen Coşkun, Andrea Vocino, Michael Polonsky

How Policy Makers Can Efficiently Incentivize the Adoption of Solar Panels?

Hossein Eslami

“Do as I Do”: Effect of Descriptive Social Norm and Endorsement on Ad Credibility and Intention to Purchase Non-Overpackaged Products

Elgaaied Leila, Monnot Elisa, Reniou Fanny

Responses to Business Policy and Practice

When Pay Does and Doesn’t Matter: How Employee Compensation Affects Consumer Perceptions of Firms

Nora Moran

Serving Two Masters: Can a Firm Care About People and the Planet at the Same Time?

Colin Gabler, V. Myles Landers

Investigating Consumer Responses to Nonprofit Overhead Costs

Skyler King, Richie Liu, Mark Mulder

The Effects of Self-Transcendence Organizational Values on Customer Satisfaction and Corporate Reputation

Monique Bell, Pravin Nath, Hyokjin Kwak

Overcoming Obstacles to Consumer Wellness and Well-Being

Accompanying the Demand for Social Change in End of Life Care: A Qualitative Study Through the Lens of Physicians, Patients, and Relatives in France

François A. Passerard, Xavier Menaud

Increasing Organ Donation Registration in the United States

Matthew D. Meng, Barbara Bickart, Roberta Clarke

Brush Reminder: Testing a Reminder Cue to Improve the Oral Health of Urban Head Start Children

Bridget Leonard, Holli Seabury

Consumer Reactions to Off-Label Prescriptions

M. Paula Fitzgerald, Farnoush Rashadi, Matthew E. Sarkees
Consumer Communities and Community-Based Interventions

Exploring the Innovation-Decision Process in the Adoption of Products in Stigmatized Domains
   Edna G. Ndichu, Terri L. Rittenburg
   130

Owning Community
   Meredith R. Thomas, Thomas O’Guinn
   132

Shifting Ground: Controlling the Ecotopian Dream
   Joachim Scholz, Jay M. Handelman
   141

“Why Wouldn’t I Be Sustainable?” Structuring Sustainability with No Mandated Policy in Greensburg, KS
   Matthew Lunde
   143
Preface

The theme of this year’s Marketing and Public Policy Conference (MPPC) is “Fostering Change for Communities and Society.” This theme highlights the ability of policy efforts to impart change at both the community and societal levels in ways that influence consumers’ lives and the quality of society. It also recognizes the many issues that call for greater research, debate, and action—from the local to the global level and all points in between. While the 2016 conference program follows in the tradition of past conferences by addressing significant issues at the intersection of marketing and public policy, it also offers rich opportunities for the debate of emerging social issues affecting consumers and the marketplace. This forum is intended as a space for discussion and healthy debate on the value of stimulating social change through research, business practices, public policy, and collaboration with grassroots community efforts.

A preview of this year’s conference program and proceedings shows a wide array of topics, including health behaviors, anti-smoking efforts, nutrition, obesity, food insecurity, social justice, diversity, poverty, sustainability, corporate social responsibility, recycling, maladaptive behavior, financial decision making, advertising claims, privacy, health care–related issues, and many more. We hope that the program will challenge and inspire you.

We are thankful to the members of our Program Planning Committee and to conference reviewers for their willingness and responsiveness in helping us process submissions. We also appreciate those who submitted proposals for special sessions and roundtables. Reviewers and special session organizers are to be commended; without them, we would not have such a high-quality, thought-provoking conference. We also recognize and thank all those who submitted their research work; their research is the primary reason we convene this conference.

Finally, we appreciate Cal Poly and Villanova University’s encouragement and support of our efforts in organizing this conference; in particular, we thank Cal Poly for graciously hosting MPPC on campus this year. We also thank all those involved in MPPC and its planning for entrusting this year’s conference to us and helping us develop it successfully. Enjoy!

Brennan Davis and Beth Vallen

Conference Co-chairs

Special Thanks to the MPPC 2016 Program Planning Committee

Laurel Anderson, Arizona State University
Craig Andrews, Marquette University
Courtney Baker, University of Wyoming
Stacey Menzel Baker, Creighton University
Lauren Block, Baruch College, CUNY
Wendy Boland, American University
Sterling Bone, Utah State University
Melissa Bublitz, University of Wisconsin–Oshkosh
Myla Bui-Nguyen, Loyola Marymount University
Scot Burton, University of Arkansas
Conrad Choiniere, Food and Drug Administration
Paul Connell, Stony Brook University
David Crockett, University of South Carolina
Timothy Dewhirst, University of Guelph
Pam Ellen, Georgia State University
Paula Fitzgerald, West Virginia University
Sonya Grier, American University
Manoj Hastak, American University
Geri Henderson, Loyola University Chicago
Ron Hill, Villanova University
Janet Hoek, University of Otago
Betsy Howlett, University of Arkansas
Easwar Iyer, University of Massachusetts Amherst

Carol Kaufman-Scarborough, Rutgers University
Jeremy Kees, Villanova University
Ingrid Martin, California State University, Long Beach
Kelly Martin, Colorado State University
Marlys Mason, Oklahoma State University
Elizabeth Miller, University of Massachusetts Amherst
George Milne, University of Massachusetts Amherst
Betsy Moore, University of Notre Dame
Jan Pappalardo, Federal Trade Commission
Vanessa Perry, George Washington University
Justine Rapp, San Diego State University
Steve Rayburn, Texas State University
Rebecca Reczek, Ohio State University
Debbie Scammon, University of Utah
Maura Scott, Florida State University
Ronn Smith, University of Arkansas
Cliff Shultz, Loyola University Chicago
Dave Stewart, Loyola Marymount University
Kristen Walker, California State University, Northridge
Josh Wiener, Oklahoma State University
Bill Wilkie, University of Notre Dame
Jerome Williams, Rutgers University
Sarah Williamson, St. Joseph’s University
2016 Marketing and Public Policy Conference Reviewers

Muhammad Gunawan Alif, Sampoerna University
Kristina Auxtova, University of Edinburgh
Victor A. Barger, University of Wisconsin–Whitewater
Lauren Block, Baruch College, CUNY
Lisa Bolton, Penn State University
Sterling Bone, Utah State University
Jacob Brower, Queens University
Andrew Paul Bryant, Drake University
Melissa G. Bublitz, University of Wisconsin–Oshkosh
Denise Buhrau, Stony Brook University
My Bui, Loyola Marymount University
Mark Anthony Camilleri, University of Malta
Kealy Carter, University of South Carolina
Jesse R. Catlin, California State University, Sacramento
Yoon-Na Cho, Villanova University
Robert Clarke, Boston University
Cathy Cole, University of Iowa
Paul M. Connell, Stony Brook University
Georgiana Craciun, Duquesne University
Elizabeth Crosby, University of Wisconsin–La Crosse
Brennan Davis, California Polytechnic State University
Debra M. Desrochers, University of Westminster
Denver D’Rozario, Howard University
Meike Gwozdz, Copenhagen Business School
Rishad Habib, University of Guelph
Sue Vaux Halliday, University of Hertfordshire
Anne Hamby, Hofstra University
Manoj Hastak, American University
Ronald Paul Hill, Villanova University
Janet Hoek, University of Otago
Veronika Ilyuk, Hofstra University
Reaan Immelman, University of Johannesburg
Easwar Iyer, University of Massachusetts
Jeff Joireman, Washington State University
Carol Kaufman-Scarborough, Rutgers University
Jeremy Kees, Villanova University
Christine Kowalczyk, East Carolina University
Anvita Kumar, Coventry University
Marcia Fadzai Kwaramba, Monash University
Monica LaBarge, Queen’s University
Jeff Langenderfer, Meredith College
R. Bret Leary, University of Nevada, Reno
Seonjeong (Ally) Lee, Kent State University
Kyungwon (Kyung) Lee, Rutgers University
Bridget Leonard, Indiana University–Purdue University Fort Wayne
Rebecca Liu, Lancaster University
Richie L. Liu, Oklahoma State University
Katherine Loveland, Xavier University
Nadina R. Luca, University of York
Jane E. Machin, Radford University
Lauren Frances Mayor, Baruch College, CUNY
John R. McCaskill Jr., University of Texas at Dallas

Martin Mende, Florida State University
Elizabeth G. Miller, University of Massachusetts Amherst
Ann Mirabito, Baylor University
Nora Moran, California State University, Northridge
Emily M. Moscato, Saint Joseph’s University
Adrienne Muldrow, Washington State University
Frank Murphy, George Fox University
Atanas N. Nikolov, University of Georgia
Patricia A. Norberg, Quinnipiac University
Terry O’Sullivan, Open University
Julie L. Ozanne, University of Melbourne
Lucie Kathleen Ozanne, University of Canterbury
Françoise Aude Passerard, ESG Management School
Ross D. Petty, Babson College
Andrea Lynn Phillips, University of Nebraska–Lincoln
Anastasiya Pocheptsova, University of Maryland
Michael Jay Polonsky, Deakin University
Deidre Popovich, Texas Tech University
Nurul Dwi Purwanti, National Cheng Kung University
Justine Rapp, University of San Diego
Farnoush Reshadi, West Virginia University
Pável Reyes-Mercado, Universidad Anáhuac México Norte
Elise B. Riker, University of Arkansas Fort Smith
Jessica Rixom, Florida International University
Herbert Jack Rotfeld, Auburn University
Linda Court Salisbury, Auburn University
Tracey King Salisbury, Boston College

Marketing and Public Policy Conference Proceedings/2016 ix
Exploring the Consumption Behavior of At-Risk-of-Poverty Citizens

Christina Holweg, WU Vienna
Verena Gruber, HEC Montreal

Keywords: impoverished consumers, social supermarkets, ethnography, retailing

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

This research focuses on consumers who are considered to be at risk of poverty (this threshold is defined by the European Commission to be at 60% of the national median income (Eurostat, 2013) and their experiences in a typical consumption context, namely shopping for grocery products. More specifically, we explore the notion of consumption for a group of people that are threatened by poverty but still have sufficient resources to sustain basic pillars of their lives such as housing and the purchase of basic consumer goods. The majority of their purchases is conducted in a very specific retail environment, namely social supermarkets (SSMs). As consumers drift back and forth between regular consumption environments and the specific venues of social supermarkets, the current research allows to explore and bridge two seemingly opposing ends: contemporary mainstream consumer behavior and impoverished consumers’ understandings of consumption.

Research Question

Literature on people in poverty has provided important insights into how poverty impacts consumers’ lives as well as their attitudes, behaviors and emotions (see, e.g., Hill 2001; Klein and Hill 2008; Poppendieck 1998). A common basis of this literature stream is the acceptance of consumption as integral component in identity formation as our sense of self is often closely connected to our ability to consume and to our identity as consumers (Hamilton and Catterall, 2005). Against this background, we aim to extend research on impoverished consumers by exploring how consumption experiences in social supermarkets as well as the transition between two concurrent consumption realities (i.e. the standard supermarket and the social supermarkets) influence self-identity formation of consumers. To this end, the present research focuses on consumers who live below the so called at-risk-of-poverty line, defined as 60% of the national median income across European countries (Eurostat, 2013). This threshold is used to establish eligibility and access to a unique consumption setting: social supermarkets (SSMs). Social supermarkets provide products at a much lower price and are increasingly widespread even in developed societies (Holweg and Lienbacher 2011).

Method and Data

To better understand the behavior of impoverished consumers in the context of grocery shopping, we follow an ethnographic approach: At first, we conducted three focus groups amongst customers of three different social supermarkets. The groups included between 3 and 6 people who were mixed in terms of gender, age, profession, and family status. The initial rounds of focus groups were purposefully chosen so that participants were able to discuss their personal situation and emotions with individuals who made similar experiences. Next, we interviewed three senior store managers to get a broader picture of different types of SSM customers, in particular of customers who would not be available for personal interviews for reasons of language skills or other personal resentments. All interviews were led by two experienced moderators who work as volunteers at a SSM, which generated further trust among the respondents. The initial analysis included the reading of transcripts, field notes and additional documents. We then inductively coded existing data along emergent categories and, in a subsequent step, grouped them into more abstract conceptual classes that reflect the transformation consumers go through when transcending from the normal consumer landscape to the at-risk-of-poverty population found in social supermarkets (Spiggle, 1994).

For further information contact: Christina Holweg, Assistant Professor of Marketing, WU Vienna (christina.holweg@wu.ac.at).
Summary of Findings
We find evidence of a step-wise process, in which consumers depart from their “old” consumerist lifestyle to a reality in which they need additional (financial) support:

The first step of the transition process begins with consumers’ realization that they need help. It seems that consumers can ignore the precariousness of their situation up to a certain point but ultimately have to surrender, which typically means they apply for access to a SSM.

Once officially registered, consumers need time to get accustomed to the consumption experience and their new identity as “social supermarket consumer.” This struggle of acceptance marks the second step of the transition process.

Third, re-negotiating one’s identity is characterized by increasing familiarization with a new set of rules, such as queuing up to be served instead of helping oneself; or their insight that they won’t be able to change their fate, as it often happens among retired people.

A new self-concept results as a last step. Consumers show a sense of pride for being able to manage their lives, and display a shared identity with other SSM customers. However, this step also goes in hand with signs of increasing alienation from traditional consumer outlets.

Key Contributions
Consumers resort to the marketplace to forge a sense of self and to construct their identities. We find that our interviewees, as regular customers of social supermarkets, re-negotiate their identity as consumers but, at the same time, clearly dissociate themselves from “normal” consumers. Our insights thereby extend the understanding that “normality is equated with the ability to consume” (Hamilton and Catterall, 2005, p. 627). Even more than the ability per se, we find that normality, as experienced by our interviewees, is about the boundaries of this ability to consume. To this end, the adaptation process we witness among our consumers—from normal to impoverished consumers—is different to the modifications of habitual frameworks of interpretation found by Hill and Stamey (1990). Within these initial phases of our ethnography, we experienced the paradoxical nature of SSMs: They are a place where consumers with financial restrictions feel appreciated and among kindred, yet at the same time reinforce a pattern of self-stigmatization and a notion of not being normal consumers. Given the rise of SSMs across Europe, a better understanding of SSM consumers is needed to support their self-empowerment by reinforcing and promoting the “normalcy” of shopping within financially restricted conditions.

References are available on request.
Lifestyle Segmentation of Subsistence Consumers

Roland Gau, University of Texas at El Paso
Tejinder Sharma, Kurukshetra University
Saeed Tajdini, University of Texas at El Paso

Keywords: base of the pyramid, India, market segmentation, technology adoption, cluster analysis

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
This research presents quantitative evidence that subsistence consumers—those who live in extreme poverty and are often described as the Base of the Pyramid (BoP)—are not a homogeneous population, and proposes that customer segments within subsistence consumers exist. While relatively basic in both concept and execution, customer segmentation provides a powerful tool for marketers and policy makers as they make decisions for the traditionally underserved and under-researched subsistence marketplace. Although similar conclusions have been drawn in the extant scholarship on subsistence consumers, these conclusions are often built from theoretical propositions or qualitative evidence that tends to focus on individual-level analysis or case studies, rather than employing quantitative findings to build toward more specific customer segments (e.g., Abdelnour and Branzei 2010; Fang, Russell, and Singh 2014; Gau, Jae, and Viswanathan 2012; Viswanathan, Seth, Gau, and Chaturvedi 2009; Weidner, Rosa, and Viswanathan 2010). This research focuses on questions surrounding how subsistence consumer can be segmented in an objective, quantitative way, particularly with regard to their lifestyles.

Method and Data
Preliminary research consisted of a series of 74 open-ended interviews conducted with low-income residents of Kurukshetra, located in the state of Haryana, India, which was used to create a questionnaire used for the present analysis. Questionnaire respondents were recruited from Kurukshetra, with a total of 586 responses. Respondents were screened such that they all self-identified as having low income, and all received financial support from the Indian government. Survey results were then analyzed, first using Exploratory Factor Analysis (EFA) to better understand the conceptual structure of the data, followed by a 2-stage cluster analysis (Punj and Stewart 1983) to identify market segments within the subsistence population based on their lifestyle preferences and aspirations. To offer additional evidence for the validity of the proposed clusters, differences in the preference and usage habits regarding cell phones between clusters were examined. Cell phones represent a product in subsistence marketplaces that have the potential to be transformative in subsistence marketplaces through the facilitation of information flow, as well as enabling mobile money and greater access to the formal economy (Fang et al., 2014).

Summary of Findings
The end goal was to use cluster analysis to identify market segments. Our EFA revealed that subsistence consumer lifestyles resulted in seven factors that described consumer lifestyles and values. We label these factors as: Hedonic Consumption, Social-boundedness, Materialism, Business Skepticism, Social Activism, Uncertainty Avoidance, Traditional-mindedness. These seven factors were then used in a 2-stage cluster analysis (via SPSS’ 2-stage cluster analysis routine) which revealed 4 distinct customer segments, which we label as:

Cluster A: Modern Workaholics
Cluster B: Worldly Social Leisure Seekers
Cluster C: Traditional Strugglers
Cluster D: Optimistic Risk Takers

The identified clusters had a silhouette measure of cohesion and separation of 0.2, which is considered fair. To offer additional evidence for the validity of the proposed clusters, dif-

For further information contact: Roland Gau, College of Business Administration, University of Texas at El Paso (rgau@utep.edu).
ferences in the preference and usage habits regarding cell phones between clusters were examined. Two key differences between customer segments were found: the initial (versus ongoing) costs associated with cell phone usage, and the primary use (hedonic vs. utilitarian) of the cell phone. While limited financial resources contributed to these usage differences (particularly with “Traditional Strugglers”), the other clusters with similar income/wealth significantly differed from one another in these behaviors.

Key Contributions

Given these differences, it is likely that market segmentation within subsistence populations will have a variety of benefits. Certainly, for firms selling goods and services for particular usages (such as agricultural or medical goods and supplies), the ability to reach more specific groups within the subsistence marketplace will make for more effective marketing efforts. Moreover, understanding the lifestyle preferences and aspirations of subsistence consumers will result in a more nuanced understanding of how useful products may be adopted in these contexts. A number of products have captured the imagination of those involved in poverty alleviation efforts, with the intent of providing products and services that can help address the unmet basic needs that are faced by subsistence consumers. In particular, this research highlights differences in mobile phone preferences. The use of mobile phones allows for more flexibility and mobility in communications, and in many parts of the world mobile phone service does not serve as an upgrade from land-based phones, but rather as the baseline product for individual use. In addition to voice communications, mobile phones allow for access to market information as well as access to secure financial services, bypassing costly services that were that were often limited in availability to subsistence consumers (Fang et al. 2014).

References are available on request.
Changing Lifestyles in the Age of Fear: A Projective Analysis of Social Insecurity and Consumption Patterns

Pável Reyes-Mercado, Universidad Anáhuac México Norte
Julieta Mercado-González, Universidad Anáhuac México Norte

Keywords: social insecurity, fear, purchase patterns, consumer behavior, ZMET

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
This paper analyzes the influence of social insecurity as specific source of stress, consumer reactions to such influence, and changes in consumption behavior. There is a need to understand how consumers react to social insecurity given the current socio-economic landscape. Research on how social insecurity influences consumer behavior has received little attention with the exception of some studies analyzing the influence of post-traumatic stress disorder originated from terrorist attacks (Ruvio et al. 2014; Somer and Ruvio 2014) and natural disasters (Baker et al. 2007). While the occurrence of such unexpected events are of relatively low probability, recurrent criminal events as passer robbery, transport robbery, burglary, and extortion provoke a heightened sense of personal vulnerability. Mexico has been ranked in the place 142 in the Global Peace Index (IEP, 2015) due to “urban gang violence” and domestic conflicts related to drug traffic. During 2013, 33.9% of Mexican households had at least one family member who was a victim of crime being passer robbery, extortion, and burglary the most prevalent (INEGI, 2015). The previous makes Mexico an interesting case study to analyze social insecurity and consumption patterns.

Method and Data
We used ZMET methodology (Zaltman Metaphor Elicitation Technique) a qualitative research methodology, created by Gerald Zaltman (1997), and designed to construct mental patterns of thoughts and emotions. It uses different images and metaphors referring the consumer’s memories and representations, constructing patterns of the consumer’s thinking and behavior. Consumers select images and control the stimuli in a guided conversation in-depth personal interviews. The ZMET methodology was gathered in the Metropolitan area of Mexico City, interviewees generated the methodology materials in Spanish. The resulting codification and classification of constructs as well as hierarchy map, and consensus model were translated to English following the suggestion of (Churchill Jr, 1979) which involves translating from one language to another to assure consistency of terms. For the application of the technique, a judgement sample of 32 observations: 27 students, 5 employees, 15 men and 17 women (age range: 19–55 years; age mean: 22.5 years). The overall sample belongs to socio-economical levels A/B (monthly household income: more than U.S.$5,000.00), C+ (monthly household income: between U.S.$2,058.00 and U.S.$4,999.99) according to AMAI (2005). The sample individuals were filtered out on the basis of exposure to at least one direct or indirect personal experience related to social insecurity.

Summary of Findings
The model involves thoughts and feelings generated by social insecurity dimensions. Following Zaltman (1997), we considered as relevant only those feelings and thought which received at least four mentions from interviewees. To read and interpret the consensus map, we follow the rule of thumb suggested by Christensen and Olson (2002):

The first step is to locate the most highly connected constructs that are linked to other constructs. The central con-

For further information contact: Pável Reyes-Mercado, Universidad Anáhuac México Norte (pavel.reyes@anahuac.mx).
The most mentioned overall goal among the thematic segments are feelings of insecurity and changes in lifestyle. The consensus map shows that feelings of insecurity are linked to fear and sources of fear as well as changes in lifestyle which, in turn, are associated with stop wearing luxury brands and stop using conspicuous gadgets.

Look for missing constructs. Looking for concepts or ideas which are not explicitly showed in the consensus map. We noticed that use of guns weather for self-defense or aggression were not mentioned during the interviews. The underlying assumption is that there may be relationships between social insecurity and guns but we could not find any construct grounded on empirical data.

**Key Contributions**

Results show four themes related to social insecurity: Fear, hazardous city, lack of government job, changing lifestyles. The study contributes to literature in that it extends the domain of consumer vulnerability (Baker et al. 2005) by adding deep consumers’ emotions as fear as a consumer response to vulnerability.

The qualitative methodology analyses deep feelings and thoughts derived from metaphoric thinking and generates a map of relationships among big themes and constructs. While this methodology helps analyze functional and psychosocial consequences from the perception of social insecurity attributes, it may limit the broad actionability of marketing tactics and plans. However, there is opportunity to evaluate marketing tactics as development of communication and advertising campaigns as well as product improvements.

This study has to be considered as a first approach to an under researched field that relates social insecurity with consumption patterns. Given the high dependability of qualitative research upon the researcher, there is a need to deploy measures to raise reliability levels. Triangulation is a technique used to confirm the findings of a study by analyzing a similar sample of individuals in a similar social context. For this reason, further research needs to complete a confirmatory study.

*References are available on request.*
Acts of Marketplace Omission and Commission

Aronté Bennett, Villanova University  
Stacey Menzel Baker, Creighton University  
J.P. James, Rutgers University  
Samantha Cross, Iowa State University  
Gregory Bartholomew, Dixie State University  
Akon Ekpo, Rutgers University  
Geraldine Rosa Henderson, Loyola University Chicago  
Martina Hutton, University of Winchester  
Aporov Khare, Indian Institute of Management, Calcutta  
Abhijit Roy, University of Scranton  
Tony Stovall, Woodbury University  
Charles Ray Taylor, Villanova University

Keywords: omission, commission, cultural trauma theory, intersectionality

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
Our paper begins by reviewing cultural trauma theory as a useful framework for examining experiences of omission and commission as marketplace trauma and for explaining the intersectional natures of these phenomena. We go on to explicate the concepts, experiences, and impacts of omission and commission.

Summary of Findings
Cultural trauma theory provides a powerful framework for explaining how social movements and political action, like those that lead to anti-discrimination legislation, come to fruition (Alexander 2012; Breese 2011; Eyerman 2001; Neal 2005). Cultural trauma is located in the relationship between four key elements of the order and progression of social life: a trauma event or set of effects experienced by a particular group brought to national attention, collective discourse, collective practices, and the social structure (Alexander 2004b; Breese 2011; Smelser 2004).

Institutionalized privilege indicates which consumers will experience collective trauma in the marketplace. Institutionalized privilege refers to established laws, customs, and practices that systematically reflect and produce a sense of superiority in society for an in-group (Jones 1997). Extant literature commonly discusses in-group/out-group membership based on race, ethnicity, ability, religion, age, sexuality, economic class, education, and gender (Cui 1997; Burton 2005; Fiske 2000; Healy and O’Brien 2014; Oakenful 2013).

Members of out-groups are disproportionately likely to experience the trauma of marketplace omission and commission. Marketplace omission refers to behaviors by marketers that chronically fail to engage, intervene, acknowledge and/or include the experiences and perspectives of diverse individuals and groups. Marketers have long recognized that marketing activities signal the type of customer anticipated and accepted (Baker, Holland, and Kaufman-Scarborough 2007; Grier and Kumanyika 2010; Sirgy, Grewal, and Man-

For further information contact: Aronté Bennett, Associate Professor, Villanova University (aronte.bennnett@villanova.edu).
gleburg 2000). Omission occurs when out-group members’ identities and needs are not considered or reflected in marketing messages, design, and delivery. Marketplace omission is a collective trauma, resulting in restricted choice for the neglected consumers, furtherance of institutional privilege and destructed marketing systems.

In contrast to marketplace omission, in marketplace commission out-group members’ identities are represented, but cast in a negative light. Marketplace commission refers to behaviors that explicitly misrepresent, mistreat, and/or essentialize the expressions and perspectives of diverse individuals and groups. Commission occurs when the presence of a member of an out-group in the marketplace results in intentional or unintentional discrimination, degradation, or denial of opportunity. Marketplace commission, in the misrepresentation and/or mistreatment of consumers with out-group social markers, upholds institutionalized privilege; creates systemic restricted choice (Bone, Christensen, and Williams 2014; Hill 2001; Hill et al. 2015); and results in retaliatory consumer behavior that is destructive to marketing systems (Baker and Kaufman-Scarborough 2001; Johnson, Meyers, and Williams 2013).

The marginalization, exclusion, non-inclusion, subordination of certain groups or people in the marketplace may involve both, acts of omission and commission. These acts are not detached, insulated actions perpetuated by disparate groups with unrelated motivations, but often overlap on various, intersected levels of complexity.

Cultural trauma grows out of collective trauma. Cultural trauma arises when the larger society comes to understand that omission and commission are not just marketplace traumas that impact “them” (collective trauma) but rather, that they are marketplace traumas that impact all of “us.” The marketing system, in an ideal world, would serve the needs of all types of consumers, not just those with institutional privilege. When the marketing system chronically discriminates against and/or fails to engage some types of consumer groups, those possessing out-group markers, the marketing system fails to deliver on its promise of a higher standard of living and life quality for the people it is designed to serve. It is when the larger society comes to believe that these denigrating and dejecting experiences impact not just consumers who belong to out-groups but harm the entire market, collective traumas rise to cultural traumas.

Key Contributions

Omission and commission are marketplace traumas. Outgroups created by institutionalized privilege are all too often overlooked, misrepresented or maligned. Though distinct in their nature, omission and commission are inextricably related. In this paper, we have highlighted the complex, intersecting relationship between marketplace omission and commission, and their interactions with other elements of the cultural trauma process and consequences for multiple-marginalized groups. Putting forth distinct and distinguishable definitions of each type of act, this work permits researchers to disentangle these concepts, exploring them separately or in conjunction. We posit that potential actions to help avoid, mitigate or correct these marketplace traumas should revolve around the “3 E’s”: exposure, education, and empathy.

References are available on request.
The Intersection of Religion and Policy: Business and Consumer Response to Competing Institutional Logics

Elizabeth A. Minton, University of Wyoming
Frank Cabano, University of Kansas
Meryl Gardner, University of Delaware
Esi Elliot, Suffolk University
Daniele Mathras, Northeastern University
Naomi Mandel, Arizona State University

Keywords: religion, intersections, freedom of religion, institutional logics, non-discrimination policies

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Religion and government intersect as each of these domains serve as an institutional logic guiding attitudes and behaviors in the marketplace. While religion is considered a taboo topic by many, it has profound influences on public policy, and unfortunately, the intersection of religion, policy, and marketplace outcomes has received very little attention in the literature. Major policies seem to sit in contradiction with one another in providing the separation of church and state (i.e., religious prescriptions should not be brought into the marketplace) but then allowing freedom of religion (i.e., religious prescriptions should be allowed to be followed in all areas of life, inclusive of the marketplace). In this conceptual paper, we review both religious and secular worldviews and their views on marketplace behaviors, identify policies that contradict with a consumer’s freedom of religion, and examine the intersection of religious and governmental institutional logics on marketplace outcomes. Directions for further research and guidance for policy makers are also discussed.

Research Question
1. How can individuals have freedom of religion (as provided in the constitution) but also be required to have non-discrimination in the marketplace?
2. How does policy navigate religious and governmental institutional logics?
3. Also, how does a consumer’s religious views influence their perceptions of public policy and behavior in the marketplace?

Method and Data
NA-based on dialogue from the 2015 TCR conference session on Religion and Policy

Summary of Findings
Although the first amendment dictates the separation of church and state, religion is intimately intertwined with the rights and actions of both businesses and consumers. We argue that it is not possible to have a complete separation of church and state because one’s religious values guide daily life and influence decisions in the marketplace. We propose a model detailing four ways in which religious and governmental logics are intertwined in influencing marketplace behaviors: (1) freedom of expression, (2) corporate benefits, (3) blue laws, and (4) marketplace exclusion.

Key Contributions
Most importantly, religion is brought into the marketing and public policy dialogue. Although religion is a taboo topic by many, we show that it can have profound influences on policy—both existing policy and in the development of new policy. The main purpose of this paper is to start the discussion on how policy can restrict or promote religious freedom but at the same time also restrict or promote discrimination and freedom of access to the marketplace for all consumers.

References are available on request.

For further information contact: Elizabeth A. Minton, University of Wyoming (eminton@uwyo.edu).
Online Accessibility of Retail Websites for Visually Impaired Consumers: Creating a Dialogue for Policy Change

Alex H. Cohen, Drexel University
Jorge E. Fresneda, Drexel University
Rolph E. Anderson, Drexel University

Keywords: online accessibility, disabled, avoidance, Americans with Disabilities Act, complaining

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
It is evident in today’s technologically evolving marketplace that more and more commerce is being transacted online; however, this particular channel poses more challenges for the disabled community due to the inaccessibility of so many retail websites. To obtain perspectives from this population, a sample of blind and vision impaired consumers were used to gauge anti-firm behaviors such as negative word of mouth, avoidance, complaining, and third party complaining following an accessibility-related service failure online, and what negative emotions may mediate these reactions. The moderating effects of effort and whether or not the consumer believes his or her complaint will make a difference were also tested. To illustrate the breadth of this problem of online inaccessibility, we evaluated the top 100 retailers in 2014 (as per the National Federation of Retailers) for their conformance to accepted accessibility standards for online commercial websites. By revealing both the anti-firm reactions of the online consumers directly affected, and the widespread nature of the problem, the objective of the present research is to revitalize the dialogue to amend the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 to include accessibility provisions for retail websites establishing equal access for disabled consumers.

Method and Data
Ninety-four blind and vision impaired participants were recruited for this test study from members of the local chapters of the Foundation Fighting Blindness and the National Federation of the Blind using an electronic snowball sampling technique. The survey was developed using slightly modified versions of literature established scales: Complaint Behavior (Cronbach’s Alpha = .903), Third-Party Complaint Behavior (C.A. = .805), Switching (C.A. = .860), Complaint Success Likelihood (C.A. = .733), Anger (C.A. = 0.960); and Avoidance (C.A. = .910). The “Sort-Site” evaluation tool was used to test the accessibility of each website against the globally accepted World Wide Web Consortium 2.0 Guidelines which designates three levels of design flaws or errors that make it extremely difficult or impossible for someone using assistive technology to navigate websites. To determine the percentage of inaccessible content for the retail websites, we calculated the number of pages with errors out of the total number of pages available. We then tested the number of design flaws or errors on the home page, the transaction page, and on a random selection of the first twenty pages with accessibility problems.

Summary of Findings
The results show that accessibility-related service failures online lead to avoidance behaviors (mean = 5.08, and this effect is mediated by the negative emotion of anger (p-value = .000). Additionally, accessibility-related service failures online lead to negative word of mouth (mean = 4.74), and this effect is mediated by anger toward the retailer (p-value = .003). The preliminary analysis indicates that accessibility-related service failures online will not lead to third-party complaining (mean = 3.27). These pretest results show that the effect is moderated by consumer feelings (likelihood) about whether the complaint will resolve the prob-
lem for avoidance (\(p\)-value = .021) and negative word of mouth (\(p\)-value = .016), but not for third party complaining (\(p\)-value = .554). Testing the correlation between the likelihood of a consumer complaining directly to the retailer and the feelings about whether the complaint will resolve the problem, we found a positive but not large correlation (\(r = .287\)) between these two variables. Finally, we found that the mean for the high effort condition (mean = 5.26) is larger compared to the low effort condition (mean = 4.9), and a paired t-test for a difference in means between the two conditions was highly significant (\(p\)-value = 0.0003).

The evaluation of the retail websites showed many critical priority A and AA errors, and these errors appeared throughout the entirety of all retailer websites. There were no websites free from critical priority A and AA errors. However, critically important to this research, many errors appeared on the most heavily trafficked pages including the homepage, and the transaction page.

**Key Contributions**

In today’s multichannel online and off-line retailing environments, sellers cannot afford to have any of their channels inaccessible to any potential market. By elucidating a problem affecting an expanding market of more than 30 million U.S. consumers, our research suggests a potential competitive opportunity exists for multi-channel sellers to better serve the oftentimes underserved blind and vision-impaired consumers. Whether due to low switching costs or feelings that their complaints will not remedy the situation, our pretest results show that disabled customers who experience an accessibility-related service failure online are unlikely to report the problem to the retailer. As ever more shopping is transacted online combined with the growing disabled population, businesses can benefit by making sure that blind and vision-impaired consumers are able to successfully navigate their websites and complete transactions. Our research findings demonstrate that manifest problems exist with many commercial websites, and that a large, growing consumer segment is adversely affected leading to lost profits. We hope these preliminary findings provoke further discussion about the competitive advantages for progressive retailers in taking the initiative to create more inclusive websites for this underserved market prior to the consideration of an amendment to the Americans with Disabilities Act.

*References are available on request.*
The Stigma Turbine: Generating Policy Prescriptions for (De)Stigmatization in the Marketplace

Jane E. Machin, Radford University
Natalie Ross Adkins, Drake University
Ann M. Mirabito, Baylor University
Cele C. Otnes, University of Illinois at Urbana–Champaign
Elizabeth Crosby, University of Wisconsin–La Crosse
David B. Wooten, University of Michigan
Chris Pullig, Baylor University
Kevin D. Thomas, University of Texas
Marie A. Yeh, Loyola University Maryland
Cassandra Davis, University of Arkansas
Susan Dunnett, University of Edinburgh
Johanna F. Gollnhofer, University of St. Gallen
Aditi Grover, Oklahoma State University
Kathy Hamilton, University of Strathclyde
Jess Matias, University of Texas
Natalie A. Mitchell, Tulane University
Edna G. Ndichu, University of Wyoming
Nada Sayarh, University of Geneva
Sunaina Velagaleti, University of Wisconsin–Madison

Keywords: stigma, stigmatization, marketplace, stereotypes, intersectionality, policy

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
This research focuses on two main questions: (1) what roles do markets and commercial-sphere stakeholders play in the (de)stigmatization process; and (2) can an increased understanding of these roles ignite positive change in the lives of consumers and society-at-large? Extensive research across disciplines focuses on how marginalized individuals and social groups cope with stigma’s negative consequences. Less understood, however, is the complex relationship between stigma and the marketplace. Stigmatization does not occur in isolation. In fact, marketplace actors often contribute to the creation and perpetuation of stigma and, furthermore, marketplace stigma can wield painful consequences for the stigmatized. Specifically, through this...
research we seek to (1) conceptualize marketplace stigma and demonstrate how it emerges and operates while embedded within a broader sociocultural and historical milieu; (2) reveal the critical role markets and market stakeholders play in (de)stigmatization and (3) generate potential avenues for commercial-sphere actors, including marketing professionals and public policy makers, to foster change in the lives of consumers and enhance the overall quality of society.

Summary of Findings
First, we unpack the concept of marketplace stigma, that is, the processes through which commercial-sphere stakeholders and offerings are labeled, stereotyped, and devalued through marketplace interactions. Next, we propose a conceptual framework, the Stigma Turbine, to systematically examine the key factors impacting the experienced stigma. This framework illuminates the intersectionality, dynamism, bi-directionality, and power of stigmas. We identify historical, cultural and spatial currents that influence how, when and where stigmas emerge. We elaborate on the under-researched marketplace “blade” of the Stigma Turbine to highlight the vital role marketplace actors often play in creating, perpetuating and resisting stigma. We conclude by identifying a number of marketing and public policy prescriptions and research opportunities that arise from a deeper understanding and resolution of stigma at the intersection of the sociocommercial sphere.

Key Contributions
The Stigma Turbine conceptual framework places marketplace stigma within a broader sociocultural context and encapsulates both the stigmatization and destigmatization processes. This framework clarifies the relationship between the experienced stigma and the exacerbating and blunting forces shaped by the sociocultural and historical milieu. By specifically examining the various actors and activities situated in the marketplace “blade” of the Stigma Turbine, we reveal the critical role markets and marketplace stakeholders play in (de)stigmatization efforts. Not only does this systematic approach to examine the components of the experienced stigma generate compelling research questions, it also highlights dilemmas that various marketplace actors encounter when value-maximizing activities are at odds with destigmatization ideals. This research provides a platform to explore the potential of marketing and public policy initiatives that aim to foster change in the daily lives of consumers.

References are available on request.
Developing Political Will and Public Will for Equal Pay Around a Common Frame

Amber N.W. Raile, Montana State University
Virginia K. Bratton, Montana State University
Caroline Graham Austin, Montana State University

Keywords: framing, pay, equity, gender, sentiment

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
Do different phrases describing gender pay equity vary in perceived acceptability?

Method and Data
A two-phased approach was used to answer the research question. In phase one, the researchers conducted an extensive search of literatures in communication, marketing, management, psychology, sociology and economics, as well as the popular press, to identify common terminology to discuss pay and pay equity in the workplace. Terms were determined to belong to one of four general framing categories—neutral, moderate, gendered, or incendiary. In phase two, the researchers conducted a survey to measure sentiment reactions to these phrases. Survey respondents (N = 406) were registered users of Amazon’s Mechanical Turk. Pay terms from all four frames were included in the survey to generate a range of responses. In addition to the pay-related terms and phrases, the researchers included demographic measures (gender, age, education, employment and marital status, ethnicity, number of children, household income, and political affiliation). Participants were randomly presented with ten terms out of the possible 26 (for each term, n = 141 to 184). Participants read terms one at a time and rated each in terms of discussing employee pay, on a scale of 0 (“strongly negative,” “unreasonable and destructive”) to 100 (“strongly positive,” “reasonable and constructive”).

Summary of Findings
In general, respondents viewed phrases containing the words transparency, fair, fairness, and equity most favorably. All three neutral frame phrases using the term transparency (i.e., “full salary transparency” M = 73.16, “pay transparency” M = 72.03, and “salary transparency” M = 69.08) were among the top third of rated phrases. The highest ranked phrases come from the moderate frame, using positively oriented terminology: “fair pay” (M = 82.21), “equal pay” (M = 81.58), and “pay fairness” (M = 78.53). Moderate frame phrases with a negative orientation, such as “pay gap,” (M = 36.73), “pay discrimination” (M = 29.35), and “wage penalty” (M = 32.89) were rated lower than other phrases in the moderate frame. The gendered frame did not have many positively perceived phrases, with the exception of “gender fair pay” (M = 74.95) and “gender pay equity” (M = 69.82), both of which include terms that are rated positively across phrases.

Comparisons of ratings across demographic variables yielded some differences but not as many as one might expect. Thus, consideration of demographic data provides limited, but useful insight into which phrases might provide an acceptable frame around which to build a public will campaign.

Key Contributions
This study was guided by the overarching framework identifying political will and public will (Post et al., 2010; Raile et al., 2014) as tools to implement policy in response to social problems. Because policy efforts have not been effective in eliminating the gender pay disparity in the United States, the framework suggests that public will to address the issue might be lacking. Since addressing complex social problems starts with developing a common understanding of the problem among decision makers, a lack of shared understanding and problem recognition may be preventing the
implementation of programs and policies aimed at pay equity.

This study’s results provide a first step in identifying phrases with positive associations for public stakeholders, and can guide strategic use of preferred phrases to use when discussing gender and pay (i.e., transparency, fair, fairness, and equity). By strategically adopting terminology that a majority of stakeholders perceive to honest and helpful, businesses, policy makers, and members of the public can effectively utilize the PPW framework to generate constructive solutions. One highly encouraging finding is that such conversations seem to be possible, provided that the participants use language that frames the issue in an honest, positive way.

References are available on request.
Pigovian taxes are used to respond to negative externalities in the commercial world: firms that pollute are taxed to help pay the costs of the damage they do to their community. For example, in 2010, New York City Mayor Michael Bloomberg proposed a penny-per-ounce tax on soda (Sulzberger 2010). That policy falls under the category of a “Pigovian tax,” (Pigou 1920/2009); it would have allowed the city to collect money from individuals who were engaging in obesity-promoting behaviors (drinking large sugary drinks), presumably to offset the costs that obesity creates for the city as a whole. The tax would thus reduce the costs that the general population had to bear due to the consumption choices of a subset of consumers.

Proponents of Pigovian taxes argue that taxing sugary drinks is inherently fair, since such charges redistribute the costs (the negative externalities) of obesity to the actors more likely to create the costs. However, Bloomberg’s tax was met with a staunch opposition, well beyond that typically observed when other price changes are proposed. In fact, the State of Mississippi passed the “Anti-Bloomberg Bill” preventing the regulation of portion sizes by counties, cities or districts in the state (Yan 2013). Such strong responses are not restricted to soda taxes; Pigovian taxes tend to be nearly universally-disliked when first introduced (Lorenzi, Zhang and Friedmann 2010). This research explores why consumers react as they do to Pigovian taxes.

We propose that consumers’ reactions to Pigovian communications and interventions depend on their perceptions of the negative externalities related to the focal behavior. Through survey fieldwork, we show three things: First, individuals who perceive higher negative externalities see the costs of a given behavior as greater than their low negative externality counterparts. Second, individuals who view negative externalities as more severe respond more positively to information about Pigovian taxes that emphasizes a given behavior’s costs. Third, interventions that reallocate costs from society to the individual actor (i.e., Pigovian taxes) is evaluated more positively by consumers who tend to perceive greater negative externalities from a behavior.

A two phased survey with 197 Amazon Mechanical Turk workers (54.5% male, mean age = 36.8) was conducted. Survey results showed that consumers’ perceptions of negative externalities lead to systematic biases in their attitude toward and comprehension of communications about the costs of others’ behaviors. Additionally, perceptions of negative externalities predict responses to such communications beyond effects of political preferences, health locus of control differences, and the personal relevance of the tax, as captured in BMI and personal usage. We also found evidence that in the aggregate, a Pigovian strategy is generally evaluated similarly to distributing externalities to all consumers and to restricting access to products which lead to negative externalities—both measures which could be seen as either patently unfair by “punishing” all choices or draconian by eliminating choice. Most critical for the present research our results suggest that reactions to Pigovian interventions are a function of perceived negative externalities.
and that capturing perceptions of negative externalities provides a substantial amount of power beyond other demographic and psychographic characteristics of consumers.

This research takes the first step toward understanding the factors that drive consumers’ rejection or acceptance of Pigovian interventions and related communications. In so doing, we make three main contributions. First, in contrast to past work in economics, we conceptualize negative externalities as a perceptual rather than objective quantity. Second, we present a simple self-report measure that captures individuals’ perceptions of negative externalities, showing that it consistently predicts attitudes across multiple domains. Third, we find that at least in some contexts, individuals who perceive high negative externalities are more persuaded by marketing communications framed in terms of the costs that a given behavior creates for society than are individuals who do not perceive negative externalities.

References
Vulnerability in Consumer Contracts: Mandatory Arbitration and Policies for Improvement

Cliff Scott, University of Arkansas Fort Smith
Elise Riker, University of Arkansas Fort Smith

Keywords: vulnerability, contracts, mandatory arbitration

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
How can mandatory arbitration be improved via public policy or other changes to mitigate its negative impact on consumer vulnerability?

Recent years have seen a proliferation of binding mandatory arbitration (MA) clauses in consumer contracts. The majority of U.S. adults have agreed to MA as part of a consumer contract, as these clauses are standard in cell phone contracts, health insurance, brokerage accounts, credit cards, and home building contracts. This MA clause mandates that any consumer disputes with the business are settled via arbitration; a system whereby a third-party arbitrator conducts a hearing in lieu of court action to determine the outcome of the dispute.

MA is widespread, poorly understood by consumers and often powerful in its outcomes—a combination resulting in pervasive consumer vulnerability across social classes and income ranges. Furthermore, MA clauses appear more frequently in consumer contracts than in business-to-business contracts. Our research tracks the precedents of MA, explores how MA impacts consumer vulnerability, and proposes policy changes in the way that the law views consumer contracts.

Summary of Findings
Historically, Mandatory Arbitration (MA) was applied to B-to-B relationships, while MA was not acceptable in B-to-C relationships due to the power disparity between the parties. However, by the 1980s, B-to-C arbitration became acceptable and enforceable due to the U.S. Supreme Court’s interpretation of the Federal Arbitration Act. We argue that this policy is a signal that consumers’ vulnerability and disadvantage in adhesion contracts is secondary to benefits of increased efficiency and corporate advantages created by MA.

The process by which consumers normally agree to mandatory arbitration (buried in the fine print; written in language often incomprehensible to consumers; no opportunity for negotiation; almost unavoidable in the modern-day U.S.) fosters consumer vulnerability. Furthermore, MA sacrifices many of the legal system’s normal protections. Specifically, arbitrator’s rulings are not subject to review by any entity, and the arbitration clauses commonly stipulate that the firm will select, hire and pay the arbitrators, with the consumer having no input setting up a conflict-of-interest situation.

Arbitration has its place in post-purchase dispute resolution; however, forcing consumers to pre-forgo their rights and accept unshielded vulnerability in the marketplace post-purchase is not a practice that leads to a better society.

Key Contributions
Public policy changes can be engineered to lessen consumer’s vulnerability in contracts; we present three alternatives. First, the arbitration clause can be viewed in the same way as an extended warranty or service agreement clause. By requiring consumers to decide on arbitration as a separate part of the contract, companies enable consumer choice and lessen vulnerability. Because arbitration does provide the opportunity for fair and efficient dispute resolution, it remains an attractive option for consumers.

For further information contact: Cliff Scott, Professor of Marketing, University of Arkansas Fort Smith (Cliff.Scott@uafs.edu).
Secondly, we recommend increased self-regulation by arbitrators and arbitration firms to make publicly available the results of their arbitration cases. With such information widely available, the arbitrators will be responsible for maintaining their reputation with their customers, the businesses, and with other stakeholders as well, in the same manner as any public organization. While individual arbitration decisions will be binding, arbitration firms that consistently favor business over consumers can be held liable.

Finally, we recommend the elimination of mandatory arbitration clauses for services that address already marginalized populations. The inclusion of MA is inconsistent with these organizations’ commitments to consumer well-being and unfair to those under duress. These organizations are obligated to avoid contributing to consumer vulnerability.

References are available on request.
Product Category Names: Selection, Strategy, and Control

Ross D. Petty, Babson College

Keywords: product category names, domain names, trademarks, advertising regulation

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Questions
How may brand marketers exert some control over what rivals may use product category names and what public policies limit the ability for marketers to exert such control? In particular, new generic top level domain name addresses are becoming available, many in the form of -.PRODUCTCATEGORYNAME. What policies currently constrain the use of such domain names and what policies should be imposed?

Summary of Findings
In addition to the currently developing new domain name registry system, there have been three other methods for marketers to exercise some control over who can use particular product category names. The first is to register a collective or certification trademark that could be used only by a member of the organization that owns the collective mark or by firm’s whose products satisfy the standards set forth in the certification trademark. The second is to persuade the government to adopt some sort of product identity standard so that products that don’t satisfy the standard cannot use the name. The Food and Drug Administration has done this for many food products. A comparable result can be achieved through advertising law by requesting that a particular product be prohibited from using a particular category name in its advertising because the use is likely to mislead consumers.

The third method is similar and popular in some European countries and asks that the government recognize specific geographic indications and limit their use to products that produce the product in the specific location using traditional recipes and processes. Currently, there is some discussion of extending this program to non-food products in Europe.

Key Contributions
By allowing private companies to open and operate domain name registries for product categories such as-.BOOK, the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN) has not carefully considered public policy implications of this new program. This paper suggests that such a program may restrict category name usage on the internet to reduce the amount of information available to consumers about products and to reduce the level of competition between some products. It proposes that the ICANN consider established public policies from trademark, advertising and to some degree antitrust law in order to prevent its new system from unduly favoring registry operators over their competitors in ways that might mislead or otherwise limit information available to consumers or effectively reduce consumer choice during online shopping.

References available on request.

For further information contact: Ross D. Petty, Professor of Marketing Law and Faculty Scholar, Babson College (e-mail: petty@babson.edu).
Research Question
Recent studies suggest the expanding collection and use of big data by advertisers to target messages to consumers based on their location, demographics and online behaviors is escalating information privacy concerns and negatively impacting campaign outcomes. For marketing scholars and practitioners, this recent attitudinal shift indicates a critical need to better understand consumer perceptions related to personalized advertising in the era of big data. It is currently assumed that self-regulatory initiatives, including the AdChoices Icon, reduce perceived risk by giving consumers a greater sense of control over the exchange of their personal information online. However, only 6% of Internet users are familiar with the AdChoices Icon (Way 2013), and 52% incorrectly believe that privacy policies ensure the confidentiality of their personal information (Pew 2014). Thus, the present study seeks to examine how knowledge of the AdChoices Icon interacts with message personalization and the presence of the AdChoices Icon in determining attitude toward the ad, after controlling for perceived online trust, message credibility, and perceived risks and benefits.

Method and Data
Based on a theoretical perspective of the Persuasion Knowledge Model (PKM), the present study utilized a 2 (personalized/non-personalized ad) x 2 (AdChoices Icon inclusion/exclusion) x 2 (knowledge of Icon/no knowledge) between subjects experiment. Participants (N = 382) were randomly presented with a fictional Yahoo home page containing a standard leaderboard banner advertisement with one of the following four manipulations embedded: personalized or non-personalized advertisement, with or without the AdChoices Icon. The third experimental manipulation (knowledge of the AdChoices Icon) was created by asking participants what they knew (if anything) about the AdChoices Icon; and then assigning them to either the “knowledge” or “no knowledge” condition based on their response. Ad personalization was based on each participant’s location and gender, which was customized by asking respondents to report their demographic information prior to exposure, and subsequently presenting the personally appropriate ad based on a randomized condition assignment.

After exposure, participants completed a questionnaire to assess perceived risk and benefits of sharing personal information online, message credibility, trust and reported attitudes about the ad presented to them.

Summary of Findings
A Univariate GLM analysis of the data indicate that when controlling for online trust, message credibility, and perceived risks and benefits, ad personalization did not have a significant effect on attitude toward the ad, but inclusion of the AdChoices Icon did. Further, respondents indicating no knowledge of the Icon reported lower attitudinal responses toward the ad compared to those who were knowledgeable of its meaning.

Although the results of this study only supported the hypothesized relationship between the presence of the AdChoices Icon and attitudinal responses, it highlights the importance of self-regulatory initiatives in addressing consumer concerns about personalized advertising in the era of big data.
Icon and attitude toward the ad, an examination of respondents’ knowledge about the AdChoices Icon provides additional insight. Here, data suggest that inclusion of the Icon in personalized ads could increase attitudes toward the ad as long as the recipient is knowledgeable of the Icon’s meaning. These findings are consistent with PKM’s premise that consumers use three separate knowledge bases in evaluating persuasive advertising messages: topic, agent and persuasion knowledge. That is, when they perceive the topic to be relevant (i.e., personally targeted to them), and the agent trustworthy (by declaring use of their personal data via the AdChoices Icon), consumers are more likely to overlook their persuasion knowledge schema and be receptive to the advertisers’ personalized message.

**Key Contributions**
Exploring these complex relationships offers to advance research and practice by extending the PKM to examine the effects of personalized online message delivery, as well as offering practitioners actionable insights to improve their personalized advertising outcomes. Findings from this study support the existence of the Privacy Paradox, which predicts that consumers will minimize perceived risks in situations when the perceived benefits are considered of greater value than the risks associated with disclosing personal information. Moreover, it confirms that awareness of data collection and aggregation practices as conveyed by the AdChoices Icon are not well understood among the general population, and thus, reaction to it, regardless of the advertising attribute manipulated, is varied. Even when notified about first and third party data collection via the AdChoices Icon, it seems respondents did not fully comprehend the potential risks associated with this practice, and thus, may not have responded appropriately. This finding suggests the need for a more robust policy approach by the FTC related to consumer education about current data collection practices, as well as increased transparency, consumer choice and accountability from advertisers and publishers. A proposed policy recommendation addressing these concerns is presented in conjunction with this study.

*References are available on request.*
License to Indulge: Contextual Determinants of Unhealthy Food Choices in Consumption Settings

Kimberlee Weaver, Virginia Tech
YK Lee, York College CUNY
Stephen Garcia, University of Michigan

ABSTRACT
Three studies examined whether the format of a menu in a restaurant—combination meal versus a la carte choice—affects the probability that consumers will make unhealthy food choices. Consumers were more likely to make double indulgent choices, the choice of both an indulgent entrée and an indulgent side item, when choosing from a menu consisting of predetermined combo meals than when selecting among the same entrée and side options in an a la carte fashion. Studies 2 and 3 implicated a goal distraction mechanism in driving the effect; the combo meal format, with its cross cutting of menu items into various combinations, reduces the salience of both healthy and indulgence goals on implicit measures. In showing that different menu formats can affect the degree to which consumers choose healthy versus unhealthy food options, the current work adds to work on the effects of environmental influences on consumers’ eating behavior.

Keywords: consumer psychology, food marketing

Whether at a sit-down or fast-food restaurant, the menu items often include “meal” or combination choices. For instance, at McDonald’s, there are a number of “value meals” from which one can choose. While these meals and combination plates make it easier for consumers to choose by predetermining what pairs together well, does this choice among “meals” make it more likely that consumers will indulge in unhealthy food items compared to a situation in which consumers makes a series of choices between the same options one-at-a-time, using an “a la carte” decision making process? For example, would someone be more likely to order a combo meal that included a cheeseburger and fries if the person is making a choice among “meals” than if they had to choose a kind of sandwich first and then a pairing side next? In the current analysis, we argue that consumers become distracted from their goals when choosing among a large number of options in which there are varying and intersecting attributes. In contrast, when the decision is simplified through sequential choices on key attributes, then people are better able to adhere to their goals. Thus, in the consumer context of food, we posit that the way that food options are presented on the menu—as “meals” versus as “a la carte” choices—will also differentially impact consumers’ consumption of healthy versus indulgent items.

Across three studies, the current findings offer support for this goal distraction account by showing that consumers are more likely to make double indulgent choices—a choice of both an indulgent entrée and an indulgent side—when the identical selections are presented in an a la carte choice format. We also begin to explore the mechanism underlying this effect and show both that the effect is stronger for consumers who have weight management goals than for those who do not and that the meal condition reduces the salience of eating goals—both healthy and indulgence—on implicit measures. In so doing, the present analysis extends literature on consumers’ consumption decisions by investigating how a ubiquitous but relatively understudied contextual factor in the consumer behavior literature—how a choice from a large number of options

For further information contact: Kimberlee Weaver, Virginia Tech (kdweaver@vt.edu).
with overlapping attributes versus the same decision in a simplified sequential choice format affects consumers’ ability to pursue their goals.

**Theoretical Background**

**Goal Distraction: When Too Many Options Undermine Goal Pursuit**

Making a simple choice can sometimes be easy and sometimes difficult. Easier choices might include whether you prefer a pen with black or blue ink, or red or white wine. However, even these rather simple choices can become slightly more difficult to make as the complexity of the option and the number of options is increased. For example, now consider the following: Would you prefer a black ballpoint pen, black inktip pen, a blue ballpoint pen, or blue inktip pen? Red merlot wine, red cabernet wine, white Riesling wine, or white sauvignon blanc wine? The two latter decisions are arguably less easy to make than the two former. In the backdrop of this more difficult decision context, we aim to build the hypothesis that pursuing one’s presumed goals will also become more difficult to pursue.

Several literatures can help to build this goal distraction account, and the literature on choice overload is a good place to start. In one classic study, jams were set up for tasting at an upscale supermarket in Menlo Park, California. In one condition, there were only six varieties of jam offered for tasting and subsequent purchasing; in another condition, there were 24 varieties of jam. Results showed that, while shoppers were more willing to sample taste the jams when there were 24 versus six, they were more likely to purchase a jam when there were only six versus 24 jams available (Iyengar & Lepper, 2000). As the authors described, consumers were less likely to purchase a jam when 24 varieties were available because the large size of the choice set was overwhelming. In addition, we might be able to infer that people were additionally distracted from a presumed goal of buying their favorite jam. A follow-up study in this vein makes the link between goal pursuit and choice set size more directly. Obviously, workers in corporate America, especially those working for companies with 401k programs, know that saving for retirement is important. In other words, saving for retirement is an important goal. However, results from another study on choice overload found that employee participation in 401k retirement programs decreased as the number of investment options increased (Iyengar, Huberman, & Jiang, 2004). In both these cases, the sheer number of options in a choice set undermined people’s ability to accomplish the ostensible goal at stake (e.g., choosing an investment strategy; Broniarczyk & Griffin, 2014).

Just as the literature on choice overload suggests that the number of options can undermine goal pursuit, the literature on brand confusion points to a similar phenomenon (Huffman & Kahn, 1998; Mitchell, Walsh, & Yamin, 2005; Foxman, Berger, & Cote, 1992). This work shows that as the number of brands to choose from increases, people become less able to choose their favorite brand. For example, in one study (Jacoby, Speller, & Kohn, 1974), participants were first asked a series of questions about the attributes that would constitute the “ideal” laundry detergent, thus establishing an ideographic standard of an “ideal” detergent for each participant. Participants were then subsequently asked to select a laundry detergent for purchase from a choice set of 4, 8, or 12 brands (i.e., brand a, brand b, etc.) in which the number of pieces of information about each brand was also manipulated. Results showed that participants became increasingly less able to choose their “ideal” brand as the number of options increased.

Interestingly, recent work shows that confusion can even happen at the perceptual level when there are too many options. For instance, work on the product-agnosia effect (Jia, Shiv, & Rao, 2014) shows that too many pictures of products can confuse consumers’ perceptions and attenuate the distinctiveness of the products. In one study on sun-

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Condition</th>
<th>Double Indulgent</th>
<th>Indulgent/Healthy*</th>
<th>Healthy/Indulgent**</th>
<th>Double Healthy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Study 1 (Hamburger, N = 121)</td>
<td>Meal</td>
<td>60.66</td>
<td>14.75</td>
<td>8.20</td>
<td>16.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study 2 (Waffle, N = 200)</td>
<td>A la carte</td>
<td>38.33</td>
<td>38.33</td>
<td>11.67</td>
<td>11.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study 3 (Waffle, N = 110)</td>
<td>A la carte</td>
<td>31.31</td>
<td>23.23</td>
<td>22.22</td>
<td>23.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Meal</td>
<td>29.33</td>
<td>23.23</td>
<td>22.22</td>
<td>23.23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Indulgent/Healthy signifies the choice of a healthy main dish and an indulgent side item or topping
**Healthy/Indulgent signifies the choice of an indulgent main dish and a healthy side item or topping
glasses, for example, researchers varied whether consumers saw two photos of sunglasses or multiple photos of sunglasses from different angles. Results showed that participants were more likely to defer their choice and perceived more similarity between the sunglasses in the multiple photos condition.

**Minimizing Goal Distraction: Simplify the Choice by Sequential Decisions**

While choosing from a large choice set of options can foster goal distraction, then simplifying the choice through sequential decision-making should minimize goal distraction. This possibility is especially interesting because it predicts a different effect for goals even though all possible combinations that are present in the large choice set of options are also present in the simplified sequential decision process. Indeed, previous work on mass customization (Huffman & Kahn, 1998) supports this possibility. In mass customization contexts, people can design their own product (i.e., sofa). However, researchers found that the sheer number of possibilities and combinations among them can create confusion and undermine customer satisfaction when customers are deciding on their ideal product when they have to choose every single attribute without any structure. In contrast, when the decision is simplified by sequentially asking customers about their key attributes and preferences within them, then this simplified decision contexts leads to less confusion and higher customer satisfaction. Although not looking at adherence to or distraction from goals per se, this work is suggestive in that it highlights that the sequential choice format allows consumers to focus their attention spotlight more on what is important in the choice set.

Another consequence of simplifying the choice through sequential decision-making is that the choice inherently becomes starker. For example, although consumers seeing indulgent desserts rate them as higher than those seeing healthy alternatives, consumers actually tend to choose the healthy alternative when it is presented in a choice set, side-by-side with indulgent dessert options. Thus, the stark choice set simplifies the decision (Okada, 2005), and, in this case, promotes the pursuit of the implicit healthy eating goal. Work by Sela, Berger, and Liu (2009) also gives credence to the possibility that a simplified decision can promote goal pursuit. They found that 55% of people chose a fruit (healthy item) over a cookie (indulgent item) when one option of each was presented. However, 76% chose a fruit when six fruits and six cookies were presented. In this latter case, the difference between the healthy versus indulgent items is made even more salient, and people become more likely to choose the healthy items in accord with their implicit health goals. Thus, to extrapolate past work onto the current question of interest, relative to a large choice set of options with intersecting attributes, simplified sequential choices along key attributes should facilitate the pursuit of healthy eating goals.

Synthesizing this goal distraction account based on the literature reviewed above, we thus posit the following hypotheses:

Hypothesis 1: Consumers will be less likely to make choices consistent with their goals when choosing from a large number of options that intersect underlying attributes, compared to situations when consumers are making simplified sequential decisions.

Because people who personally hold eating goals will be more susceptible to the goal distraction effects, we predicted that the effect would be more pronounced for those with healthy eating goals than for those without.

Hypothesis 2: Implicating the mechanism of this goal distraction account, we predict that goals are a necessary pre-condition to observe differences between the choices made from options comprised of intersecting attributes options versus choices from simplified sequential options.

Because healthy eating is such an important issue in society, we aim to test these hypotheses in the context of food selection by examining the extent to which consumers ultimately select indulgent versus healthy food items. We focus explicitly on decisions of a main dish (healthy versus indulgent) and side dish (healthy versus indulgent). Specifically, we compared what consumers chose when presented with a choice of meals whose options represented all possible combinations (i.e., healthy main / healthy side dish, indulgent main / indulgent side dish, healthy main / indulgent side, indulgent main / healthy side) to what consumers choose when presented with those same options in a simplified sequential “a la carte” decision format (i.e., healthy or indulgent main dish, healthy or indulgent side). Of course, the compelling feature of this design is that all possible combination of options in the choice of meals are present in the sequential “a la carte” choices. Our main prediction was that consumers would choose more indulgent options in the meal condition than in the starker and more simplified a la carte format (Hypothesis 1) and that the difference between the two formats would be more pronounced for people who actually held active weight management goals (Hypothesis 2).

**Overview: The Present Research**

Three studies were conducted to test these hypotheses. All used two-item combinations—a main dish plus an auxiliary item like a side dish or topping. The main dependent variable of interest was consumers’ choices of double-indulgent
options—that is, cases where a consumer chooses both an indulgent main dish and an indulgent auxiliary item—because double indulgent choices are the most consequentially harmful to people’s overall health and wellbeing. Study 1 examined the prediction in a lunchtime context with a hamburger / veggie burger main dish and a salad versus French fries side. Study 2 conceptually replicated the effect and implicated the goal distraction account of the mechanism by examining whether goals are a necessary precondition for the effect. Finally, Study 3 captured the underlying process behind the effect and suggested that, consistent with the goal distraction account, the meal presentation context distracts people from their eating goals as shown on an implicit measure. Overall these results suggest that people make more unhealthy choices when selecting from a menu that presents options as “meals” or combination choices than from a menu that presents the same choices in an a la carte fashion.

Study 1: The Hamburger Study
Participants chose one burger and one side item from either a menu consisting of predetermined “combo meals” or a menu where the same main dishes and sides were presented as two separate a la carte decisions. The key dependent variable was the frequency with which participants made a double indulgent choice, that is, a choice of both an indulgent main dish and an indulgent side.

Participants. One hundred and twenty-one adult participants ($M_{age} = 30$ years, 46% female) were recruited from the online panel MTurk.

Participants imagined they were shopping for lunch at a local restaurant and were looking at the menu where they could select a burger and side item combination. Four burgers were used as stimuli. Two were healthy (a veggie burger and a black bean burger) and two were indulgent (a bacon cheese burger and a BBQ burger). In addition, two side items were available a salad (the healthy item) and French fries (the indulgent item). All stimuli were presented pictorially.

Meal versus A La Carte Presentation. In the meal condition, the burgers and side items were combined and shown together as a series of eight predetermined combinations on one menu. Thus, participants selected one meal among the eight possible meal combination options. In the a la carte choice condition, participants first saw a burger menu and chose one of the four possible burgers and then saw a side menu where they chose one side item from the two options presented.

Dependent Measures. In addition to choice, the following control variables were also measured: participants’ satisfaction with their selection; the degree to which they thought their selection was healthy or not; how often participants ate that type of item; and how much they liked the option they chose (1= not at all, 7 = very).

Results and Discussion. The key dependent variable was the percent of people making an indulgent choice for both the burger and topping choices. This double indulgent choice (i.e., indulgent waffle and indulgent topping) was coded as a “1” and all other possibilities were coded as a “0.” A logistic regression model showed, as predicted, participants presented with the options in the meal menu format made more indulgent choices than those presented with the identical food items in the a la carte menu format. Specifically, 60.66% of the participants selected an indulgent burger and an indulgent side item when the identical food options were presented in an a la carte format, ($\chi^2 = 5.93, p < 0.02$), this effect remained significant when controlling for the control variables. Table 1 presents the percentage choosing each of the possible combinations.

While Study 1 provides initial support for Hypothesis 1 that presenting options in a combination “meal” format can present a distraction from health goals and lead people to choose more indulgent food items than presenting the same options in an a la carte menu format, we did not actually measure weight or health goals. Instead, Study 1 only presumes that health goals are commonly held among a majority of people in our sample. Study 2 measures the health goals more explicitly.

Study 2: Implicating the Goal Distraction Account
Study 2 sought to conceptually replicate the effect in a different food context and simultaneously implicate the postulated goal distraction account of the mechanism. To do so, Study 2 probed for individual differences in healthy eating goals (e.g., Dhar & Simonson, 1999; Fishbach & Zhang, 2008; Wilcox et al., 2009). If the goal distraction account aptly captures the effect, one would expect that consumers who personally hold weight management goals will be more affected by the meal presentation format relative to the a la carte format. On the other hand, for consumers who do not hold weight management goals, we predicted that the effect of meal presentation would be small, if existent at all.

Participants. Two hundred adult participants ($M_{age} = 34$ years, 43% female) were recruited from the online panel MTurk. Study 2 used the same procedure as Study 1 but used a waffle and topping combination rather than a burger and
side combination. Two waffles—one healthy (a Belgian nine-grain healthy waffle) and one indulgent (a classic Belgian waffle)—were used as the main dishes. In addition, four toppings—two healthy (fresh strawberries and low-fat butter) and two indulgent (chocolate spread and strawberries in whipped cream and syrup)—were used as toppings. All stimuli were presented pictorially. In the meal condition, the eight possible combinations were presented on one page. In the a la carte menu condition, participants selected one of the two waffles first, then selected one among the four possible toppings.

In addition, participants rated how concerned they were with managing their weight on a 7-point scale (1 = Not at all concerned, 7 = Very concerned).

**Results and Discussion**

The key dependent variable was the percent of people making an indulgent choice for both the waffle and topping choices. This double indulgent choice (i.e., indulgent waffle and indulgent topping) was coded as a “1” and all other possibilities were coded as a “0.” A logistic regression using the menu presentation format (meal vs. a la carte) as a between subjects factor and the measured weight-consciousness variable (mean-centered) as a continuous factor revealed significant effects of menu presentation ($\chi^2 = 3.81, p = 0.05$) and weight-consciousness ($\chi^2 = 9.13, p < 0.003$). As predicted, and consistent with Study 1, a greater percent of participants selected a double indulgent combination when the menu presented the options in a combination “meal” format (31.31%) compared to when the menu presented the same options in an a la carte format (23.76%). However, these effects were qualified by the predicted interaction between the menu presentation variable and participants’ dispositional level of weight-consciousness ($\chi^2 = 6.01, p < 0.02$).

As predicted, a spotlight analysis based on a fitted logistic regression model showed that the difference between the two menu presentation formats was significant only for participants who held weight management goals. High weight conscious consumers were more likely to choose a double indulgent combination when the menu presented the options in the form of combination “meals” ($\text{Probability}_{\text{meal}} = 0.29$) than when a similar menu presented the same options as choices in an “a la carte” format ($\text{Probability}_{\text{a la carte}} = 0.08$), $\beta = -1.54, Z = -2.78, p < 0.006$. In contrast, among those who were less personally concerned with managing their weight, the propensity to choose an indulgent/indulgent combination was not affected by the menu presentation format ($\text{Probability}_{\text{meal}} = 0.34$ vs. $\text{Probability}_{\text{a la carte}} = 0.36; \beta = 0.12, Z = 0.29, p > 0.75$). Table 1 presents the percent of consumers choosing each of the four possible combinations of main dish and.

Consistent with Hypothesis 2, the pattern of these results provides initial evidence in support of the goal distraction account: weight management goals become distracted in the meal condition relative to the a la carte condition but only among those who hold such goals. In contrast, people who do not hold weight management goals are unaffected by the menu presentation format.

**Study 3: Implicit Measurement of Goal Distraction**

Study 3 examined the proposed goal distraction account of the mechanism more directly by measuring participants’ reaction times to health-related versus indulgence-related words after seeing either a combination meal or an a la carte menu. If, as we argued earlier, the cross-cutting of healthy and indulgent items into multiple combinations leads to goal distraction, then health and indulgence goals in the meal menu condition should be less cognitively accessible than in the a la carte menu condition.

Participants first were asked to peruse a menu and think of a waffle and a topping that they wanted to buy. Half of the participants saw the combinations in a “meal” format and the other half saw the same selections in an a la carte format. After looking over their respective menus, they were told that the next task was an attentional task where they would be asked to identify whether a given string of letters was either a word or not a word as quickly and accurately as possible. The key dependent variable was participants’ response times to the health-related and indulgence-related words. The main prediction was that the “meal” format would distract participants from their goals, reducing the salience of the indulgence / health tradeoff in consumers’ minds. If so, then consumers’ response times to identifying the health-related and indulgence-related words in the “meal” condition should be longer (indicating more difficulty in processing) relative to their response times to identifying the same health-related and indulgence-related words in the a la carte condition.

**Participants, Method, and Design.** Seventy-nine undergraduates completed this study for extra credit in their marketing course ($M_{\text{avg}} = 21$ years, 66% female). Participants were told that they would participate in several different tasks. The first task was similar to that of studies 1 and 2; participants considered what combination they would purchase in either a meal or an a la carte format. Following procedures used in Laran (2010, study 4B) and Wilcox, Vallen, Block, and Fitzsimons (2009), participants simply looked over the menu and thought about an option that they wanted to purchase rather than made a choice per se, in order to minimize any carryover effects on the reaction time measures that may
occur from the act of choosing in and of itself (see Laran, 2010 study 4B and Wilcox et al., 2009 for similar procedures). To examine what was on consumers’ minds when they saw the menu and were about the make their choices—that is, what constructs were accessible at the time of the selection—completed a reaction time task where they identified whether a letter string was a word or not. Participants performed several practice trials and then responded to the main task. The 10 indulgence-related and 10 health-related words used by Laran (2010); 10 neutral words (cartoon, spoon, picture, flower, sink, forest, notebook, computer, binder and printer); and 30 non-words were then presented in a random order. Thus, participants responded to 60 trials in total.

Results and Discussion

Pre-Test: Selecting Relevant Words. In order to select healthy and indulgence words that were specific to our study, a separate group of 110 undergraduates saw one of the two menus conditions and rated how much each of the health and indulgence-related words used by Laran (2010) were relevant to the menu that they looked at (1 = Not much at all, 7 = A lot).

The five healthy and five indulgence-related words that pretest participants found to be the most relevant to the menus were selected for the RT task (indulgence-related: delicious, enjoy, pleasure, desire, and good; health-related: fresh, calories, weight, health, and control.

Main Study Reaction Time Results: Goal Activation. Six participants’ data were excluded because they pressed only the “A” key or only the “L” key leaving 73 participants for this analysis. Because the meaning of response latencies to incorrect responses is unclear, participants’ reaction times to words on which they made errors were eliminated. Before analyses, the data was transformed using a natural log transformation to normalize the distribution of responses (Bargh & Chartrand, 2000). Response times were averaged to generate one score for each category of word (health or indulgence-related or control) for each participant. In order to correct for participant baseline reaction time speed, participants’ reaction times to the control words were used as a covariate in the analyses.

Results from a mixed model ANCOVA using menu format (meal vs. a la carte) as a between subjects factor, type of word (health composite versus indulgence composite) as a repeated measure, and response time to identifying the control words as a covariate confirmed our predictions. As predicted, there was a main effect for menu presentation, showing that participants responded more slowly to the eating goal-related words (health and indulgence words) after having seen the “meal” menu than after having seen a menu utilizing the a la carte format, \(F(1,70) = 8.51, p < 0.005\). Follow up planned comparisons showed that this effect was also individually significant for both the health and indulgence-related words (health related words: \(M_{meal} = 601.24\) milliseconds vs. \(M_{a la carte} = 573.68\) milliseconds; \(t(71) = 2.62, p < 0.02;\) indulgence-related words: \(M_{meal} = 593.07\) milliseconds vs. \(M_{a la carte} = 571.72\) milliseconds; \(t(71) = 2.12, p < 0.04\)). A separate analysis looking at the control words only showed that the menu presentation did not differentially affect participants’ response times to words that were unrelated to eating goals (control words: \(M_{meal} = 612.46\) milliseconds vs. \(M_{a la carte} = 623.91\) milliseconds; \(t(71) = .39, p > 0.65\)). Thus, as predicted, both health and indulgence goals were suppressed in the meal menu presentation condition.

These results are consistent with the hypothesis that the “meal” menu presentation format exerts its effect by goal distraction rather than by increasing the accessibility of indulgence-related goals per se. In the meal condition, with its cross-cutting of healthy and indulgent items, the various combinations produce a situation where healthy and indulgent goals are neither here nor there; both goals are inhibited. These process results are thus consistent with the goal distraction hypothesis: the meal menu presentation appears to prevent goals—both health and indulgence—from being activated. As a consequence, rather than making a choice based on eating goals in the meal menu condition, consumers choose the meal that they want, leading them to choose a double indulgent combination at greater rates than when choosing from the same items in an a la carte menu format.

General Discussion

Whereas many fast-food restaurants offer predetermined “value meals” while other restaurants offer design-your-own meals, which presentation model leads to better health outcomes? Across three studies, the current analysis shows that the likelihood of making an indulgent choice (e.g., choosing an indulgent / indulgent combination) increases when individuals choose among culinary options that are presented in a “meal” or combination format compared to when individuals make choices amongst the identical items in an a la carte fashion (Studies 1 and 2). Moreover, consistent with the postulated goal distraction account, this effect occurs more strongly among individuals who hold weight management goals (Study 2) and is associated with goal suppression—participants show lower cognitive accessibility of health goal related words after exploring a menu offering items as “meals” than after seeing the identical items presented in an a la carte format (Study 3). Even more broadly, however, the present analysis shows how choosing from a large number of
options with varying and intersecting key attributes leads to more goal distraction compared making simplified sequential choices along key attributes. The present analysis thus complements previous literature on choice and number of options (e.g., Iyengar and Lepper, 2000) by offering this goal distraction account. Of course, one additional difference between the present analysis and previous research is that all possible combinations remain present in both presentation formats (i.e., meal versus a la carte).

**Theoretical Implications**

By identifying a ubiquitous yet understudied feature of the food context—the format of the restaurant menu itself—that can either facilitate or distract consumers from healthy eating goals and lead to unrestricted, double indulgent food selection decisions, the current research contributes to a burgeoning literature on contextual factors that affect consumers’ food consumption decisions. Specifically, whereas past work has focused on sequential choices (Huber, Goldsmith, & Mogilner, 2008), or on choices between single healthy and indulgent items (Fishbach & Zhang, 2008; Okada, 2005; Sela, Berger, & Liu 2009; Wilcox et al., 2009), and has shown that things like “heart-healthy” claims on the menu (Kozup, Creyer & Burton, 2003), low-fat labels on food packaging (Wansink & Chandon, 2006), and health claims in fast-food branding (i.e., Subway’s sandwich vs. McDonald’s sandwich; Chandon & Wansink, 2007) can increase the likelihood of consuming indulgent foods, the current analysis builds on this work by demonstrating the fact that something as innocuous (and ubiquitous) as ordering procedures can also affect the likelihood of choosing indulgent options. Consumers make better health decisions when they choose food items one by one rather than when they choose them as combinations (e.g., meals), especially when they endorse healthy eating as a personal goal.

**References**


Can Money Tip the Scale? Social Judgment of Overweight Shoppers and the Role of Form of Payment

Carrie Skinner, Florida State University
Martin Mende, Florida State University
Maura L. Scott, Florida State University

Keywords: form of payment, social perception, psychology of money, weight

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
The present research addresses the question of whether a consumer’s form of payment and body weight transect in the formation of social inferences and how these inferences might affect interactions between retail employees and customers.

Method and Data
Three experiments were conducted to investigate the effects of form of payment and BMI of a shopper on judgments made about the shopper making a retail food purchase. Participants were undergraduate students (study 1 and study 2) and members of an online panel (study 3).

Summary of Findings
The studies demonstrate that observers acting as retail employees (study 1 and study 3) or other customers (study 2) make social inferences about a shopper based on the interplay between the shopper’s body weight and method of payment. In study 1, we find that employees are willing to invite an obese customer to join a loyalty club at a higher status level when this customer pays in cash (vs. credit card). In study 2, we show that cash (vs. credit card) payment decreases expected consumption level when the observed shopper is obese. Study 3 replicates this effect for overall attitude assessment and shows more direct support that perceived self-control may be the underlying process mechanism driving the positive assessment of obese shoppers making a cash payment.

Key Contributions
Providing new insights into the social perception of overweight consumers, our research demonstrates that how shoppers pay (i.e., cash vs. credit card) influences how they are perceived by others (consumers and employees) in retail settings. As such, this is the first research to show inter-individual effects of form of payment, a ubiquitous marketing phenomenon that hitherto has been studied with a strong focus on intra-individual effects.

References available on request.

For further information contact: Carrie Skinner, doctoral candidate, College of Business, Florida State University (cms13n@my.fsu.edu).
The Effect of Smileys as Motivational Incentives on Children’s Food Choices: A Field Experiment in European Primary Schools

Wencke Gwozdz, Copenhagen Business School
Lucia A. Reisch, Copenhagen Business School
Marge Eha, University of Tartu
Gabriele Eiben, University of Gothenburg
Monica Hunsberger, University of Gothenburg
Kenn Konstabel, University of Tartu
Eva Kovacs, University of Pécs
Edyta Łuszczki, University of Rzeszów
Artur Mazur, University of Rzeszów
Edina Mendl, University of Pécs
Stefan Rach, Leibniz Institute for Prevention Research and Epidemiology–BIPS
Maike Wolters, Leibniz Institute for Prevention Research and Epidemiology–BIPS
Iris Pigeot, Leibniz Institute for Prevention Research and Epidemiology–BIPS

ABSTRACT
One important factor in combating the obesity prevalent around the globe (Gwozdz 2015) is encouraging a healthy diet in children, who if obese in childhood are more likely to become obese adults (Procter, 2007). Adherence to nutritional guidelines, however, is low among children and adults alike (Evans et al., 2012), with fruit and vegetable consumption in particular consistently reported at low levels. For example, in most American, Australian, and European studies, children aged 2 to 11 ate on average two to three servings per day instead of the recommended five (Evans et al., 2012). This present study thus seeks to increase vegetable and salad choice and consumption among primary school children in five European countries by offering a motivational reward in the form of a smiley stamp.

Keywords: children, healthy eating, motivational incentives, field experiment, cross-country

Children are an ideal target group for such behavioral change for two reasons: first, their habits are not yet solidly entrenched and thus more easily amended (Klein-Hessling, Lohaus, & Ball, 2005) and second, behavior learned in childhood is likely to transfer into adulthood (Lobstein, Baur & Uauy, 2004). Nevertheless, much of the responsibility for children’s food choices falls to the social agents in their sociocultural environment (Roedder John, 1999), with parents and older siblings being the key socialization agents when the children are very young, and caretakers and teachers tak-
ing over when the children enter school or preschool (Reisch et al., 2011). All these social agents act as adult role models for children to observe and imitate, although it is in the school setting particularly that children learn essential skills for their lives as consumers (Caruana & Vassallo, 2003).

Against the current backdrop of high obesity levels, school authorities are increasingly striving to promote healthier diets among their students (Reisch et al., 2011). Hence, in many European countries, authorities have implemented school-based childhood obesity prevention programs and/or expert-approved dietary guidelines on a considerable scale (e.g., the school lunch guidelines in Sweden). Nevertheless, improved access to healthy food does not seem to be sufficient to increase fruit and vegetable consumption. Rather, children’s eating behavior is strongly linked to their food preferences (Gibson et al., 1998), with cross-country research identifying vegetables as among the least liked foods (Perez-Rodrigo et al., 2003).

Not surprisingly, having children try disliked and/or unknown foods is not sufficient to increase consumption: familiarity also plays an important role (Cooke & Wardle, 2005). The children may, for example, experience food neophobia (Rozin, 1976), a dislike for new foods, that can be overcome by increasing familiarity through an average of 8–10 repeated exposures to a particular vegetable (Birch, 1999; Wardle, Herrera et al., 2003). In fact, both research and dietary practice confirm that habits can eventually be formed through repeated exposure (Becker & Murphy, 1988), making it a promising way to increase children’s consumption of fruits and vegetables.

Because successfully changing behavior involves motivation, fun, and reinforcement, however, teaching children that vegetables are healthy and tasty is insufficient to make them try them (Bandura, 1977). One way to encourage children to try unknown or disliked foods is to use incentives, either monetary or nonmonetary, such as framing (e.g., giving vegetables fancy names; Wansink et al., 2005), social norms (e.g., via priming: “eat what your super hero would eat”; Wansink et al., 2012), commitment (Raju et al., 2010), lottery (Just & Price, 2013), or competition (Belot et al., 2014). Yet despite a wide body of investigations into such incentives (see, e.g., Gneezy et al, 2011, for an overview), the research findings on how successful they are in motivating children’s vegetable consumption remain inconclusive (Cookie et al., 2011). What investigations in this field have shown is that several factors influence an incentive’s effect, including setting, type of food, type of incentive (food reward, monetary versus nonmonetary reward, social reward), and initial preference for the food.

This study thus investigates the efficacy of a simple, motivational incentive—a smiley stamp—in promoting vegetable and salad consumption among primary school children aged 5 to 11 years. The children received this reward each time they chose a portion of vegetables or salad. Although ideally the aim of such an intervention would be to generate habit formation through several weeks of repeated exposure, leading the children to ultimately choose and eat more of these healthy foods, such longitudinal monitoring was outside the study scope. Nevertheless, the investigation does make several valuable contributions to the field.

**Previous Literature and Hypotheses**

Incentives are given to induce a behavioral change in the short term (e.g., Skinner, 1953) and potentially form habits in the long term (e.g., Becker & Murphy, 1988). Whereas their short term effect is as predicted by behavior modification theories—an increased probability of the behavior on which it is contingent—an incentive may actually generate one of three possible outcomes (List & Samek, 2014). The incentive may initially modify behavior, which then bounces back to baseline after incentive removal (standard economic theory); the incentive effect may remain even after the incentive is removed (habit formation theory), the observed behavior may fall below baseline after incentive removal because of a crowding-out of intrinsic motivation (self-determination theory; Deci, Koestner, & Ryan, 1999). Whether an incentive is successful depends on how much an individual enjoys the activity, values the incentive, or cares about his/her image vis-à-vis self or others (Benabou & Tirole, 2006). Incentives must also be awarded for a concrete, easily understandable task that is simple to measure (Angrist, Bettinger, & Kremer, 2006).

As the research on children and healthy eating has shown, incentives as reinforcement do not always produce the desired outcome. For example, whereas field studies have supported the positive effects of incentives on food acceptance (e.g., Hendy, Williams, & Camise, 2005), laboratory studies have often shown the liking for foods falling to below pretreatment levels (e.g., Birch, Marlin, & Rotter, 1984). These conflicting results have been explained in the literature in terms of three factors (Cooke et al., 2011):

1. The desired study outcome varies from motivational (e.g., liking vegetables) to actual behavior change (eating vegetables). In the first instance, the incentive effects are unclear (e.g., Birch et al., 1984; Mikula, 1989), but in the second, they are generally successful (e.g., Hendy et al., 2005; Wardle et al., 2003).

2. Incentive effects depend on how the incentives are designed, the form they are given, and on what happens
Incentives can, for example, be nontangible (e.g., positive feedback or praise) or tangible (e.g., monetary or other materialistic rewards or food rewards). Whereas food rewards generally work but may have such unintended side effects as an increased liking for an unhealthy dessert (Mikula, 1989), social rewards are less undermining (Henderlong & Lepper, 2002). Both social and tangible nonfood rewards have positive and negative effects (Birch et al., 1984; Hendy et al., 2005).

The initial liking is a moderator between the incentive and the acceptance of food (Cooke et al., 2011). Hence, laboratory studies tend to use palatable foods that the children already like pre experiment, whereas field studies often focus on the less liked vegetables or salad, which increases the effect of the incentive.

The children in our field experiment were exposed to an incentive over the course of two weeks, meaning that we could only measure a short term effect, not habit formation. Given the importance of the incentive’s design, our smiley motivator has an outcome variable (“food choice”) that is an actual behavior. Likewise, being stamped on a card that is handed out to the children, it is a tangible motivational reward for choosing a portion of vegetables or salad. Based on these observations, we derive the following main hypothesis:

Providing an incentive increases healthy food choices more than not providing an incentive does.

We then split this conjecture into three parts to enable investigation of both the smiley effect and its unintended side effects. The first subhypothesis addresses the overall effect:

The incentive increases the choice of vegetables and/or salad.

Because the intended aim of increasing healthy food choices among children goes beyond mere selection, the second subhypothesis refers to actual consumption:

The incentive increases not merely the selection but also the consumption of vegetables and/or salad.

The last subhypothesis reflects the research aim of increasing the consumption of vegetables and/or salads but not their waste, as could happen if it increases selection but not consumption:

The incentive does not increase the waste of vegetables and/or salad.

Method

Experimental Design

As previously explained, the motivational incentive used to encourage the primary school children to choose healthy side options was a smiley, which was stamped on a personalized lunch ID card whenever a child took a portion of vegetables or salad. The field experiment, which was part of the I.Family study, was conducted between September and December 2014 at 10 primary schools across five European countries, with one treatment school and one control school in each country. Parental consent was obtained passively using a standard form.

The Incentive. The smiley, which would be stamped on the previously provided lunch ID card, was first introduced as a classroom game using pictures of country-specific meals to explain the concept of a portion. The portion cards showed two different main meals on a plate with three different side servings of vegetables or salads: one too small, one exactly a portion (defined as roughly 80 grams), and one larger than a portion. The latter two qualified for a smiley.

Timing. The design of the six-week experiment was symmetric: Weeks 1 and 2 were baselines, the incentive was provided during Weeks 3 and 4, and the post-treatment incentive effects were measured in Weeks 5 and 6. To eliminate any effect from the lunch ID card, we introduced it one week before awarding the incentive (Week 2) and faded it out one week afterwards (Week 5).

Measurement. To enable comparison of the smiley effect across individuals, daily canteen level data were collected on the choice, consumption, and waste of vegetables and salad (which is some cases included fruit). The children’s choices were measured by weighing the offered vegetables and salad on the buffet or table and adding in any refills. The consumption amount was then obtained by weighing the vegetables and salad left on the children’s plates to get the waste measure and then deducting that from the choice measure. Field notes were also taken daily that detailed the menu of the day and commented on that day’s particulars, and the available food each day was recorded photographically.

A school background questionnaire asked about educational programs, the school lunch provider, number of students, percentage of students eating lunch in the canteen, general demographics of the group under study, and type of food service (self-serve or family style).

Individual level data were collected from Week 2 to Week 5 after distribution of the lunch ID cards, which were equipped with individual barcodes that could be scanned when the child went to lunch.
Statistical Analyses

We measured the between-individual incentive effects using both t-tests for paired samples and difference-in-difference estimations, all run using Stata 13. First, we tested for differences between control and treatment schools in preincentive choice, consumption, and waste. If no differences appeared prior to treatment, we attributed any differences found afterwards to the incentive. We then compared choice, consumption, and waste in the control versus the treatment schools during and after the incentive.

We also used the individual data to explore within-individual incentive effects, measured first using paired sample t-tests and then by three-level random intercept hierarchical general logistic modeling (HLM) with settings for logistical regression. The model had three levels because days (level 1) were nested within individual children (level 2) who were nested within schools (level 3). The dependent variable in each regression was the taking of a portion of vegetables or salad (dummy), and the main independent variable was the incentive (dummy).

The control variables were child demographics (age, grade, sex) and dummies for week and weekday.

Findings

Between-Individual Effect: Treatment versus Control Schools

We began our assessment of the smiley incentive effect by comparing the treatment and control schools before smiley introduction. If we found no differences, we attributed any later differences to the incentive. Table 1, which summarizes the choice, consumption, and waste of vegetables and salad in kg together with the calculated differences and t- and p-values of the paired t-test, shows no statistically significant preintervention differences between the treatment and control schools. Thus, all differences in choice, consumption, and waste between the treatment and control schools should be attributable to the smiley.

The table 1 summary also breaks down the children’s choices, consumption, and waste in kg by experimental period: (1) entire experiment, (2) before introduction of the smiley, (3) during the smiley intervention, and (4) after smiley removal. Over the entire six weeks, the children took an average of 8.91 kg of vegetables or salad in the treatment schools and 6.63 kg in the control schools. Of these selections, they consumed 7.62 kg and 5.96 kg, respectively. The resulting waste was 1.29 kg in the treatment schools and 0.67 kg in the control schools, giving an average treatment versus control school difference of about 0.62 kg, which

| Table 1. Vegetable and Salad Choice, Consumption and Waste: A Comparison of Control and Treatment School by Experimental Phase (All Countries) (Paired T-Test) |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| | Choice | Consumption | Waste |
| | Control | Treatment | p (t-value) | Control | Treatment | p (t-value) | Control | Treatment | p (t-value) |
| All weeks | 6.630 | 8.912 | *** | 5.958 | 7.620 | *** | .672 | 1.293 | *** |
| Mean | 121 | 121 | (4.002) | 121 | 121 | (3.093) | 121 | 121 | (5.207) |
| Obs. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Before treatment | 7.783 | 8.321 | NS | 6.620 | 6.888 | NS | .514 | .674 | NS |
| Mean | 41 | 41 | (.537) | 41 | 41 | (.266) | 41 | 41 | (1.385) |
| Obs. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| During treatment | 6.046 | 11.028 | *** | 5.422 | 8.774 | ** | .625 | 2.254 | *** |
| Mean | 36 | 36 | (4.769) | 36 | 36 | (3.339) | 36 | 36 | (6.611) |
| Obs. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| After treatment | 6.637 | 8.440 | # | 5.780 | 7.358 | NS | .857 | 1.082 | NS |
| Mean | 44 | 44 | (2.236) | 44 | 44 | (2.081) | 44 | 44 | (1.311) |
| Obs. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Note: ** ≤ .0125; *** ≤ .001; NS = not significant
Paired sample t-tests; t-value in parentheses; obs. represents days of measurement per control and treatment schools; means are kg of vegetables/salad
peaked during the incentive weeks with 1.63 kg more waste in the treatment schools. This difference is explainable by the increased choice in the treatment schools during the smiley period (3), when the treatment versus control school differences were 4.98 kg in vegetable or salad choice and 3.35 kg in consumption. All described differences are statistically significant (see table 1) with the exception of the above-mentioned pre-smiley period (2). Taking school differences into account by using difference-in-difference estimation, we find that the volumes of vegetables and salad increase in response to the incentive but decrease again once the incentive is removed.

Within-Individual Effect: Before-During-After Treatment

We next explored the smiley effect within individuals; that is, how the children changed their personal vegetable or salad choices once the smiley was introduced and then removed. Given the analytic aim of assessing the smiley effect when student characteristics are fixed, the focus was on treatment schools only. The resulting sample included n = 653 children with n = 10,231 days of observation (n = 2,646, 4,954, and 2,631, before, during, and after treatment, respectively).

Table 2 report the mean comparisons of vegetable and salad choices before, during, and after treatment (Full Sample). Table 2 report the mean comparisons of vegetable and salad choices before, during, and after treatment by country. Here, the variable of interest is a dummy indicating whether a child chose a portion of the healthy food or not. As table 2 shows, the percentage of children choosing a portion of vegetables or salad increases from 40.06% in the pretreatment period to 76.89% in the treatment period but decreases to 53.40% after smiley removal. All means are statistically significant, indicating that the smiley significantly increased the number of children choosing a healthy portion.

As before, we tested whether the smiley increases the children’s vegetable and salad choices (table 3). The overall (across-weeks) odds of choosing a portion of vegetables or salad are 4.198:1 (column 1). Once the smiley is introduced, these odds rise to 8.996 (column 2), producing a smiley effect of OR = 4.626 in the treatment to post-treatment period (column 3), which is in line with the descriptive results in table 2. We thus identify a strong effect of the smiley on the children’s food choice.

We do, however, identify differences in the incentive effect across countries. In particular, the point at which children

| Table 2. Vegetable/Salad Choice: A Comparison Before, During, and After Treatment (Full Sample) |
|---------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
|                                 | (1) Before      | (2) During      | (1) vs. (2) p-value | (2) vs (3) p-value | (1) vs. (3) p-value |
| All                             |                 |                 |                   |                 |                 |
| %                               | 40.060          | 76.686          | 53.402            | ***             | ***             |
| Obs.                            | 2,646           | 4,954           | 2,631             | (31.827)        | (20.240)        |
| Estonia                         |                 |                 |                   |                 |                 |
| %                               | 15.192          | 52.354          | 17.677            | ***             | ***             |
| Obs.                            | 520             | 1,041           | 594               | (14.561)        | (13.201)        |
| Poland                          |                 |                 |                   |                 |                 |
| %                               | 57.113          | 88.831          | 84.694            | ***             | NS              |
| Obs.                            | 485             | 770             | 490               | (11.475)        | (1.430)         |
| Sweden                          |                 |                 |                   |                 |                 |
| %                               | 28.745          | 80.345          | 48.945            | ***             | ***             |
| Obs.                            | 821             | 1,506           | 758               | (24.211)        | (14.158)        |
| Germany                         |                 |                 |                   |                 |                 |
| %                               | 36.854          | 82.326          | 60.000            | ***             | ***             |
| Obs.                            | 426             | 860             | 410               | (15.795)        | (8.137)         |
| Hungary                         |                 |                 |                   |                 |                 |
| %                               | 78.934          | 83.912          | 70.712            | **              | ***             |
| Obs.                            | 394             | 777             | 379               | (3.293)         | (5.702)         |

Note: p-value: ** ≤ .0125; *** ≤ .001; NS = not significant
Paired sample t-tests; t-value in parentheses; obs. represents days of measurement per control and treatment schools; means are kg of vegetables/salad, adjusted for multiple testing.
Table 3. Odds Ratios for Choosing a Portion of Vegetables/Salad When Incentivized by a Smiley: Total and Stratified by Moderators (Initial Liking, Age, Sex)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(1) All Weeks</th>
<th>(2) Before &amp; During Treatment</th>
<th>(3) During &amp; After Treatment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All countries</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR</td>
<td>4.198***</td>
<td>8.996***</td>
<td>4.626***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95% CI</td>
<td>[2.552, 6.905]</td>
<td>[4.279, 18.909]</td>
<td>[2.899, 7.381]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obs. (days)</td>
<td>10,227</td>
<td>7,597</td>
<td>7,581</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obs. (children)</td>
<td>653</td>
<td>652</td>
<td>652</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR</td>
<td>7.256***</td>
<td>10.019***</td>
<td>7.047***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95% CI</td>
<td>[5.194, 10.138]</td>
<td>[6.843, 14.669]</td>
<td>[5.038, 9.856]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obs. (days)</td>
<td>2,108</td>
<td>1,521</td>
<td>1,599</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obs. (children)</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR</td>
<td>1.966**</td>
<td>9.408***</td>
<td>2.197**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95% CI</td>
<td>[1.214, 3.183]</td>
<td>[5.908, 14.979]</td>
<td>[1.292, 3.735]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obs. (days)</td>
<td>1,598</td>
<td>1,148</td>
<td>1,143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obs. (children)</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR</td>
<td>5.152***</td>
<td>14.861***</td>
<td>5.487***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95% CI</td>
<td>[3.852, 6.889]</td>
<td>[10.418, 21.201]</td>
<td>[4.032, 7.467]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obs. (days)</td>
<td>3,045</td>
<td>2,297</td>
<td>2,225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obs. (children)</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR</td>
<td>6.149***</td>
<td>35.595***</td>
<td>8.543***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95% CI</td>
<td>[4.087, 9.252]</td>
<td>[18.168, 69.738]</td>
<td>[5.204, 14.022]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obs. (days)</td>
<td>1,432</td>
<td>1,086</td>
<td>1,067</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obs. (children)</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR</td>
<td>1.590*</td>
<td>1.770**</td>
<td>1.636*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95% CI</td>
<td>[1.089, 2.323]</td>
<td>[1.209, 2.591]</td>
<td>[1.067, 2.508]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obs. (days)</td>
<td>896</td>
<td>670</td>
<td>671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obs. (children)</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: * ≤ .05; ** ≤ .01; *** ≤ .001;

Estimates of mixed-effects generalized logit model (a two-level random intercept model of child, day). 95%-Confidence Intervals (CI) in parentheses. All variables are dummies. None of the controls (age, sex, grade, week, and weekday) are significant.

chose a portion of vegetables or salad varies greatly between the five countries. Whereas in Hungary and Poland, the majority began choosing a healthy portion before the smiley was even introduced (78.93% and 57.11%, respectively), only a few children were opting for a portion pretreatment in Estonia (15.19%), Germany (25.69%), or Sweden (28.75%). Because the potential explanatory variables are too numerous to allow anything but mere speculation, with many being unobservables (e.g., food culture, food taste), for the country-specific analyses, we draw on the regression results by country (table 3) to graph the estimated choice probabilities in figure 1.

We observe only a small increase attributable to the smiley in Hungary (from 78.93% to 83.91%, t = 3.293). The proportion of children opting for a healthy portion after smiley removal is equal to the pre-smiley period which is supported by the similarity of the ORs in the before-and-during and during-and-after treatment periods—1.770 (column 2) and 1.636 (column 3), respectively—which indicate that the observed effect disappears completely after incentive removal (see also figure 1).

In Poland; the share of children choosing a healthy portion after smiley removal resembles that during when it was pres-
ent (84.69% vs. 88.83%). Not only are these effects clearly illustrated in figure 1, but table 3 (column 3) also shows a significant, albeit rather small, effect (OR = 2.197) once the smiley is removed. Because this effect is significantly smaller than the smiley effect before and during the treatment period (OR = 9.408 with no overlap in the 95% CI), we conclude that no crowding out effect is occurring in Poland. On the contrary, the proportion of children choosing a portion of vegetables or salad remains rather high after incentive removal.

When we focus on Sweden and Estonia, however, the countries with late starting points for healthy choices, we find interesting differences in the smiley effect. Here, the number of children choosing a healthy portion once the incentive is given increases markedly and in a similar manner, i.e., the ORs are 14.861 and 10.019, respectively (although with overlap in the 95% CI). After smiley removal, however, this number falls back to baseline levels in Estonia but remains relatively high in Sweden which is indicated by the ORs for the before-and-during treatment and during-and-after treatment periods, which are 14.86 (column 2) and 5.487 (column 3), respectively, with no CI overlap. In Estonia, the OR confidence intervals do overlap, so we cannot exclude full disappearance of the smiley effect after its removal. In Germany, on the other hand, the number of children choosing a healthy portion when awarded the incentive increases but then decreases significantly after incentive removal (table 2). Here also, however, the share choosing a healthy portion after smiley removal is greater than before reward implementation, as also illustrated in table 3 by the strong smiley effect (OR = 35.595) that drops after its removal (OR = 8.543) but remains higher than before its introduction (with no 95% CI overlap).

To summarize, our findings are similar to those of many other field experiments aimed at increasing healthy food choices among children but using other types of incentives (e.g., Belot et al., 2014; Just & Price, 2013; Raju et al., 2010; Wansink et al., 2005; Wansink et al., 2012). Hence, we find support for our hypothesis, i.e., that the smiley has an effect on children’s food choice. According to the within-individual estimations, the smiley effect acted as expected in Sweden and Germany; that is, an increase during the smiley treatment period followed by a slight decrease after its removal but to levels that were still higher than before smiley implementation. Admittedly, however, these levels are likely to have fallen back to baseline in time. In Estonia and Hungary, on the other hand, although the number of children choosing a portion of vegetables or salad due to the smiley increased, after its removal, it decreased to virtually a pre-smiley level. In Poland, the effect continued after smiley

**Figure 1.** The Smiley Effect by Country (Predicted Probabilities Based on the Regressions Reported in Table 7)
removal for the week in which data were collected, which was too short a period for habit formation (Becker & Murphy, 1998). These findings for total smiley effect and effect by country are summarized in table 10.

**Conclusions**

This investigation into whether a tangible motivational incentive (here, a smiley stamp) can increase healthy eating among primary school children took the form of a field experiment conducted in five European nations using one treatment versus one control school in each country. In general, the smiley incentive did have a positive effect on the participating children’s vegetable and salad choices. That is, whereas the results show no treatment versus control school differences in vegetable or salad choice, consumption, and waste before the incentive intervention, they do indicate increased choice and consumption during the smiley period, although also increased waste. This latter, however, is still less than half the increase in consumption, meaning a net improvement in outcome. That the smiley works is also supported by the analyses of preintervention, intervention, and postintervention data for the treatment schools, which all show a strong smiley effect on the children’s choices of vegetables or salad. In particular, children who rarely selected these healthy portions at the beginning of the experiment changed their behavior, not only when given the incentive but also thereafter. Nor does this positive effect appear to be moderated by demographics.

Perhaps the most interesting finding is the observed country differences, such as low levels of initial vegetable and salad choices in Estonia and Sweden but initially high levels in Hungary and Poland, with German children showing baseline consumption levels somewhere in between. Likewise, although the smiley increased the volume of vegetables and salad chosen or consumed in Estonia, Sweden, and Germany, significant differences are observable for Poland and Hungary. In fact, the initial amounts in the latter were already much higher than in the other countries, which might explain the small impact of the incentive (i.e., the existing levels left little room for improvement). Irrespective of the volume of vegetables and salad, the number of children choosing a portion of vegetables or salad increased during the incentive period in all countries. Behavior after incentive removal, however, varied, with the choice of vegetables or salad either dropping slightly (Sweden and Germany), leveling off to close to the pre-smiley baseline (Estonia and Hungary), or dropping slightly but remaining similar to the intervention period level (Poland).

Admittedly, this study is unable to explain either the observed differences in initial vegetable or salad choices or the variations in the incentive effect. Even though the analyses controlled for food menus, styles of service, ongoing nutritional campaigns, and several other characteristics, numerous factors could explain the country differences, from values, food culture, and taste preferences to the time of eating and setting for the meal. These unanswered questions, however, raise interesting avenues for future study. What this present investigation did accomplish was to underscore the need to consider and allow for intercountry differences in the design of programs and campaigns aimed at increasing healthy food choices. One major lesson is that even though an incentive works in one context, it may not automatically work in another.

The primary message of this study is that a motivational incentive does work for primary school children in various countries. A purely motivational incentive has the positive effect of not tying any healthy food choice to a material reward such as a toy and hence, shaping children’s expectations to receive a reward when behaving in a desired way. The smiley as a motivational incentive disappears after the incentive period. Further, such a simple incentive works, but needs to be tailored to the food culture, canteen design, lunch provider, and other endogenous and exogenous factors of the school lunch setting. These factors can and will influence the effect of the incentive on the children’s food choices. It is also a prerequisite that healthy foods be available, which is far from the reality in some of the countries studied. Even in Sweden, where most children regularly eat lunch in school and healthy school lunches are high on the political agenda, there is room for improvement.

At the same time, although in principle children are capable of choosing healthy options from a range of food (Hakim & Meissen, 2013), the choice architecture in any canteen should be designed to facilitate the amendment of food preferences (Wansink 2014). Schools should also be seriously concerned with the role that age-specific dietary guidelines play in the preselection of available foods. Learning early to select their own foods not only socializes children to choose a healthy diet but reduces food waste. Above all, however, the study demonstrates the advantages of using an inexpensive, effective, scalable, and easy-to-handle incentive reward like a smiley because of its ease of implementation. Such a reward can easily be combined with other nutritional educational campaigns and programs, which makes it appealing not only to school administrators and school authorities, but also to health educators, health marketers, and public policy makers.

**References**

Klein-Hessling, Johannes, Arnold Lohaus, and Juliane Ball (2005), “Psychological Predictors of Health-Related Behavior in Children,” Psychology, Health & Medicine, 10 (February), 31–43.


The 101-Calorie Mini Pack: How Distinctiveness in Regulations Influences Food Product Evaluations

Elizabeth A. Minton, University of Wyoming
Chris Lee, Temple University

Keywords: FDA calorie requirements, framing, linguistics, packaging, health perceptions, calories, information leakage, food labels

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

The FDA regulates how calorie information is displayed on food packaging; however, research has yet to adequately explore how such information interacts with verbal cues (e.g., size descriptors) on food packaging to influence consumer evaluations. Thus, this research examines such cues in two studies. Study 1 showed that distinctive numerical cues (99 or 101 calories) and distinctive verbal cues (mega or mini) produced higher product evaluations, although only for high health interest consumers. Study 2 identified manipulative intent as a key mediator to the relationship between cues and product evaluations. Specifically, a distinctive numerical cue or a distinctive verbal cue (as opposed to two distinctive cues or no distinctive cues) produced lower manipulative intent, leading to higher product evaluations and perceptions of product healthiness. These findings provide insight for the FDA because, currently, calorie amounts above 50 calories are required to be rounded to the nearest 10 calorie unit (e.g., 100 calories), but, in actuality, allowing calorie amounts to be exact (e.g., 99 or 101 calories) could lead to healthier consumption outcomes.

Research Questions
1. How do one unit calorie differences (e.g., 99 vs. 100 vs. 101 calories) influence consumer food product evaluations? How do these findings lend insight into current FDA regulation requiring calorie amounts above 50 calories to be rounded to the nearest 10 calorie unit?
2. How does numerical calorie information interact with verbal food portion cues on product packaging?
3. What moderators and mediators influence the relationship between numerical and verbal food package cues on food product evaluations?

Method and Data
Two experimental studies were conducted using participants from Amazon’s Mechanical Turk (n for each = 315). Participants were randomly assigned to see a food package stimuli (study 1 = popcorn, study 2 = pretzels) in one of nine conditions, 3 (calories: 99, 100, 101) x 3 (verbal cue: mega, mini, none), of a between-subjects design. After seeing the stimuli, participants answered questions relating to purchase intentions, overall attitude, nutrition perceptions, and taste perceptions.

Summary of Findings
Study 1 showed that distinctive numerical cues (99 or 101 calories) and distinctive verbal cues (mega or mini) produced higher product evaluations, although only for high health interest consumers. Study 2 identified manipulative intent as a key mediator to the relationship between cues and product evaluations. Specifically, a distinctive numerical cue or a distinctive verbal cue (as opposed to two distinctive cues or no distinctive cues) produced lower manipulative intent, leading to higher product evaluations and perceptions of product healthiness.

Key Contributions
The FDA regulates calorie information on food packaging, such that food containing less than five calories should be expressed as containing zero calories, food containing less than 50 calories should be expressed in five calorie incre-
ments, and food containing more than 50 calorie should be expressed to the nearest 10 calorie increment (FDA, 2013). Our research provides insight for these regulations in showing that rounding calories to the nearest 5 or 10 unit increment may not be the best practice. As just stated in the summary of findings, distinctive numerical or verbal cues produced the lowest manipulative intent in comparison to other cue combinations, which resulted in higher product evaluations and perceptions of product healthiness. Given that marketers often emblazon food packaging with numerous distinctive verbal cues, allowing marketers to also include distinctive numerical cues (e.g., 99 or 101 calories) rather than non-distinctive numerical cues (e.g., 100 calories) may help to reduce over-inflated health perceptions and encourage consumers to make healthier choices.

References are available on request.
Scientific consensus surrounding the causes as well as the current and future effects of global warming has become increasingly unified, if not entirely resolute. However, to the confusion and dismay of researchers across disciplines, scientific consensus has resulted in little to no improvement in public opinion, attitudes, or behaviors toward the mitigation of global warming. Of greatest concern, the largest emitters of CO₂ (the United States, Europe, and China) are consistently the least concerned about the current and future effects of global warming (Gallup 2011; Pew 2015). While advanced climate models are now in 99% agreement that global warming will, at minimum, induce a 2°C average increase in global temperatures (Stern 2006; IPCC 2014), public belief in global warming has decreased from 79% in 2007 to 68% in 2015, with only 46% of Americans rating it as a “very serious” problem (Pew 2015). This is troubling, as well-regarded climate reports estimate the damages from global warming to exceed 100% of GDP in the U.S. and 100% of Gross World Product (Stern 2006).

Because of this, the ability of humanity to survive global warming falls not to climate scientists, but rather to marketers and communicators of information. As noted by some of persuasion’s greatest contemporary writers and researchers, global warming is at its core a problem defined by a profound lack of communication (cf. Kotler 2011; Prothero et al. 2011; Thaler and Sunstein 2008). With this considered, the ability of marketers to convince skeptics becomes absolutely vital. Failure to motivate any substantial change may result in disastrous consequences to our economy, environment, and way of life.

In this article, we empirically test two persuasion strategies for convincing global warming skeptics: process-based persuasion, where the underlying process is described, and statistics-based persuasion, where statistics and consequences related to the phenomena are described. Using two studies grounded in motivated reasoning, we demonstrate an efficacious strategy for using marketing to convince global warming skeptics. In Study 1, participants were asked to explain the underlying process of the greenhouse effect or statistics related to increased emissions, subsequent warming, and the disastrous effects that it could cause. Results importantly suggest that when individuals understand the process underlying global warming, they were significantly more likely to...
believe in global warming. Viewing a video that explained the underlying process increased understanding and subsequent belief in global warming. This suggests that policymakers trying to change beliefs related to global warming may be able persuade even its most stubborn critics by emphasizing the process as opposed to fear or statistics-driven persuasion.

**Belief in Global Warming**

While scientific evidence related to global warming remains resolute, large portions of people across the world increasingly either do not believe in global warming, or dispute whether its effects will be as severe as scientists predict (Gallup 2014; Pew 2015; YouGov 2012). As the majority of scientists agree that large-scale collective action must be taken to protect humanity from the effects of global warming, public opinion related to belief in global warming is exceedingly important. Next, we review relevant findings related to how and why individuals come to believe in or deny global warming’s existence.

**Factors Deterring Belief in Global Warming**

Many factors have been associated with deterrence of belief in global warming. First, temporal orientation toward near-term interests, such as heuristics and available schemas, have been found to deter belief in global warming. For instance, environmental cues such as outdoor temperatures at the time of data collection have been shown to significantly predict belief in global warming (Li, Johnson, and Zaval 2011), illustrating the role of irrelevant but salient schemas in forming beliefs. In addition to environmental biases, psychological biases, such as political ideology, play an unfortunate role in global warming policy: conservatives tend to have developed an identity defense-driven callous to global warming beliefs (McCright and Dunlap 2011). Political psychologists view this psychological resistance as a function of three key factors: (1) concerted political efforts by industry groups to seed skepticism; (2) an implicit preference for system justification within conservatism; (3) global warming’s framing as a negative externality of free-market economic policies, a core tenet of modern conservatism (Feygina, Jost, and Goldsmith 2010; Jacques 2006; McCright and Dunlap 2011). Furthermore, political orientation has been shown to predict not just views on global warming, but also consumers’ understanding of global warming: liberals have been shown to both understand and believe in global warming at higher levels (McCright and Dunlap 2011).

With this considered, is it possible that the staggering statistics, dystopic predictions, and scare tactics typically employed in global warming appeals simply do not appeal to an audience of people skeptical about global warming? Instead, are these individuals motivated to interpret these statistics as biased? Within the literature, evidence exists suggesting this may be the case: Feinberg and Wiiler (2010) find that fear-driven messages emphasizing the dire consequences of global warming produce less attitude change than ads featuring more positive elements. Consistent with this, Feygina, Jost, and Goldsmith (2009) find that conservatives tend to interpret information related to global warming as a threat to the status quo, undertaking identity-defense when exposed to information related to global warming, restricting persuasive strategies. Other research supports the premise that when individuals lack understanding about a sociopolitical issue, they become threatened and subsequently are motivated to justify the status quo and actively avoid information on that issue (Shepherd and Kay 2011). Taken together, belief in global warming can be considered less a problem of attitude permanence, and more one of poorly chosen persuasive strategies. Next, we discuss factors that lead to higher levels of belief in global warming and how these ought to be used to change attitudes.

**Motivated Reasoning**

**Factors Encouraging Belief in Global Warming**

Scientists have long been interested in how consumers come to know and understand real world phenomena derived by science. In past research, the Deficit Model of Science has been used to explain the education of the public on scientific issues. According to this model, lay-people are exposed to a phenomenon and its underlying scientific explanation through selection of media and real-life interactions, and as they are exposed to more and more information, they eventually adopt views consistent with scientists (Bauer, Allum, and Miller 2007). However, with the ideological nature of news and public mistrust in science, this view is being challenged. Psychological biases, like political orientation (Goidel, Shields, and Peffley 1997) and religion (Nisbet 2005) have increasingly been found to guide people’s decisions toward “a subset of considerations that are consistent or reinforce their predispositions” (Hart and Nisbet 2011, p. 3).

In response, researchers have developed the Motivated Reasoning Model of Science, which has found efficacy across a wide range of contexts, especially those related to politicized decision-making (Redlawsk 2002). Further, research has suggested that nearly any type of information about a contentious issue is likely to activate predispositions, increasing polarization and decreasing the rate at which the public adopts science-based viewpoints (Mutz 2008). This approach has demonstrated that in politically charged contexts, people primarily use information in a manner that reinforces their worldview (Dusso and Kennedy 2015), that framing science in culturally nuanced ways results in higher understanding (Jones and Song 2014), and that biased fram-
ing can shape opinions related to emerging technology (Druckman and Bolson 2011).

With this considered, the commonly employed statistics-based persuasive approach to global warming—where statistics associated with scientific consensus are presented as a persuasive attempt—could be seen as biased, further solidifying their skepticism. As Mark Twain famously said, “there are lies, damned lies, and statistics.” However, while statistics are often seen as malleable and potentially biased, these inferences are less likely to be made about the underlying process, the Greenhouse Effect. Even through a motivated reasoning lens, where information is used to reinforce a specific worldview, it is less likely that even skeptical consumers will see a process-based scientific explanation (e.g. the Greenhouse Effect) as biased.

Why should a process-based explanation be more effective than a statistics-based one? An established body of work has demonstrated that people are highly motivated to remain psychologically consistent (Festinger 1962; Kunda 1990; Gawronski 2012) but are also motivated to be accurate in their beliefs (Hart et al., 2009; Chaiken et al. 1980; Kunda 1990). When presented with incongruent information, individuals are motivated to mentally counter-argue the new information in an attempt to rationalize or dismiss it (Petty and Cacioppo 1979; Edwards and Smith 1996). Indeed, individuals spend longer on arguments that are counter-attitudinal and are able to generate more refutational arguments (Edwards and Smith, 1996; Jain and Maheswaran 2000) leading to biasedly assimilating the information (Taber and Lodge 2006; Munro and Ditto 1997), selective seeking confirmatory evidence (Hart et al. 2009) increased attitude polarization (Lord, Ross, and Lepper 1979), and a greater ability to resist future persuasion attempts (Tormala and Petty 2002; Lydon, Zanna, and Ross 1988; McGuire 1961).

However, the process underlying global warming is both unrefuted and perceived as unbiased. As such, individuals will have a more difficult time dismissing the argument while still feeling like they reached an accurate conclusion. In addition, humans have a strong tendency to seek out causal information and prefer it to correlational information (Ahn, Kalish, Medin and Gelman 1995), even for one-time events when it is unlikely to provide any predictive ability for the future (Keil 2006). In sum, there is reason to believe that causal explanations of process will be more persuasive than statistical-based explanations. In the next section, we describe the process-based explanation relevant to global warming: the greenhouse effect.

As one of the core requirements for plant and animal life, greenhouse gases (carbon dioxide, methane, etc.) trap infrared radiation in the Earth’s atmosphere, keeping most of the Earth warm and habitable for animal and plant life (U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 2015). Because it is an inherently necessary condition for human life, the Greenhouse Effect is unlikely to be disputed at face value, or to carry the kind of politicized meaning scholars studying motivated reasoning find problematic. Importantly, however, the Greenhouse Effect is also a main antecedent for global warming: human emissions increase greenhouse gas levels, in turn increasing heat trapped in the atmosphere, causing warming. As this process plays an integral role in fostering human life, it seems unlikely that people would take a motivated reasoning approach to interpreting a global warming explanation derived from the Greenhouse Effect. Also, it is likely most people will be able to easily grasp the core concept with minimal effort and then be unable to produce valid counterarguments. This suggests an opportunity for practitioners looking to change beliefs toward global warming: If people understand the core concept, it is more likely they will also believe in its downstream consequences.

### Changing Beliefs Toward Global Warming

Motivated reasoning is an effective tool in understanding when and why information is unable to influence belief in global warming. Research suggests the tendency to reject climate science is not a function of education, intelligence, or scientific literacy, but rather motivated personal interests people have in forming beliefs (Kahan et al. 2012). Skeptics are inundated with statistics that are typically dire, dystopic, and somewhat condescending in nature, leading them to feel threatened and reject climate science (Feygina, Jost, and Goldsmith 2009; Feinberg and Willer 2010). Similarly, beliefs related to global warming are formed in an experiential manner, with affect, imagery, and values, found to impact beliefs (Leiserowitz 2006).

Among people concerned with global warming, self-reported certainty toward understanding the issue unsurprisingly predicted belief in global warming, people less-involved (approximately 75% of their sample) drew their beliefs from subjective personal experiences related to global warming rather than science or objective information (Myers et al. 2013). This finding suggests that skeptics develop their disbelief through subjective events and motivated reasoning. Further, while one might expect that high scientific and numerical literacy should predict belief in global warming, evidence suggests that these people are actually the most polarized (Kahan et al. 2012). Specifically, differences in belief were predicted by individual differences in values, which were magnified when scientific and numeric literacy was high (Kahan et al. 2012). Together, this implies the mere presentation of statistics cannot convince
skeptics with the same effectiveness as experiential learning, indicating that belief in global warming is determined in a more complex fashion than intelligence alone can explain.

Consistent with these ideas, we join a growing number of researchers suggesting that use of statistics to drive home scientific certainty or spark fear among skeptics is not only an ineffective persuasion technique, but also a counterproductive one (e.g., Bain et al. 2012; Hart and Nisbet 2011; Weber 2010). Building off of the work of contemporary researchers that have shown global warming persuasion failing due to threat avoidance and motivated reasoning (Feinberg and Willer 2010; Moxnes and Søysel 2008; Weber and Stern 2011; Shepherd and Kay 2011), we propose that because the process of global warming has no ideological basis, it is more difficult to counterargue. Further, we argue that because individuals tend to prefer explanations to correlational information, framing global warming persuasion in terms of the process (i.e., the greenhouse effect) has a greater ability to change beliefs than statistics.

**Study 1**

The purpose of Study 1 is to provide initial evidence that understanding the underlying process of the greenhouse effect is related to belief in man-made global warming. The conventional view among climate scientists and policy-makers is that there are several underlying reasons for global warming skepticism. Specifically, experts view the general public as either unable to properly grasp the scientific data or lacking the motivation to do so (Hart et al., 2011; Ungar 2000). Subsequently, individuals rely on heuristics when creating these beliefs, such as conforming to the norms and beliefs of their in-group (Kahan et al., 2012). Kahan and colleagues (2012) questioned this view, showing that those high in scientific literacy were actually less likely to see global warming as a threat. Although the Gallup poll (2014) suggested that 84% of Americans self-report that they understand global warming either very well (33%) or fairly well (51%). Importantly, those that said they understood it very well were the least likely to believe humans are the cause. Although the Gallup question was ambiguous in regard to what exactly “understanding global warming” means, we sought to test the extent to which process familiarity corresponded with understanding of global warming. Further, age and education level were regressed on belief in global warming. The results of Study 1 provide preliminary evidence that understanding the underlying process plays a role in belief in global warming. Further, education, age, and gender do not explain or qualify the results. However, the results of Study 1 are correlational and thus causality cannot be inferred. It remains possible that individuals are influenced to believe in global warming for other reasons, and subsequently are more open to explore related information. Thus in Study 2, we seek to establish causality by systematically manipulating whether participants learn about the process or not. We predict that those learning about the process should show better understanding and higher levels of belief in global warming.

**Method**

104 participants (55 male, Mage = 32.79) were recruited via Amazon’s Mechanical Turk. To assess belief in global warming, participants were first asked whether they were confident that global warming was a function of man-made greenhouse gasses (1 = not at all confident, 5 = extremely confident). Next, participants were asked to describe, regardless of their belief in global warming, the theoretical reason as to how greenhouse gasses would cause global warming. Two individuals with post-graduate training in environmental studies were asked to code the responses from 1 (no understanding) to 5 (excellent understanding). The two scores achieved strong interrater reliability (r = .72, p < .001) and thus were averaged. Lastly, age, gender, and education level were assessed.

**Results**

Participants were on average somewhat confident (M = 3.58, SD = 1.20) that global warming was a function of man-made greenhouse gases, and had a moderate understanding of the greenhouse effect (M = 2.97, SD = 1.36). Consistent with our hypothesis, the results demonstrate that belief in global warming is significantly correlated with understanding of the process r(102) = .24, p = .015. Importantly, and consistent with other research, education is not significantly predictive of belief in global warming (r(102) = .14, p = .15), and the effect holds when both understanding and education level were regressed on belief in global warming (β = .22, p = .04), while education level remains non-significant, (B = .07, p = .50). Further, age r(102) = –.02, p = .81 nor gender (r(102) = –1.60, p = .11) predicted belief in global warming.

**Discussion**

The results of Study 1 provide preliminary evidence that understanding the underlying process plays a role in belief in global warming. Further, education, age, and gender do not explain or qualify the results. However, the results of Study 1 are correlational and thus causality cannot be inferred. It remains possible that individuals are influenced to believe in global warming for other reasons, and subsequently are more open to explore related information. Thus in Study 2, we seek to establish causality by systematically manipulating whether participants learn about the process or not. We predict that those learning about the process should show better understanding and higher levels of belief in global warming.

In addition, a recent Gallup poll (2014) suggested that 84% of Americans self-report that they understand global warming either very well (33%) or fairly well (51%). Importantly, those that said they understood it very well were the least likely to believe humans are the cause. Although the Gallup question was ambiguous in regard to what exactly “understanding global warming” means, we sought to test the extent to which process familiarity corresponded with understanding of global warming. In addition, we wanted to explore whether that alone predicts belief in global warming, or if objective understanding following illumination of the process can.
Study 2

Method

100 participants (59 female, Mage = 18.0) were recruited through a large, Canadian University’s participant pool to watch a video that explained the underlying process of the greenhouse (process-based) effect or a video that presented the correlation between increased emissions, subsequent warming, and the disastrous effects that it could cause (statistics-based). Prior to watching the video, participants were asked whether they were familiar with the underlying effect of the greenhouse effect (1 = not at all familiar, 7 = very familiar) and then asked if they agree with the statement that humans are, at least in part, responsible for global warming (1 = strongly disagree, 7 = strongly agree). As in Study 1, participants were then asked to describe what they thought the underlying process was (e.g. the greenhouse effect), and as in Study 1, raters coded the response again from 1 (no understanding) to 5 (excellent understanding), inter-rater correlation, \( r(98) = .81, p < .01 \). Participants then watched either the statistics-based or process-based video, followed by being immediately asked again to describe the underlying process of global warming (inter-rater correlation \( r(98) = .67 \)). Lastly, participants were asked again if humans were responsible for global warming. In order to reduce demand characteristics and concerns of consistency biases, the question was slightly modified to ask whether they believed that humans are, at least in part, responsible for global warming and changed to a 5-point scale, (anchored from 1 = not at all to 5 = completely).

Results

Consistent with Study 1, results reveal that understanding the greenhouse effect is correlated with belief in global warming \( (r(98) = .30, p = .003) \). Subjective responses of familiarity with the greenhouse effect were correlated with actual understanding, \( (r(98) = .37, p < .001) \). However, regression analyses including both coded understanding and self-reported familiarity revealed that understanding remained predictive, \( (\beta = .26, p = .01) \), while self-reported familiarity was only marginally predictive \( (\beta = .19, p = .07) \). Individuals in our sample generally in agreed that humans were at least, in part, responsible for global warming \( (M = 6.17, SD = 1.01) \), but still encompassed the full range of responses. Additionally, participants on average had a modest understanding of the greenhouse effect at Time 1 \( (M = 2.63, SD = 1.20) \).

Next, we assessed if our manipulation in fact changed an individual’s understanding of the underlying process of global warming. A difference score was computed, subtracting the individual’s initial coded score from their score after the video. A t-test confirmed the effect of video condition on understanding change \( t(98) = 5.31, p < .001 \), with individuals in the process condition showing greater change \( (M = 1.38, SD = 1.01) \) than those in the statistics condition \( (M = .47, SD = .90) \). Assessing the effect of the video condition and consistent with our expectations, we found that belief in global warming was greater \( (M = 4.08, SD = .67) \) after the process video, compared to watching the statistics video \( (M = 3.71, SD = .86) \). \( t(98) = 2.44, p = .017 \).

This finding also holds when controlling for initial belief \( F(1,97) = 6.99, p = .01 \). These results are qualified by an interaction with understanding of process at Time 1, \( F(1,95) = 5.75, p = .02 \). Examining the interaction at +/- 1 SD, we find that the effect is driven by those who were low on understanding the process at Time 1: \( r(98) = 3.61, p < .001 \). When individuals were low in understanding, they were more likely to believe in global warming after the process video \( (M = 4.01) \) compared to the statistics video \( (M = 3.27) \). As expected, there was no difference in the process-based vs. the statistics based videos \( (M = 4.16 vs. M = 4.11) \) for those who already had a relatively (+ 1 SD) high understanding \( t(97) = .230, p = .80 \) (See Figure 1). The results also hold while controlling for initial belief, \( F(1,94) = 7.36, p = .008 \).

Lastly, we assessed the mediating effect of understanding change on belief change. We used the PROCESS macro to conduct a mediation analysis (Hayes, 2013; Model 4), with a bootstrapping procedure (5,000 resamples) to construct bias-corrected confidence intervals. The bootstrapping procedure showed that, as predicted, understanding change significantly mediated the main effect \( (\beta = .19, SE = .11, 95\% \text{ CI} = .03, .39) \). That is, the video increased participants understanding of the greenhouse effect which in turn resulted in greater belief in global warming.

Discussion

The results of Study 2 provide experimental evidence supporting the hypothesis that persuasion efforts focused on understanding the process is a productive means of increasing belief in global warming. This effect is particularly robust for individuals who have a poor understanding of the greenhouse gas effect, importantly suggesting this technique is most persuasive for those who are the most difficult to convince. In a public policy environment where practitioners are increasingly pessimistic about the state of global warming belief in the U.S., these results suggest optimism may be warranted in regard to the potential for public opinion to change.

\(^A\)Levene’s test revealed significant variance between the two conditions \( F(1,99) = 4.77, p = .03 \). However, correcting for this assumption did not change the result \( t(83.3) = 5.27, p < .001 \).

\(^B\)Levene’s test revealed significant variance between the two conditions \( F(1,99) = 7.36, p = .008 \). However, correcting for this assumption did not change the result \( t(94.3) = 2.45, p = .016 \).
change if persuasive techniques are correctly chosen and implemented.

General Discussion
The results of two studies demonstrate that understanding the process of global warming (e.g. the greenhouse gas effect) results in greater belief in global warming. The present research is notably in contrast to other findings which have found little, no, or even a reverse effect of general scientific and numeric literacy on belief in global warming. Further, this research demonstrates that learning specific knowledge of the underlying process is an effective way to change attitudes. The studies also demonstrate that learning this type of specific knowledge can be easily implemented using a short video, making it ideal for social marketers looking to tackle disappointing rates of belief in global warming. Importantly, the findings in this study are simple and easily applicable to existing social marketing strategies, and potentially applicable to other important public policy problems suffering from misinformation, such as low vaccination rates.

Limitations and Future Directions
While the results provide strong evidence for the role understanding the process plays in global warming belief, it is likely that some individuals will still refute and dismiss the effect. Indeed, the climate scientists who are not convinced by anthropogenic global warming are almost certainly aware of the greenhouse gas effect but are able to argue the counter position with evidence generated by different models or data. Similarly, some consumers may be able to dismiss the greenhouse effect with other rationalizations (e.g. human emissions make up a tiny percentage of total natural emissions). However, perfect agreement on the causes and outcomes of global warming is not necessary: given the split public opinion of U.S. consumers on global warming, any movement in public opinion may be the difference between an effective mitigation strategy and long-term cataclysm. While there may exist some important boundary conditions, these results provide an important avenue for global warming persuasion.

Secondly, the results of Study 2 took place in an experimental setting. While participants were not forced to watch the video, the expectation was that they should. Subsequently, there was likely greater motivation to watch a video on global warming than would exist on average, although not all participants still did. Individuals typically selectively ignore information that does not coincide with their worldview (Adamic and Glance 2005; Iyengar and Han, 2009) and thus may be less likely to pay attention to marketing efforts inconsistent with their beliefs. However, the process underlying global-warming is uncontested and less politically-charged. Thus, consumers will likely not feel as threatened by this information and instead may be motivated to form a worldview more supported by science (Chaiken et al., 1989). Examining how consumers react to these messages in a real-world setting provides a fruitful avenue for future research.

Theoretical Contributions
The present research provides an important perspective on influencing attitude change.

When focusing on pro-social attitudinal and behavioral changes, much of the impactful contemporary research focuses on automatic/implicit implementations (Goldstein et al. 2008; Peloza et al. 2013; Thaler and Sunstein 2008). However, implicit interventions are unlikely to affect views on global warming with the same effectiveness as they are at spurring the re-use of towels or sustainable consumption of coffee. Because global warming has become such a politically contentious issue, belief in global warming requires a more explicit intervention capable of not just changing an implicit behavior, but instead reversing a belief and attitude at the conscious level. In the present research, we demonstrate the effectiveness of a process-explanation by avoiding the political meaning altogether, and instead explain the underlying apolitical and non-disputable process, proving to be an effective explicit intervention for global warming deniers independent of individual educational or demographic differences. In addition, through focusing on process explanations, individuals appear to be more receptive to information and are more likely to integrate the information into their cognitive schema.

Public Policy Implications
No problem in contemporary public policy poses the potential threat that global warming does. Global warming is fundamentally a new category of problem, combining a distant temporal horizon, outcome uncertainty, and imperfect solutions requiring costs from current taxpayers who are likely to be deceased before any benefits are even accrued (Gardiner 2011). Further, politically, global warming policy carries with it explicit incentives to shirk: at the international level, it creates trade disadvantages; at the national level, it weakens one state or province economically relative to another; and at the individual level, there are considerable tangible and intangible transaction costs to changing lifestyles (Stern 2009; Gardiner 2011; IPCC 2014).

Conclusion
In the short and medium-term, the collective action required to solve global warming is counteracted by economic disincentives at both the individual and institutional level.
Importantly, meaningful public policy is unlikely without increasing belief in global warming. Because institutions and individuals suffer disincentives to act, any action taken is dependent on collective action driven by this belief. Consistent with this, the present research aims to give policymakers a new weapon waiting in the wings against apathy, indifference, and ignorance: process-based persuasion.

**References**


Using Problem Recognition Branding to Increase Awareness of Climate Change

William D. Diamond, University of Massachusetts Amherst

Keywords: climate change, persuasive communication, branding, attitude change

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Questions
While many Americans are by the prospect of climate change (Myers et al. 2013), behavioral researchers have difficulty developing approaches to others (Leiserowitz 2007). One approach to this is to determine the signaling potential (Slovic, Lichtenstein, and Fischhoff 1984) of different climate related events. We hypothesized that respondents in these studies would perceive global events—rises in ocean temperature, melting of the polar ice caps—as more important signals of climate change than local events such as storms or changes in local temperature or precipitation. We hoped to increase the signaling value of the local consequences of climate change through communication—in this case, branding.

While “problem recognition branding” appears to be a new term, the practice is not new. “Problem recognition brands” comprise signs of stroke, cyberbullying, suicide and many other problems. We define a problem recognition brand as a logo and a list of warning signs associated with a specific problem. Sometimes the logo and a list of the warning signs are associated with a specific organization. We therefore hypothesized that problem recognition branding can be useful in tying local weather events to the global problem of climate change. To study these questions, we conducted three studies.

Method and Data

Study 1: The Signaling Value of Climate Change Events
Based on the literature on climate change (Schneider 2014; IPCC 2015), we chose 15 climate-related events. Participants rated each event on the degree that it appeared to be a sign of climate change, whether they thought the event was occurring, and the degree to which they thought the event was abstract and could only be detected by scientists.

Study 2: The effects of the South Carolina Floods
On October 4, 2015 New York Times (Fausset and Blinder 2015), “flooding from days of relentless, saturating rains paralyzed much of South Carolina.” On October 5, we ran the same survey to determine whether the effects of a catastrophic weather event would affect responses to this survey.

Study 3: Using Problem Recognition Branding to Link Weather Events and Climate Change
A very strong branding manipulation was developed to see whether specific climate events (particularly severe storms) could be connected to climate change. All of the elements of “problem recognition branding” were included in this manipulation. There was a strong logo, the slogan, and a list of the signs of climate change.

Summary of Findings

Study 1: Factor analysis of participants’ ratings of climate related events demonstrated that these events can be classified into two groups. The first can be thought of as global events. The second can be thought of as local events. Respondents thought that global events were more likely to be happening and were signals of climate change. Yet, these events were seen to be less comprehensible than local events—respondents were more likely to think that only a scientist could recognize them.

Study 2: Any positive results obtained in this study could have an alternative explanation—the Pope’s visit to the United States in late September 2015. During this time, he spoke about the importance of climate change. However, our fears were allayed because we failed to find significant differences changes between September and early October despite the catastrophic flooding in South Carolina and the Pope’s visit.

For further information contact: William D. Diamond, Associate Professor, Marketing Department, Isenberg School of Management, University of Massachusetts Amherst (diamond@isenberg.umass.edu).
Study 3: The third study supported Hypothesis 2 by providing preliminary evidence that problem recognition branding can facilitate awareness of local climate change events. Exposure to problem recognition branding increased the degree to which “Severe Storms” and “Strange Weather” act as signals of Climate Change.

Key Contributions
There has been much concern about the “intractable” aspects of the climate-change problem. For many, the distance to the people affected, the signs of the problem are far away, and the time before the consequences seems long. People who are not concerned about climate change are difficult to convince. A goal of the research was to learn how to help people convince themselves by tying their experience of local events to climate change.

The first study demonstrated that people perceive two groups of events that might be related to climate change. The first, global events, are the most connected to climate change in people’s minds. They also are the most likely to be perceived as happening in the present or near future. Unfortunately, they are more likely to be seen to be the types of events that only scientists can recognize.

The second study reported here provided evidence that weather events—even catastrophic events, such as the flooding in South Carolina—are not readily connected to climate change.

Finally, the third study provided a preliminary indication that advertisements using problem recognition branding can help to strengthen the signaling potential of severe local weather events in the United States.

References are available on request.
Social Labeling as a Motivator to Preadolescents’ Proenvironmental Behaviors: Theoretical Explanation to the Moderating Effect of Age Through Self-Concept Clarity

Karine Charry, Iéseg School of Management (LEM CNRS 9221)  
Béatrice Parguel, CNRS (UMR CNRS 7088), Université de Paris–Dauphine  
Julien Bourjot, Université Cergy Pontoise and Paris School of Business

Keywords: social labeling, children, self-concept clarity, pro-environmental behavior

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
With this research, we want to confirm that the social labeling technique is an effective persuasion tactic among preadolescents. More specifically, we want to demonstrate that it may influence pre-adolescents’ pro-environmental behaviors, an objective that has never been achieved in pro-social domains. Our theoretical objective is to provide evidence that self-concept clarity represents the theoretical explanation sustaining preadolescents’ subsequent pro-environmental behaviors.

Method and Data
To test our hypotheses, we conducted an experiment on 78 Belgian preadolescents (mean age: 9 ½ years). The between-subjects design was conducted in 3 phases, over a period of three weeks.

Summary of Findings
First, we show that preadolescents labeled as “pro-environmental” did select more environmentally friendly products than their non-labeled counterparts. We also prove that this may be achieve through a very frugal and simple procedure. Second, we provide evidence that achieving a level of self-concept clarity is essential for social labeling to be effective. We therefore demonstrate that the proposition according to which self-concept is the theory driving the persuasion phenomenon, as suggested many years ago but never empirically proven is correct.

Key Contributions
With this study, we contribute to fundamental research in marketing by providing empirical evidence to the theory proposed in the 1980s—but never demonstrated—and according to which self-concept clarity is the necessary condition to social labeling effectiveness. Individuals (and namely children) must own a clear self-concept if labels are to modify behaviors.

We also propose pragmatic contributions to entities involved in the promotion of pro-social behaviors. Labeling preadolescents by merely stressing their “pro-environmental” attitudes during personal contact or through devices that they enjoy (such as advergames), is indeed a very easy and potentially costless procedure to apply. Although all persuasion techniques addressing preadolescents should be considered attentively by public policy makers, this frugal procedure and its prosocial objectives, already applied in everyday life by parents and teachers, will probably be supported by the stakeholders.

References are available on request.

For further information contact: Karine Charry, Associate Professor, Iéseg School of Management (k.charry@ieseg.fr).
Collaborative consumption encompasses “systems of organized sharing, bartering, lending, trading, renting, gifting, and swapping across communities of peers” (Botsman and Rogers 2010). Amongst this wide panel of practices, activities associated to “redistribution markets” (Botsman and Rogers 2010), defined as the exchange of “used or pre-owned goods moving from somewhere they are not needed to somewhere they are” (for free or with compensation), are the most common practice. Old practice per se as it used to be done through garage sale, second-order outlets, “redistribution markets” have gained momentum with the development of Web-based second-hand peer-to-peer (P2P) platforms (e.g. Craig’s list or Ebay in the U.S., Le Bon coin in France). As an illustration, in 2014, three out of four French people have already bought something on a second-hand P2P platform.¹

These secondhand P2P platforms are seen as encouraging sustainable consumption as they offer second life to products, avoiding to latter to be stored in some place, meanwhile other households would buy new items. Sustainability is the first or second motive for 30% of consumers using these platforms after economic ones (i.e. making savings or earn money).² Environmentally conscious consumers are actually more convinced about the virtues of collaborative consumption¹. However, the question of the positive environmental impact of second-hand P2P platforms is still to be proved. Several authors (Thomas 2003; Robert et al. 2014) tend to argue that they could also stimulate overconsumption through rebound effects: consumers buying more products or renewing them more often because they will be able to sell them out if useless or sell their previous version; consumers buying more items because of price’s attractiveness even if these items are not necessary; or indirect overconsumption through expenses made with the savings done with second-hand buying.

Research Question

The present research aims at understanding the mechanism leading to overconsumption on second-hand P2P platforms, and assessing if these mechanisms are attenuated for environmentally conscious consumers (as they are more motivated to preserve the environment) or enhanced because giving a second-life to products reassures their behavior. We draw on the theory of self-licensing (de Witt Huberts et al. 2012). This


²Credoc, 2014, “Conditions de vie et Aspirations.”
theory states that people are more likely to adopt hedonic behaviors when the decision context offers justifications for their indulgent behaviors. Therefore, we suppose that the effect of materialism on impulse buying is higher for highly environmentally conscious consumers than for consumers that are less environmentally conscious. We also suppose that impulse buying is a mediator between consumer’s materialism and overconsumption behaviors (buying more in quantity, buying unnecessary products), this mediation being moderated by consumers’ environmental consciousness.

**Method and Data**

To test this conceptual framework, we administered a survey in July 2015 to a French representative panel of 541 buyers of Le Bon coin, the main second-hand platform in France (also the sixth most visited Website in France). Respondents had to report the number of items bought during the previous 12 months on the Website. The Website influence in terms of overconsumption was measured using 7 ad hoc items (e.g. “Since I bought on LeBonCoin.fr, I more often buy things that I would not have bought otherwise…. I have less remorse associated with the purchase of products that I do not actually need”). Impulse buying on the Website was measured using a scale adapted from Bressolles and colleagues (2007). Respondents also answered individual questions regarding their materialism (3 facets of centrality, happiness, and success) and environmental consciousness. Respondents’ age, gender, price sensitivity, and experience on the platform were integrated as covariates in the analyses.

**Summary of Findings**

Results validate the hypothesis. As expected, the 3 facets of materialism have a positive influence on impulse buying, and this influence is stronger for environmentally conscious consumers. Furthermore, materialism influences overconsumption behavior (buying more in quantity, buying unnecessary products) through impulse buying. This mediation is moderated by environmental consciousness in 5 out of 6 of the tested models, such that highly conscious consumers are more inclined to follow this route.

**Key Contributions**

The present research has important implications as it sheds light on the dark side of second-hand P2P platforms, confirming suspicion of reinforcing over-consumption, specifically amongst “green consumers,” because the “second-life” aspect of this form of consumption relieves the contradiction between motives of materialism and preservation of the environment. Further research should deepen the explanation of the phenomenon, testing variables linked to self-licensing and ruling out other explanations.

*References are available on request.*
Cause-Related Marketing Literacy

Anne Hamby, Hofstra University
David Brinberg, Virginia Tech

Keywords: cause-related marketing, literacy, promotions

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
What are the aspects of literacy in the context of Cause-Related Marketing (CRM), and what are conditions under which CRM literacy affects consumers' interpretation of and response to CRM promotions?

Method and Data
We conducted pilot work through interviews with 20 academic and practitioner experts, 40 university students, and 20 MTurk (participants in an online consumer panel) to identify specific features of CRM content and critical knowledge. We then conducted several scale development studies, followed by experimental studies, with MTurk participants.

Key Contributions
From an academic perspective, the current work develops a measure of CRM literacy, conditions under which this construct predicts consumer response to CRM promotions, and how this construct relates to a broader model of response to CRM promotions.

For marketing managers, the current work suggests CRM literate consumers are not uniformly skeptical about such promotions; under some circumstances, they are more willing to support a CRM promotion than lower-literate consumers, which may make them an attractive group to target with relevant promotions. Literacy level can serve as a relevant customer segmentation variable, guiding what elements of promotions should be emphasized. Further, this work highlights aspects of promotions that consumers are most likely to consider when evaluating CRM promotions.

Finally, the current work provides insights for regulatory bodies, providing insights into conditions under which even high CRM literate consumers make false assumptions, which can guide policy about information disclosure in CRM promotion copy.

Summary of Findings
In the current work, we define the construct of CRM literacy and develop an instrument to measure this construct. We then demonstrate this construct is distinct from and predicts relevant outcomes beyond other related constructs. Finally, we explore conditions under which CRM literacy affects a consumer’s interpretation of and response to CRM promotions through two experiments.

The first study explores how variation in CRM literacy influences the relationship between promotional and contextual factors and a consumer’s response. Specifically, we manipulated donation amount and the decision context (i.e., a planned or unplanned purchase) to observe whether CRM literacy affects the relationships between these manipulated factors and persuasion-related outcome variables, finding that high CRM literate consumers are more favorably oriented towards a CRM promotion when the donation amount is higher, and the considered purchase is planned. Lower-CRM literate consumers are less sensitive to variation on these facets.

In the second study, we test a more comprehensive model of consumer response to CRM promotions, with additional promotion variables (donation cap, duration length). We find higher CRM literate consumers again respond more favorably when promotion elements provide a high benefit to the nonprofit. However, when information about promotion attributes is not present, consumers assume the CRM promotion is fair or cause-beneficial regardless of literacy level, highlighting an area of consumer vulnerability.

References available on request.
The Motivation Potential Scale: Integrating Goal Theory into Medication Adherence Prediction

Richard J. Vann, University of Wyoming
Kem P. Krueger, University of Wyoming

Keywords: health behavior, medication adherence, diabetes, goal theory, motivation

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Current socio-cognitive approaches to predicting medication adherence such as the belief in medicines questionnaire (BMQ) struggle to consistently predict when patients will cease taking their medications as directed. This work presents the motivation potential (MP) scale and its two subscales as an alternative approach to predicting medication adherence, remedying theoretical and practical shortcomings of existing measures. The MP scale measures a patient’s motivation for the specific behavior of taking medication exactly as directed by a health care provider through desirability (MPD subscale) and feasibility (MPF subscale) evaluations of this behavior. In a study with diabetic patients, the present work develops, refines, and validates the MP scale for use as a tool in predicting medication adherence.

Research Question

Addressing limitations in adherence prediction, the present work benchmarks the predictive effectiveness of the motivation potential (MP) scale against the belief in medicines questionnaire (Horne et al. 1999) for diabetic patients. Informed by contemporary goal theory (Fishbach et al. 2009) and expectancy-value frameworks (Brehm et al. 1983), this study tested whether the MP scale parsimoniously captures much of the variance in related motivational models. Moreover, it serves as a starting point for assessing the MP scale as a clinical tool for health care providers to directly assess adherence motivation in their patients. Combining a more motivationally-sensitive level of measurement and a streamlined approach to constructs, the MP scale was expected to display valid, reliable psychometric properties while outperforming the belief in medicines questionnaire (BMQ) in predicting medication adherence, laying the groundwork for developing and executing novel, theoretically-informed interventions that surpass the effectiveness of current approaches (Krueger et al. 2005).

Method and Data

A study of diabetic patients taking medication to treat their condition was conducted to develop and validate the motivation potential (MP) scale. The diabetes epidemic increasingly stands out as one of the largest public health challenges of our time (McKinlay and Marceau 2000). Medication adherence directly affects health outcomes for diabetic patients (Pladevall et al. 2004), making it an ideal context to develop and validate the motivation potential (MP) scale. Through a combination of exploratory factor analysis, reliability analysis, confirmatory factor analysis, and hierarchical linear regression, this study provides initial evidence of the MP scale’s convergent, discriminant, and predictive validity. Participants in the study were 475 (229 female; \( M_{age} = 37.26 \); range: 18-76; 46.7% married; 77% Caucasian; 50.5% with household income < $45k) diabetic patients recruited from an online panel. On average, participants had been treated for diabetes for 5.38 years with 50.5% insulin dependent. The survey instrument given to participants consisted of a series of screening/demographic questions, the belief in medicines questionnaire (Horne et al. 1999), twenty possible motivation potential scale items, a measure of goal commitment (Hollenbeck et al. 1989), and a measure of self-reported medication adherence (Horne et al. 1999).

Summary of Findings

This study provided initial evidence supportive of the motivation potential scale, refined to two three-item subscales, as
a valid instrument capable of improved adherence prediction. From a measurement perspective, the two subscales, desirability and feasibility, demonstrated excellent convergent validity and acceptable discriminant/criterion validity in their relationships with related constructs such as commitment and the four BMQ subscales. Building towards support for predictive validity and utility, the MPD and MPF subscales accounted for a substantial portion of the variance in self-reported adherence ($r^2 = .27$) when compared to substantially lengthier BMQ subscales ($r^2 = .18$). In its most stringent test, the BMQ subscales also predicted medication adherence variance even when controlling for the four BMQ subscales (which drop to non-significance) and an extensive set of socio-demographic and health-related factors.

**Key Contributions**

Consistently predicting medication adherence remains an elusive first step in the chain of knowledge upon which effective interventions can be built. The refined, six-item motivation potential (MP) scale matches the benefits of improved prediction with reduced response burden for patients. Taking the findings into account, the two motivation potential subscales demonstrate comparatively robust ability to predict total and unique variance in self-reported medication adherence. Starting in the context of diabetic patients and their medication adherence, the stage is set for future studies that generalize the validity and effectiveness of the motivation potential scale in predicting medication adherence and other health behaviors across medical conditions. Integrating theory and pressing needs of health care practice, the motivation potential scale offers a new direction forward for transforming understanding and prediction of patient adherence (Scammon et al. 2011).

*References are available on request.*
How Social Influence Can Hinder Goal Pursuit

Deidre Popovich, Texas Tech University
Zoey Chen, University of Miami

Keywords: social influence, goal pursuit, motivation, dishonesty

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
Society is filled with examples of the purported benefits of pursuing goals in a group setting. Contrary to the conventional wisdom, this research examines the effect of social influence on goal progress and proposes that there are times when pursuing goals in a social context may have negative consequences such as lower motivation and increased dishonesty. When social influence and personal motivation differ, certain people can become more focused on the social aspects of their goals, and this may take focus away from their own individual progress. We seek to extend prior research findings that social goal pursuit can be beneficial for the initiation of goals. We explore when people may tend to be more likely to focus on others’ progress in a social goal context, and whether this can eventually lessen motivation to sustain one’s own motivation and lead to increased dishonesty. We are particularly interested in the effects of social influence on those goal seekers who crave social feedback and are more externally, rather than internally, regulated in their behaviors. It is important to examine a more nuanced explanation for successful goal pursuit because our intuition to most often advocate the benefits of pursuing goals in a social setting may be incomplete.

Method and Data
In the first study, weekly weight loss data was collected from the third season of the popular television show, The Biggest Loser. In this season, 16 participants worked toward their weight-loss goal in a social context (i.e., on The Biggest Loser ranch), while 36 participants worked on the same goal at home in a more individual, self-directed, setting (i.e., at home).

Next, we turned to a series of experiments. Study 2 explored how likely it would be for externally regulated individuals to persist with a social goal. It makes intuitive sense that people who are more externally regulated would reap the most benefit from working toward a social goal. However, in order to sustain motivation despite social comparisons, people who are internally regulated may benefit more since they generally have more self-efficacy. Study 3 examined whether the relationship between regulation and motivation is mediated by confidence, since internally regulated individuals tend to demonstrate more competence in their ability to continue with a goal. Study 4 examined whether people who are more externally regulated would also be more likely to be dishonest about reporting their progress, since they are predicted to feel the need to temporarily self-enhance through dishonesty, in order to boost their confidence.

Summary of Findings
The first study revealed that the starting weight of participants at home and on the ranch did not differ significantly. An AR(1) model revealed a significant location by week interaction, which suggests that there was a different rate of weight loss between the home and ranch participants across time. On average, participants on the ranch lost weight more quickly during the first few weeks, while participants at home lost weight more quickly during later weeks.

The results of study 2 showed a significant two-way interaction between external regulation and condition such that people who were high in external regulation and condition such that people who were high in external regulation and condition such that people who were high in external regulation and condition such that people who were high in external regulation were more motivated in the condition with friends. Study 3 showed that confidence significantly mediated the relationship between internal regulation and continued motivation. The results of study 4 indicated that people who were high in external regulation were more likely to be dishonest about their progress in the condition with strangers.

For further information contact: Deidre Popovich, Assistant Professor of Marketing, Rawls College of Business, Texas Tech University (deidre.popovich@ttu.edu).
Key Contributions
This research helps provide a more nuanced view as to whether and when individuals may be more likely to benefit from social comparisons when engaging in goal pursuit behaviors. These studies use self-set goals and incorporate both individual variables and situational factors to examine how these can work together in promoting or prohibiting motivation. Prior research has demonstrated that social support can help facilitate initial motivation to pursue a goal (e.g., Fitzsimons and Bargh 2003). These studies provide a complementary view by examining when the potential downsides of social goal pursuit are more likely to occur.

These studies also demonstrate a link between decreased motivation over time and increased propensity for dishonesty in recording one’s goal progress. While previous research has examined dishonesty in other contexts (e.g., Gino, Ayal, and Ariely 2009, Mazar, Amir, and Ariely 2008, Shalvi et al. 2011), the novel findings of these studies demonstrate the relationship between goal pursuit and dishonesty, as moderated by regulation. If individuals can easily lie to themselves about their goal progress, then such behavior could quickly derail their plans to actually pursue the goal.

References are available on request.
Understanding Public Service Announcement Receptivity and Behavioral Change Using Bayes Net Drivers Analysis

Robert A. Petrin, Ipsos Public Affairs
Meghana Raja, Ipsos Public Affairs
Sheri Klein, Ad Council
Daniel Bartolo, Ad Council

Keywords: methodology, drivers analysis, public service announcements, evaluating communications campaigns

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Linear regression and logistic regression are common drivers analysis methods used to assess impact and evaluate consumer journeys in behavioral change campaigns. These methods, as well as structural equation models and other types of generalized linear models (GLMs), have three common flaws: (1) they only allow researchers to assess the impact of altering the level of a single driver on the dependent variable “holding all other drivers constant”; (2) they assume researchers reasonably understand the predictive or causal structure related to targeted behavior/outcome measure, and (3) they ultimately only allow the evaluation of correlational, rather than causal relationships. In reality, however, the drivers of attitudinal and behavioral change are highly correlated. Thus it is unlikely in the real world that one could alter the level of one driver without changing the value of other drivers. Furthermore, the phenomena underlying behavioral change are generally complex, and the associated causal structures are difficult to identify using regression or related methodologies.

Bayes nets (e.g., Hastie et al., 2001; Koski and Noble, 2009) offers an approach for surmounting these challenges and assessing the total impact of a set of drivers on behavioral change campaigns outcomes. They also allow researchers to better identify the causal structure beneath a set of drivers and campaign outcomes, thus clarifying the pathways underlying behavioral and attitudinal change. Bayes nets, however, typically suffer from challenges resulting from sparse data and needing to incorporate sample survey designs. Ipsos has developed two important modifications of the traditional Bayes net methods which address these flaws and allow Bayes net drivers analyses to develop richer, population-valid models of consumer receptivity and behavioral change. The resulting outputs are easy to interpret, and accessible to a wide range of audiences throughout social and public policy research.

This paper will present a conceptual overview of Bayes net methodology, as well as Ipsos’s adaptations of this methodology to public sector research, and market research more broadly. This overview will be followed by an extended empirical example which applies Bayes nets to the analysis of key drivers of behavioral change in public service announcement campaigns, using selected campaigns from the Ad Council’s continuous tracking study of over 25 active PSA campaigns. Bayes net results will be compared with those obtained from conventional structural equation models and other drivers analyses methodologies to highlight differences—and payoffs—between Bayes nets and other methodologies.

References are available on request.
Competitiveness in Retirement Planning: Whoever Dies with the Most Toys, Wins

Kristin A. Scott, Minnesota State University
S. Todd Weaver, Point University

Keywords: retirement planning, competitiveness, tightwadism, gambling propensity, technological innovativeness

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
Because of the lack of research on retirement planning, this research investigates another possible influence on retirement planning that could be useful to consumers and policy makers—competitiveness. Recent research suggests that activating a competitive orientation through resource scarcity guides consumers’ decision making towards advancing their own welfare (Roux, Goldsmith, and Bonezzi 2015). Thus, it may be beneficial for people to have a competitive orientation towards retirement planning because it activates decision making to advance their own welfare. However, it is also possible that competitiveness could be detrimental to retirement preparedness if the competitive context involves consumption spending rather than saving. There is very little research on the influence of competitiveness on consumer behavior in general (Mowen 2004) and on retirement planning in particular. In this research, we attempt to address this gap by investigating the relationship between competitiveness and retirement planning, both directly and indirectly via behaviors that may be beneficial to retirement planning (conserving money) and those that might be detrimental to retirement planning (leveraging money). We identify two conserving behaviors that could be beneficial to retirement planning: tightwadism and financial conservatism, and two leveraging behaviors that could be detrimental to retirement planning: gambling propensity and technological innovativeness.

Method and Data
To test the relationships between competitiveness and retirement planning, data were collected via an online survey. The sample was drawn from an online panel managed by Zoomerang. The sampling plan called for the selection of a nationally-representative sample based on U.S. census data. The five-page survey was sent out to respondents on two different occasions to obtain the minimal sample requested of 400 respondents. Within five days of receiving the first invitation, 413 total respondents had completed the survey. Because one survey contained significant missing data, only 412 surveys were used for the analysis.

The data were analyzed using structural equation modeling with Lisrel 9.2. First, all scales were analyzed with confirmatory factor analysis (CFA). Hu and Bentler’s (1999) combination rule was used to determine adequate fit. To test the hypotheses, a model was run in which financial conservatism, tightwadism, gambling propensity, and technological innovativeness partially mediated the relationship between competitiveness and retirement planning.

Summary of Findings
In the first model, competitiveness was positively related to tightwadism, gambling propensity, and technological innovativeness. In addition, tightwadism was positively related to retirement propensity. Competitiveness was significantly negatively related to financial conservatism. Gambling propensity and technological innovativeness were positively related to retirement planning which was the opposite direction as predicted. Competitiveness was not significantly related to retirement planning and financial conservatism was not significantly related to retirement planning. Based on the results from this first model, a second model was run with three modifications. First, the path from competitiveness and retirement planning was removed because it was non-significant. Second, financial conservatism was removed from the model because it is not a part of the normological network for retirement planning (the path from financial conservatism to retirement planning was non-significant). Third, gambling propensity and technological innovativeness were positively related to retirement planning which was the opposite direction as predicted. Competitiveness was not significantly related to retirement planning and financial conservatism was not significantly related to retirement planning. Based on the results from this first model, a second model was run with three modifications. First, the path from competitiveness and retirement planning was removed because it was non-significant. Second, financial conservatism was removed from the model because it is not a part of the normological network for retirement planning (the path from financial conservatism to retirement planning was non-significant). Third, gambling propensity and technological innovativeness were positively related to retirement planning which was the opposite direction as predicted. Competitiveness was not significantly related to retirement planning and financial conservatism was not significantly related to retirement planning.
innovativeness were allowed to correlate because of their high correlation. Results showed that competitiveness was positively related to tightwadism, gambling propensity, and technological innovativeness. In addition, tightwadism, gambling propensity, and technological innovativeness were all significantly related to retirement planning. These results suggest that tightwadism, gambling propensity, and technological innovativeness fully mediate the relationship between competitiveness and retirement planning.

**Key Contributions**

Results indicated that competitiveness did not directly impact retirement planning, suggesting that it is not the general trait of competitiveness that affects retirement planning but rather being competitive in more situation-specific behaviors related to money. This result indicates that in terms of retirement planning, the general level of competitiveness is less important than competitiveness in money-related behaviors. Because tightwadism, gambling propensity, and technological innovativeness were all significantly and positively related to retirement planning, it appears that it doesn’t matter whether one is loose or tight with money (c.f., Tatzel 2002), what is important with retirement planning is that one is competitive with money. Although predicted, financial conservativism was not related to retirement planning. This is contradictory to much anecdotal evidence that those that play it safe with their money would be more likely to plan and invest in having a secure retirement.

Policy makers and companies could be encouraged to make retirement planning more of a competitive endeavor, where people are able to compete with their peers in terms of preparation for retirement. In keeping with the growing popularity of gaming, and especially online gaming, retirement planning could be “gamified” by awarding points or rewords for reaching particular benchmarks.

*References are available on request*

Veselina Milanova, University of St. Gallen
Peter Maas, University of St. Gallen

Keywords: decision delegation, consumer protection, consumer responsibility, financial decision making, decision regret

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
Consumer protection in insurance business is a challenging task for governments. Consumers do not always make decisions by themselves, but often delegate them to a third party (Aggarwal and Mazumdar 2008). As complex products, insurances require an advisor to explain and compare offers, which makes decision delegation a common phenomenon in the industry. Consumers are often not aware of the conflicts of interest under which advisors operate, in particular of remuneration conflicts, inherent to many intermediary business models (FCA 2014).

This study examines how decision delegation in an insurance context affects responsibility attributions and examines the public policy implications of delegation. Research on individual responsibility in case of delegation has been scarce and mainly in a medical context (Levinson et al. 2005). In contrast to other industries, responsibility for the insurance decision outcome is not transferred to the advisor together with the act of decision making but still remains at the hands of consumers. Due to this peculiarity of insurance decisions, the question arises whether consumers are aware of the separation between decision making and responsibility. To retrace whether and how much individual responsibility consumers feel when they delegating, we focus on the self-blame regret in unfavorable outcome scenarios.

Method and Data
An online study with 525 Swiss participants was carried out to better understand how consumers make insurance decisions. The study entailed a car insurance scenario with the option to delegate the insurance decision to an advisor. Upon the decision whether to delegate or not we manipulated the information participants received. The manipulation was a short TV report about online insurance policies being often cheaper than advisors’ offers and it aims at inducing anticipated regret in case of delegation or providing a reason to justify non-delegation. The report was randomly shown to half of the participants, the other half was directly presented with the choice. The unfavorable outcome scenario of the choice was the same for all participants and aimed at provoking regret feelings.

We first assessed the difference in delegation decisions between the groups with and without raised price awareness with an independent t-test. Then we applied a 2 (delegate: yes/no) x 2 (raised price awareness: yes/no) between-subjects design. Dependent variables were self-blame and bad outcome regret. We controlled for individual regret tendencies, locus of control, and balance of responsibility. A post-hoc descriptive discriminant analysis aimed at determining the contribution of individual variables to group separation (Borgen and Seling 1978).

Summary of Findings
The mere act of delegation changes the awareness of individual responsibility among consumers. Our empirical results suggest that decision delegation leads to less perceived individual responsibility as it becomes manifest in self-blame regret. Even the a priori awareness of the potentially higher costs associated with delegation does not change the result. In particular, we show that delegated deci-
sions lead to less self-blame regret in an unfavorable outcome situation compared with non-delegated decisions.

Most notably, if consumers use raised price awareness as a justification for self-made decisions, they tend to experience stronger regret in case of unfavorable outcome. The higher values of self-blame regret unequivocally point to a stronger attribution of individual responsibility. The evidence from this study suggests that delegating financial decisions impairs the perception of individual responsibility and thus may trigger less learning effects for future financial decisions. The anticipation of regret is often incorporated in the decision making process (Hetts, 2000, Connolly, 2013). Due to impaired responsibility attribution in a delegation situation, anticipated regret does not play a strong role in the decision making process and thus it cannot lead to improvement of its outcomes.

**Key Contributions**
Current discussions about intermediary regulations benefit from this research in different ways. It provides evidence of the impact of advisors on consumers’ perceived responsibility. While professional financial advice usually leads to better consumer decisions, remuneration conflicts of interest coupled with low consumer responsibility cannot lead to informed decisions. One solution is to focus on avoidance of such conflicts as the European Insurance and Occupational Pensions Authority currently envisions. Another is to raise consumers’ awareness of their responsibility for delegated decisions.

The findings suggest that the disclosure of price differences in the sense of distribution channel costs can lead to a shift in channel usage. The European directive on markets in financial instruments (MiFID 2) discusses disclosure as one form of managing conflicts of interest. If MiFID is to be applied for insurance markets as well, it may not achieve its original goal.

The impairment of individual responsibility has specific implications for financial literacy education. Research is equivocal whether financial advice serves as a substitute or complement for financial literacy. With potential for conflicts of interest, financial advice as a substitute for literacy can often end in mis-selling. Awareness for individual responsibility can be readily incorporated in financial education programs and additional decision aids.

*References are available on request.*
The Effects of Perceived Scarcity on Financial Decision Making

Laurel Aynne Cook, West Virginia University
Raika Sadeghein, West Virginia University

Keywords: financial decision-making, perceived scarcity, payday loans, financial literacy

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
Problems associated with poverty, such as limited savings or high amounts of debt, can become reinforced by behavioral responses to the environment. Consumers who address their short-term liquidity needs with payday loans may be especially vulnerable to specific situational factors. Limited financial resources, criticality (i.e., perceived importance of a particular condition), perceived consequences (i.e., perception of loss vs. gain), and reduced lending options may all interact to affect a consumer’s financial decision-making abilities. Moreover, this effect is likely to become less favorable for those consumers with existing or recent payday loans. The focus of this study is to test how dimensions of perceived financial scarcity vary in their effect on consumers’ borrowing, cost estimation, perceptions and behavioral outcomes. Of specific interest are the following research questions: (1) Will consumers over-borrow more under conditions of limited financial resources or when the need for money becomes critical? (2) How will other sources of financial scarcity (e.g., perceived consequences) influence borrowing? (3) Are consumers most vulnerable to over-borrowing when they are in a triple scarcity situation? (4) Will improvements in perceived financial scarcity have a positive impact on perceptions and behavioral outcomes for the most vulnerable group of consumers (i.e., current payday users)?

Method and Data
Study 1 was a 2 (Scarcity: low/high) x 2 (Criticality: low/high) x between-subjects design. Scarcity was manipulated through a scenario (e.g., “you are broke,” “you just got paid”) and criticality was manipulated in both cases with a visit to the dentist prompted by a root canal (high criticality) or a routine check-up (low criticality). Participants in this online experiment were 207 adult American consumers recruited through Amazon’s Mechanical Turk (mTurk). Cell sizes ranged between 49 and 54. Approximately half of the sample (n = 104) were current payday loan users.

Study 2 was a 2 (Frame: loss/gain) x 2 (Lending Options: present/absent) between-subjects design. Like the previous study, all participants were given a scenario describing the need for a payday loan. Framing was manipulated as a loss (e.g., “You are four months behind on payments and you now risk repossession”) or as a gain (e.g., “You want to lease a newer model to benefit from the additional features”). Lending options was manipulated as absent (e.g., “You have no other lending options”) or present (e.g., “You have other lending options”). Participants were 200 adult American consumers recruited on mTurk. Cell sizes ranged between 48 and 52.

Study 3 was a 2 (Scarcity: low/high) x 2 (Frame: loss/gain) x 2 (Lending Options: present/absent) between-subjects design. Scarcity was manipulated in the same manner as study 1. Framing and lending options were manipulated similar to study 2. Participants were 199 adult American consumers obtained using mTurk.

Summary of Findings
The criticality of a situation (e.g., needing money for a root canal versus a routine dental exam) does not negatively influence new payday users. Loan amounts and cost estimations remain relatively unaffected by these changes. However, current payday consumers’ perceptions and behavioral responses seem especially vulnerable to criticality. As the need for short-term liquidity (cash) increases, over-borrowing and cost misestimation increases as well. As expected, the effect becomes more severe (i.e., less favorable) under conditions of limited financial resources. Additionally, the
The presence of lending options is most helpful to new payday users while other aspects of the “triple scarcity effect,” such as framing (loss/gain), have significant consequences for current payday users. When these consumers need money to prevent a loss (e.g., car repossession), they over-borrow an average of $200 (40% more than the amount needed) and underestimate the cost by an average of $500!

**Key Contributions**

Improvements in understanding consumers’ financial decision making has significant implications for marketers and policy makers. In this study, we test how dimensions of perceived financial scarcity impact consumers’ borrowing, cost estimations, perceptions, and behavioral outcomes across three experimental studies. Although research investigating the underlying psychological mechanisms in over-borrowing is limited, the present research provides evidence that consumers make objectively better decisions when their perceptions of financial scarcity are reduced. Across three studies, results illustrate changes in the “triple scarcity effect” that have important implications for consumers. Moreover improvements in financial decision-making are most notable for consumers who are especially vulnerable to situational changes (current payday consumers).

*References are available on request.*
Assessing the Impact of Intervention Policies in Africa’s Inclusive Finance Programs: How Financial Services Generate Trust and Long-Term Savings Behavior of Rural Entrepreneurs in Ghana

Charlene A. Dadzie, University of North Texas
Kofi Q. Dadzie, Georgia State University
Evelyn Winston, Clark Atlanta University

Keywords: customer trust, service quality, savings behavior, inclusive finance programs in Ghana

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Questions
In many sub-Saharan African countries, policy makers face the formidable marketing challenge of how to encourage the small-scale entrepreneurs to use formal financial services on a habitual basis so that their aggregate income can be mobilized for funding development programs and poverty alleviation or inclusive growth goals (vonPischke, Adams, and Donald 1983; Dadzie et al. 2013; Miracle, Miracle, and Cohen 1980). The challenge comes in a large part from potential resistance from embedded social beliefs and banking attitudes that often lead to lack of trust in formal financial services (Dadzie, Akaah, and Dunson 1988). Based on the evolution of intervention policies in Ghana’s bank expansion programs, the current study investigates the following three research questions:

1. What is the level of penetration of formal financial services under various inclusive finance intervention policies in low income economies such as Ghana?

2. How has the penetration of formal financial services been influenced by socially-embedded beliefs and to what extent do these service generate customer trust?

3. What are the relative influences of customer trust and the penetration of financial services on the attainment of inclusive growth goals such as increasing access to affordable financial services and savings habitual behavior among subsistence entrepreneurs who need financial service the most?

Methods and Data Used
We conducted several field surveys in 2015 (360) in the cocoa producing regions of Ghana that we previously surveyed in 2014 (350), and 1995 (2,023). The surveys were preceded by long interviews that identified attitudes and socially-embedded reasons for using and not using formal financial services for savings, credit or business transactions. The field survey was led by two of the current authors. The present study is based on the savings data set to provide a comparative analysis of the service and customer trust impact on savings habits under the current market-led intervention policies (2014/2015 data) versus state intervention policies (the 1995 data). Most of the respondents were cocoa farm entrepreneurs (70% in 2014 and 65% in 1995). Approximately one-third of the entrepreneurs lived below the national poverty threshold in 1995 (39%) and in 2014 (32%).

Summary of Findings
Among the key findings pertaining to the research questions is that there had been dramatic increases in the penetration

For further information contact: Charlene A. Dadzie, doctoral candidate, Department of Marketing and Logistics, University of North Texas, Denton, Texas (cdadzie@gmail.com).
of formal financial services among subsistence entrepreneurs under the current market-driven intervention policies over the previous state intervention regime.

Second, we show that the level of customer trust had also increased considerably for two components of trust, including ability trust (from 3.20 to 4.30) and credibility trust (from 3.1 to 3.8), but remained nearly the same for benevolence trust (from 2.20 to 2.30).

A final study finding is the pervasive positive influence of social beliefs on most service quality experiences which, in turn, were associated with all the components of customer trust including a positive association with service acceptability (β = .18, p < .05), service accessibility (β = 0.17, p < .05) and service awareness (β = .16, p < .5) but not service affordability (β = –.16, p < .05). However, service acceptability and accessibility (β = .19, p < .05) and service acceptability (β = .18, p < .05) were both positively associated with duration of the savings habit, while trust and service affordability were not. These influences on savings habit were comparable to that of social beliefs (β = 0.17, p < .05).

**Key Contribution**

A key contribution of the study to the public policy literature is the empirical evidence that the marketing mix variables for financial services have a greater penetration effect among entrepreneurs in Ghana under the current marketing intervention policies than under previous state-controlled intervention policies. Entrepreneurs seem to have embraced formal financial institutions for the quality of service acceptability and awareness of financial benefits not because of trust but because access to acceptable financial service is enough to sustain bank savings behavior even when such services are not deemed to be all that affordable.

In addition we show that service quality improvements generate customer trust, but trust is not necessary for sustained habitual savings behavior in inclusive financial savings programs. In this regard, our study confirms previous findings (Dadzie et al. 2013) that the marketing mix variables of acceptability, affordability, awareness and accessibility (Sheth and Sisodia 2012) are linked to customer behavior in inclusive finance programs under state-controlled intervention policies. However, we provide comparative evidence of their under state-controlled versus market driven intervention inclusive programs in Ghana.

*References are available on request.*
Mechanical Turk Data in Public Policy Research: Replications of Two FTC Experiments Explore Online Sample Use

Jeff Langenderfer, Meredith College
Alla Akiyeva, Meredith College
Steven W. Kopp, University of Arkansas

Keywords: FTC, MTurk, Mechanical Turk, online surveys, mall intercept, replication

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
Online data collection has become an increasingly popular tool for businesses and academics conducting research because online methods have advantages in terms of speed and cost. When governments collect data for public policy purposes, however, traditional data collection methods such as telephone surveys and mall intercepts remain common, in part due to concerns about sample representativeness, particularly when the general public is the population of interest. Though other data collection methods also fall short of an unbiased simple random sample, a preference for traditional data collection methods persists in the public policy arena.

The purpose of the present study is to assess the extent to which online survey takers differ from traditionally recruited respondents. If government researchers could use online data collection methods instead of telephone or personal interviews and obtain data of comparable generalizability, considerable cost and time savings could be achieved. The present study replicates two copy tests that were conducted on behalf of the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) using personal interviews. In the replications, the data was collected through Amazon Mechanical Turk (MTurk), a crowdsourced online marketplace that matches willing workers with requestors seeking online labor. Results were compared to the initial FTC data.

Method and Data
The first FTC study replicated using MTurk data was originally conducted to support an advertising rule change. The original study examined consumer perceptions of advertising that employ “up to” claims, such as those that promise savings of “up to 47%” on heating and cooling bills. The study was conducted because it had become apparent to the FTC that many consumers interpreted “up to” statements as actually promising results unlimited by the words “up to.” In other words, many consumers commonly interpret a claim promising “savings of ‘up to’ 47%” as “savings of 47%.”

The second replicated FTC study involved consumer understanding of mortgage costs based on mortgage loan disclosures forms. Subjects were drawn from a list of consumers known to have applied for a mortgage loan within the previous two years. One-on-one interviews with the mortgage applicants were conducted in 12 locations through the United States.

The replications used MTurk to recruit subjects who fit the criteria in the original FTC studies. The first study sought adults who actively participate in home improvement decisions. The second study involved people who had applied for a mortgage loan within the previous 24 months. In both cases, the replications asked for individuals who self-identified as meeting the required criteria.

Summary of Findings
In the first FTC study, the results were clear: Many subjects in the FTC experiment interpreted the claims of “up to 47% savings” essentially identically to claims of “47% savings” without the “up to” qualifier, leading to a conclusion that “up
to” claims are perhaps inherently deceptive, particularly if the top advertised result is rare. Of the 69 different combinations of questions and stimuli in the replication, MTurk respondents had significantly different answer percentages on 39 occasions, or about 57% of the time, leading to the conclusion that the MTurk population is clearly different from those recruited through mall intercept techniques. That said, the fundamental conclusion was the same in both the original experiment and the replication: a significant percentage of consumers in both studies misinterpret “up to” claims.

In the mortgage disclosure replication, the MTurk sample performed statistically significantly better on 17 questions, significantly worse on 18 questions, and statistically similarly on the remaining 39 questions. Again, it was clear that the MTurk population was different from the FTC sample. In both the original study and the MTurk replication, however, the overall study conclusions were substantially the same: Newly designed mortgage disclosure forms significantly outperformed existing forms.

Key Contributions

MTurk subjects responded differently to the experimental stimuli than the groups originally recruited by the FTC. Neither the FTC-recruited respondents nor the MTurk workers employed in the replications were simple random samples—both groups contained inherent biases, though the extent to which those biases affected the overall results remains unknown. The bottom line question is whether each is a reasonable approximation of the population of interest. Given the increasingly common acceptance of online data collection in academic research, it may be time for governments to take a renewed look at the extent of bias in all convenience sampling methods. Similar bottom line results between the original FTC studies and the MTurk replications may provide some evidence that MTurk is a suitable substitute for traditional convenience sampling techniques. Indeed, before conducting a full-blown and expensive data collection with tens or hundreds of thousands of dollars in costs, an MTurk pilot might be a reasonable choice for governmental agencies involving less time and considerably less money.

References are available on request.
Leading the Way: Motivating Ethical Action Through Perceived Marketplace Influence

R. Bret Leary, University of Nevada, Reno
Richard J. Vann, University of Wyoming
John D. Mittelstaedt, University of Wyoming

Keywords: perceived marketplace influence, marketplace beliefs, efficacy beliefs, prosocial behavior, consumer empowerment

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
This research is concerned with the motivational underpinnings of ethical behavior. Why and when are consumers likely to engage in behavior that is beneficial to both the individual and the collective? We investigate the concept of Perceived Marketplace Influence (PMI) and its significance in explaining ethical behavior. This research is concerned with the motivational underpinnings of ethical behavior. Why and when are consumers likely to engage in behavior that is beneficial to both the individual and the collective? We investigate the concept of Perceived Marketplace Influence (PMI) and its significance in explaining ethical behavior.

Method and Data
This research analyzes two studies consisting of nationwide surveys of U.S. consumers. Exploratory and confirmatory factor analyses are used to distinguish the concept of PMI from the related concepts of self-efficacy and collective-efficacy. Hierarchical Linear Regression (HLR) techniques are used to show the predictive power of PMI. Finally, mediation processes using the Indirect method (Preacher and Hayes 2008) are used to show the ability of PMI to translate ethical values into corresponding behavioral intention.

Summary of Findings
Across two studies, this research finds that PMI offers predictive ability above and beyond other efficacy-related beliefs like self-efficacy and collective efficacy across contexts for a number of managerially- and policy-relevant outcomes. In addition, we show that, when compared with other efficacy beliefs, PMI provides a more complete account for translating ethical values into corresponding behavior. Finally, we explore the socially-motivated nature of PMI and display its ability to predict other firm-focused actions, such as the tendency to engage in positive (negative) word-of-mouth (WOM) behaviors when an individual believes an organization to have acted in an ethical (unethical) fashion.

Key Contributions
PMI assists in explaining and predicting if and what consumers will do when enacting their ethical values. While it is distinct from other efficacy-related beliefs, PMI remains a complement, rather than a replacement, for existing efficacy-related beliefs. Different situations in the marketplace likely tap into a wide variety of efficacy-related beliefs in directing action. But, when investigating issues where collective efforts are essential to resolving a problem, the belief of one’s influence on others becomes a particularly vital belief to explore and understand.

With regards to public policy, perceived marketplace influence may become an important tool for understanding market size and behavior for ethical product and service offerings. Profiling customer segments with PMI patterns should assist in better anticipating actual marketplace behavior for segments previously identified as likely adopters of environ-
mentally-friendly and ethical products (Ginsberg and Bloom 2004). Similarly, PMI may be tool for marketing managers and policy makers who seek to encourage customers to cross over from supportive attitudes to actual purchases, especially for product offerings serving an ethical niche market. Future research should investigate whether advertisements encouraging PMI lead to changes in consumer consideration sets and purchases.

References are available on request.
A Primer on Marketing, Policy and Social Change: The ABCs of Five Sub-Areas

Eric Krszjzaniek, University of Wyoming
Matthew Lunde, University of Wyoming
Travis Simkins, University of Wyoming
Edna Ndichu, University of Wyoming
Stacey Baker, Creighton University

ABSTRACT
This conceptual paper seeks to bring five areas of marketing and society (Macromarketing, Social Marketing, Marketing Ethics, Public Policy & Marketing, and Transformative Consumer Research) into conversation with one another by tracing the origin of each perspective and identifying the key elements of each, including the unit of analysis, key concepts and content, potential outcomes, and the underlying theory of social change implied in each perspective. The paper uses this lens as a way to discuss the totality of marketing and society scholarship, and emphasize how bringing these five perspectives together in one place may help the marketing discipline achieve broader recognition within the academic community, as well as in the institutions and communities the scholarship serves.

Keywords: macromarketing, social marketing, marketing ethics, public policy and marketing, transformative consumer research, primer, social change

Introduction
Marketing scholarship encompasses work on marketing as an organizational function, marketing as an organizational philosophy, and marketing as a social process that delivers a standard of living to society (Wilkie and Moore 1999). The maturity of our discipline can be reflected in different eras of thought development which place different levels of importance on the function, philosophy, and societal impacts of marketing (see Wilkie and Moore 2003). Foment over the dominance of the first two perspectives, marketing as a function and marketing as a philosophy, are apparent in healthy debates over the definition and scope of marketing (Gundlach 2007; Hill 2010). In fact, somewhat ironically, marketing’s focus on providing solutions to meet customers’ needs has resulted in a myopia which fails to consider broader societal needs from the aggregate marketing system (Shultz 2009; Smith, Drumwright, and Gentile 2010). In other words, managerial and strategic marketing largely ignore the broader spectrum of stakeholders and environmental contexts in which marketing exchange typically occurs (Hill and Martin 2014). This myopic perspective means our field has tended to focus only on the most affluent and powerful institutions and members of society, resulting in a decline in knowledge development and appreciation for the how effectively the aggregate marketing system functions (Shultz 2009), as well as a decline in the moral responsibility of marketing to society (Mick 2007).

Broadly speaking, marketing and society scholarship examines the impact of marketing on society and the impact of society on marketing. In other words, marketing systems and activities are embedded in the everyday lives of human beings, and as such they deliver a standard of living that either improves or detracts from institutional performance and the quality of life for human beings. What institutions and whose standard of living is given priority? What about the conditions the poor and powerless face in their everyday lives? What deters businesses and policy makers from using them as instruments for their own profit and privilege? What about the impact of marketing activities on the natural environment? What deters businesses and policy makers from extracting scarce resources from...
the environment for their own profit and privilege to the
detrit of future generations?

It is our contention that there is no time in the history of our
discipline (or perhaps in the history of humankind) where
the perspective of marketing as a social process has been
more important. Marketing and society scholarship encour-
gages people to move beyond short-term thinking and con-
sider the human, natural, and economic consequences of
marketing and social policies and practices. We believe this
is exactly what marketing professors should care about in
times like these when greed, excess, and irresponsibility
may impact every member of the global community.

We also assert that part of the reason marketing and society
scholarship is sometimes relegated to a lesser status within
practice and scholarly thought, is because the scholarship
itself is diverse and diffused throughout different fragments
of our discipline. This paper provides an initial attempt at
bringing different sub-areas of marketing and society
thought together. As such, this paper—this Primer—seeks
to erase the idea that macromarketing, social marketing,
marketing ethics, public policy and marketing, and transfor-
mative consumer research (TCR) are five different fields
with five disparate focuses (see Table 1). Instead, this
primer demonstrates that these five aforementioned fields
are all sub-areas with shared goals focused on the common
good, versus solely individual profit and performance. The
primer argues for how a working understanding of each
sub-area, distinctly and in combination with others, lends
itself to a focused understanding of what is meant by mar-
keting as a social process, or marketing and society scholar-
ship. We believe such an approach may help to increase
the status of marketing and society scholarship in academia,
and also enhance the perceptions of marketing in society at
large.

Below, the authors outline the history, the units of analysis,
key concepts and content, and potential outcomes of each of
the aforementioned sub-areas. Each sub-area is given its due
with each having its importance and contributions to the
larger forest of Marketing emphasized.

The Five Sub-Areas

Macromarketing

The history of macromarketing is one of those instances
wherein an increasingly specialized field led to the creation
of a new term for an old idea. Shultz (2007) argues that
what people knew, discussed, and called marketing for
recorded history, is, in fact, what the majority of modern-
day scholars agree to call “macromarketing.” The term
macromarketing grew out of a redefinition of what market-
ing could be and do throughout the 1950s, 1960s, and into
the 1970s, when scholars argued for an extension of his-
torical emphasis on societal intertwined with mar-
keting systems (Alderson 1965; Fisk 1967; Jones and Shaw
2002; Layton and Grossbart 2006; Mattson 1969; Wilkie
and Moore 2003).

Bartels and Jenkins (1977) argued that the common usage of
the terms “macromarketing” and “micromarketing” were
differentiated by two bases: (1) the organizational unit
involved; and (2) the function of management. However,
this common usage was growing increasingly insufficient, as
larger units—such as economies and populations—were
increasingly being managed (i.e. social welfare). The two
concepts of micro and macro were actually characterized by
four components of marketing thought: (1) data or informa-
tion; (2) theory; (3) normative models; and 4) forms of man-
agement (Bartels, & Jenkins, 1977). Under this delineation,
macromarketing was a term that represented (1) overall data
of the marketing system; (2) “general” marketing theory; (3)
social values, goals, and programs; and (4) public regulation,
assistance, and programs (Bartels and Jenkins 1977).

The macro of macromarketing has grown in its meaning
over the past few decades of globalization. Specifically, the
evolution of markets have put the context into the global sys-
tem wherein marketers act out the discipline’s concern “with
the context of marketing) problems and with solutions in
relation to the welfare of the stakeholders of a marketing
system or systems over time” (Shultz 2007). These systems
can be marketing, social, or cultural systems, but they are at
the aggregate and the markets can take a variety of forms.

The main purpose of macromarketing is to discover dilem-
as existing between the macro and micro levels, and then
analyzing systems and figuring out how to make them more
efficient, while also balancing other factors important to
society. Macromarketing “celebrates the lack of independ-
ence of any system element” (Mittlestaedt, Kilbourne, and
Mittlestaedt 2006, p. 134). This celebration of interconnect-
edness recognizes the implications of market interactions
and systems, whether the consequences are evaluated posi-
tively or negatively. For instance, the externalities of our
industrialized society are not reflected in market costs, as
negative externalities—such as air pollution resulting from
production—and positive externalities—such as lessened
disease exposure resulting from widespread vaccinations—
are examples of different focuses macromarketing concerns
itself with (Mittlestaedt et al. 2006). Other areas of analysis
can include cooperative flower markets in the Dutch village
of Aalsmeer or trade routes across Aboriginal Australia
(Layton 2007), or the ways in which resort towns can
improve services and visitor experiences (Duffy and Layton
2014; Layton 2015).
### Table 1. Five Sub-areas of Marketing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Origins and history</th>
<th>Macromarketing</th>
<th>Social Marketing</th>
<th>Marketing Ethics</th>
<th>Public Policy and Marketing</th>
<th>Transformative Consumer Research (TCR)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Big picture marketing</td>
<td>• Roots in promotion of family planning, nonprofits, and social causes</td>
<td>• Arose out of a need for marketing ethics in business school</td>
<td>• Roots in the social unrest of the 1960s and rapid evolution of marketing in 1970s and 1980s</td>
<td>• Research movement from Association for Consumer Research (ACR)</td>
<td>• Late 1960s—to study transformative consumer behavior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• From the 1950s-70s, scholars argued for emphasis on societal issues in marketing systems</td>
<td>• Informational approach to promote social change</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Context and problem-based to examine consumption experiences (individual, family, community, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Theory and research for immediate practical implications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Survey, experiment, field research, participatory observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Conceptual and meta-analyses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit of analysis</td>
<td>• Marketing systems approach</td>
<td>• Individual level (i.e. consumer)</td>
<td>• The problem, context, or issue that the policy is meant to address</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Improve well-being, encourage diversity, employ theory and methods, socio-cultural and situational contexts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Large scale approach</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Poverty, social justice, social change, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key methods</td>
<td>• Marketing system approach</td>
<td>• Behavioral research methods</td>
<td>• Ethical indicators, analysis of stakeholder groups, interventions, evaluations and reviews</td>
<td>• Public stakeholders, communities, states, countries</td>
<td>• Context and problem-based to examine consumption experiences (individual, family, community, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Qualitative methods</td>
<td>• Survey, experiment, field research, interview, etc.</td>
<td>• Conceptual and meta-analyses</td>
<td>• Survey, experiment, field research, interview, etc.</td>
<td>• Governmental/systems</td>
<td>• Theory and research for immediate practical implications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Conceptual and meta-analyses</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Conceptual and meta-analyses</td>
<td>• Survey, field research, interview, etc.</td>
<td>• Survey, experiment, field research, interview, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key concepts and content</td>
<td>• Big picture marketing</td>
<td>• Analysis, planning, execution, and evaluation of programs to improve welfare of society</td>
<td>• Ethical indicators, analysis of stakeholder groups, interventions, evaluations and reviews</td>
<td>• Conceptual and meta-analyses</td>
<td>• Conceptual and meta-analyses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Marketing systems</td>
<td>• Human, social, environmental issues, security and crime, education, education, politics, human rights, equality, sustainability, etc.</td>
<td>• Why some consumers engage in unethical behavior</td>
<td>• Marketing and public policy by government and public entities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Marketing that affects a larger community and/or society</td>
<td>• Hunt-Vitell (H-V) Theory</td>
<td>• Positive vs. normative; deontological vs. teleological, macro vs. micro</td>
<td>• Problems, processes, policies, procedures, and protocols</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential outcomes</td>
<td>• Discover dilemmas between macro and micro levels</td>
<td>• Evaluation of ethical and unethical behavior</td>
<td>• Marketing and public policy by government and public entities</td>
<td>• Governmental/business policies, regulations, laws</td>
<td>• Understand consumers’ consumption experiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• To analyze social, subjective, objective, and cultural indicators</td>
<td>• Why some consumers engage in unethical behavior</td>
<td>• Problems, processes, policies, procedures, and protocols</td>
<td>• Social change</td>
<td>• Transformational change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Journal of Macromarketing (JMK) and conference</td>
<td>• Hunt-Vitell (H-V) Theory</td>
<td>• Positive vs. normative; deontological vs. teleological, macro vs. micro</td>
<td>• Immediate practical implications for better lives</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Immediate practical implications for better lives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Underlying theory of social change</td>
<td>• Focus on changing “behavior”</td>
<td>• Ethical stakeholders</td>
<td>• Journal of Public Policy &amp; Marketing (JPPM) and conference</td>
<td>• TCR conference and many journal areas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Social Marketing Quarterly Journal and focus at many conferences</td>
<td>• Ethical stakeholders</td>
<td>• Governmental/business policies, regulations, laws</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Social change</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Journal of Business Ethics and focus at many conferences</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Governance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Focus is on improving consumer welfare</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Focus is on improving consumer welfare</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Focus is on improving consumer welfare</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Focus is on improving consumer welfare</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Focus is on improving consumer welfare</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The targeted outcome for macromarketers is to alter and improve systems that govern individuals’ lives. The best way to do this, from a macromarketers point of view, is to increase economic growth of systems while limiting the negative impacts of a market system on consumers and consumer groups. The change of the macro means a positive influence on the micro, and, in this way, macromarketing tackles social responsibility and improves the world for as many as possible.

The underlying theory of social change within macromarketing is that consumers are dependent upon the systems and structures they operate within. Therefore, to effect social change, the systems and structures have to be understood and modified.

Social Marketing

The second sub-area, social marketing, has its roots in the promotion of family planning that took place in India in 1964 (Andreasen 2003). Also around this time in the United States, the territory of traditional marketing began to expand to nonprofits and social causes (Andreasen 2003; El-Ansary and Kramer 1973; Fox and Kotler 1980). These beginnings and interactions laid the foundation for how Social Marketing as a field would differentiate itself by using an informational approach (i.e., social advertising) to promote social change (Fox and Kotler 1980; Kotler and Zaltman 1971).

The growth of social marketing remained relatively slow until the mid-1980s, with the exception of family planning (Andreasen 1994, 2003). Part of the reason for this slow growth is attributed to the original definition of Social Marketing, which argued that the goal of the field was increasing the acceptability of a social idea or practice in one or more groups of target adopters (Andreasen 2003; Kotler and Roberto 1989). This narrow definition made it difficult to embrace other important contexts, such as health communication, into the concept and domain of social marketing.

The critical moment in the history of social marketing came in the 1990s when the field overcame its “identity crisis” and realized that in order to remain vital and grow, it needed to focus on “changing behavior” rather than “changing ideas” (Andreasen 1994, 2003). It was this transition that both augmented and clarified the definition of social marketing. Today, the most commonly cited definition of social marketing comes from Alan R. Andreasen (1994) as “the application of commercial marketing technologies to the analysis, planning, execution, and evaluation of programs designed to influence the voluntary behavior of target audiences in order to improve their personal welfare and that of the society of which they are a part” (p. 110).

The goal of social marketing is to use a well-defined set of processes for promoting individual behavioral change, so as to address macro-level social problems (Andreasen 1994, 2002; Pechmann 2002). As such, the unit of analysis for social marketing is at the individual-level, i.e. consumers. As a process of social exchange, social marketing embraces a variety of concepts and tools from commercial marketing to influence behavior and promote social change. These tools include the four Ps of marketing (product, price, place, and promotion), consumer and audience research, segmentation, targeting and positioning, branding, communication and persuasion, fundraising, and marketing evaluation (Andreasen and Kotler 2008). Although initially focused on family planning, social marketing has expanded to a broad domain of human, social, and environmental issues, including health, family issues (i.e., domestic violence, child abuse, and teenage pregnancy), security and crime, education, political communication, equality and human rights (e.g., consumer rights and labor rights), animal rights, volunteerism and donation, public policy, environment and sustainability, as well as recent research on disaster (Martin et al. 2014) and substance abuse (Andrews, Netemeyer, and Durvasula 2015).

The proliferation of social marketing research in the past four decades has generated a variety of models and theories...
Marketing and Public Policy

Marketing Ethics

As with the other sub-areas of marketing, ethics contributes to social change. Ethics has been a marketing topic for many years; however, in recent years, there has been a resurgence of marketing ethics tied to macromarketing and social change (Nill and Schibrowsky 2007). There is and has not been one agreed-upon definition of ethics, but, through a review of extant literature, Sparks and Pan (2010) arrived at a definition of ethics as an “evaluation of the degree to which some behavior or course of action is ethical or unethical” (p. 409). Marketing ethics has been defined as an “understanding of why some consumers engage in unethical behavior” (Vitell, Singhapakdi, and Thomas 2001, p. 154), which then uses that information to study consumers’ decision-making behaviors (Vitell, Singhapakdi, and Thomas 2001). The sub-area examines all facets of the marketing discipline, including: corporate ethical values (Hunt, Wood, & Chonko, 1989), consumer behavior and ethics (Vitell, Singhapakdi, and Thomas 2001), marketing ethics education (Yoo and Naveen 2002), sustainable marketing (Thogersen et al. 2006), social responsibility (Vitell 2014), and vulnerable populations (Palmer and Hedberg 2013; Martin and Hill 2012), among others.

Marketing ethics arose from the larger field of business ethics because of the ways marketers were making decisions. According to Hunt and Vitell (1986), in the 1960s marketing instructors were noticing a gap between marketing and business ethics. Then, in 1969, Shelby Hunt created the first course in Marketing Ethics, which reviewed “ethics, marketing systems, public policy, and social responsibility” (Hunt and Vitell 2006, p. 143). Over the next 15 years, marketing ethics used rudimentary models and decision-making processes, while researchers of business ethics used theories and models derived from philosophy. However, in 1986, Hunt and Vitell (1986) created what is now known as the “Hunt-Vitell (H-V) theory (or model) of ethics” (p. 143). Based on commentary and feedback, Hunt and Vitell revised the model in 1993. The theoretical model created an ethical decision-making process and represented the ethical model as a process model (Hunt and Vitell 2006). This was not the only decision-making model to emerge during the 1980s, as Ferrell and Gresham’s single-factor contingency framework of ethical decision-making in marketing model (1985) and Trevino’s model of ethical decision-making in organizations (1986), were also created. Of the three models, the Hunt-Vitell model is the most widely used, as it is the only model that can apply to individual circumstances, such as consumer behavior (Vitell, Singhapakdi, and Thomas 2001).

In marketing ethics the key unit of analysis is stakeholders (Hunt and Vitell 2006), as stakeholders are the prominent decision makers in ethical decision-making (Ferrell and Ferrell 2008). Once an organization can analyze its stakeholder orientation, then it can “improve marketing ethics and the overall image of the marketing profession” (Ferrell and Ferrell 2008, p. 27).

The main outcomes in marketing ethics are solidified ideals (normative approach) and an ethical guide for decision-making (positive approach). As noted above, the Hunt-Vitell (H-V) model is the most widely used positive model for ethical decision-making in marketing and can be used for micro- and macro-level ethical decision-making (Hunt and Vitell 2006; Nill and Schibrowsky 2007; Vitell, Singhapakdi, and Thomas 2001).

Public Policy and Marketing

Beginning in the 1970s and into the early 1980s, the concept of marketing began to extend past the marketing of products and services, to include the marketing of places, ideas, and people (Kinnear 2011; Wilkie and Moore 2003). Marketing and marketing theory also began to extend into the work of not-for-profit groups and government agencies concerned with effective intervention into social problem areas, such as the marketing of health, education, or alleviation of poverty (Wilkie and Moore 2003). Moreover, academics, practitioners, and government entities began to examine socially relevant questions and make efforts to improve the equity and operation of society; these included issues involving: children, the environment, adoption of energy-efficient behaviors, product liability guidelines, food labeling and nutritional concerns, and consumer protection laws (Kinnear 2011).

Although similar to social marketing, public policy and marketing aims for a change in policies and governmental decision-making entities. In short, academics, government officials, and marketing practitioners came together to address a number of significant public policy topics and issues of the time. Public policy and marketing has been studied extensively over the past 50 years, yet the term “public policy” is still not well understood, and there is still no single universally accepted definition (Volkomer 2010). However, within the varied definitions are five stated or implicit facets of
public policy: (1) problems, (2) processes, (3) policies, (4) procedures, and (5) protocols (Stewart, 2014). In order to understand Public Policy and Marketing better, it is important briefly to highlight the ins and outs of these five facets.

First, examples of typical problems described in public policy include vulnerable consumers, threats to privacy, poor nutrition, protection of intellectual property, and unfair business practices, among others (Baker 2009; Brinberg and Axelson 2002; Guiltinan 2002; Mittelstaedt and Mittelstaedt 1997; Ohlhausen 2014). Second, processes influence how problems are defined, identify relevant stakeholders, establish whether intervention is necessary, and determine what form that intervention may take (Stewart 2014). Changes in law and regulation, cumulative case law, the emergence of special interest groups, and social movements, among others, describe processes associated with public policy (Stewart 2014). The third facet, policy itself, grows out of efforts to address particular problems and achieve specific outcomes and therefore they do not usually outline the specific means by which the policy goals will be achieved. There are often many potential courses of action and/or interventions that would lead to the desired outcomes (Hastak and Mazis 2014). Policies outline and describe the destination and why we would like to get there, but do not necessarily provide turn-by-turn instructions on how to get there. Finally, policies and procedures may give rise to specific protocols, rules, or standards (Stewart 2014). There are many such protocols in various government organizations and industry associations, such as those for pre-screened credit cards (Hastak and Mazis 2014). For policy researchers there is a rich stream of research associated with identification of unintended consequences of protocols (Hill 1992; Seiders and Petty 2004, 2007; Shultz et al. 2005; Varman et al. 2012).

Due to this fact, the unit of analysis in public policy and marketing is the problem, the context, or the issue that the policy is meant to address. The underlying theory of public policy and marketing is that by changing policy (i.e., instituting an intervention of some sort), society as a whole will be better off.

**Transformative Consumer Research (TCR)**

Transformative Consumer Research (TCR) is a research movement within the Association for Consumer Research (ACR). As such, the field dates back to 1969 when the ACR was founded by a small group of consumer behavior researchers with the aim of bringing together researchers, public policymakers, and marketers who had an interest in studying consumer behavior (Association for Consumer Research 2015). The name Transformative Consumer Research was coined in 2006 out of an initiative by four ACR members—Connie Pechmann, Linda Price, Rick Netemeyer, and Lisa Penalozato—who organized a conference with consumer welfare as its theme, under the request of the then President of ACR, David Mick (Mick 2006).

When first envisioned, TCR was to encompass “investigations that are fueled by a fundamental problem or opportunity, and that strive to respect, uphold, and improve life in relation to the myriad conditions, demands, potentialities, and effects of consumption” (Mick 2006, p. 2). Mick (2006) and Ozanne (2011), however, point out that TCR is not a new concept. Prior to 2006, marketing researchers were already conducting socially relevant research, and certain marketing journals (e.g., *Journal of Consumer Affairs, Journal of Consumer Policy, Journal of Public Policy and Marketing, Journal of Research for Consumers, and Journal of Macromarketing*) were publishing research that was specifically linked to consumer and societal welfare. In addition, journals such as the *Journal of Consumer Research* occasionally published such articles, including research on addiction (Hirschman 1992), homelessness (Hill and Stamey 1990), and low-literate consumers (Adkins and Ozanne 2005). The launch of the TCR movement, however, aimed to bring together and coordinate previously independent consumer welfare research initiatives.

The sub-area of TCR is context and problem based, and therefore requires researchers to examine consumption experiences in the settings that they occur (Crockett et al. 2013). As such, the unit of analysis can be the individual, family, community, or place, depending on the problem under investigation. Of particular importance is for researchers to engage consumers in the quest to understand consumers’ consumption experiences.

Mick et al. (2012) highlight six core qualities and commitments of TCR. The first, to improve wellbeing; second, to emanate from ACR and encourage paradigm diversity; third, to employ rigorous theory and methods; fourth, to highlight socio-cultural and situational contexts; fifth, to partner with consumers and their caretakers; and sixth, to disseminate valuable findings to relevant stakeholders. These qualities guide the investigation of concepts, such as poverty and social justice (Scott et al. 2011), vulnerability (Baker, Gentry, and Rittenburg 2005), and wellbeing (Moisio and Beruchasvili 2010).

Given the broad concepts and content that TCR encompasses, the underlying theory of social change varies with the context and problem at hand. Ultimately, the focus is on improving consumer welfare, therefore researchers who adopt various orientations including consumer culture theory (CCT), social marketing, macromarketing, and public
policy make important contributions to TCR. In some instances, the best course of action would be to change structures and systems, which eventually result in changes in individuals’ consumption experiences, while in other instances, initiatives aimed at changing individual decision making are the most relevant.

Concluding Remarks
Marketing scholarship provides important contributions to understanding marketing as an organizational function, marketing as an organizational philosophy, and marketing as a social process that delivers a standard of living to society (Wilkie and Moore 1999). The hallmark of a mature discipline is not disagreements within the field but rather agreement on how those within the field can help one another and choose to focus their work to help one another. By bringing together five sub-areas of marketing and society thought, our paper provides clarity to theoretical and practical issues addressed within marketing and society scholarship. We believe that emphasizing the contributions in this way illuminates the contributions of work emanating from a marketing and society perspective may help this scholarship achieve broader recognition within the academic community, as well as in the institutions and communities the scholarship serves. This work focuses on the common good, our common humanity, and emphasizes the important role that markets and marketing serve in achieving human potential.

References


Introduction

Digital or shopper marketing refers to the planning and execution of all marketing activities from the point where a customer becomes a shopper, influencing the shopper along until the point of purchase (Shankar et al. 2011). In recent years, digital marketing has emerged as a key industrial practice among both manufacturers and retailers. Advances in technology have enabled many digital touchpoints for shopper marketing activities (Shankar et al., 2011). Location sharing applications (apps) provide coupons to shoppers with mobile technology (Fowler 2010). In other words, technological developments such as mobile devices have opened up new opportunities to influence a shopper’s attitudes and behavior. Shoppers are now able to use smartphones to search for products and obtain online consumer reviews before entering or navigating throughout a store (Shankar et al. 2011). Moreover, quick and easy shopping features such as one-touch shopping using a smartphone are designed to induce purchase at different stages in the shopping cycle. As an increasing number of shoppers are using social media platforms (e.g., Twitter and Facebook), they are also influential in shaping purchasing decisions (Shankar et al. 2011). As a result, promotional activities through these interfaces have become important. The ability to personalize offers to shoppers has become a major digital marketing innovation. Marketers target consumers by tracking their website surfing behavior, such as which websites they have visited and/or searches they have made (CITE).

As both digital media and multicultural outreach become more popular marketing techniques, American marketers have begun to combine the two (Emarketer 2012). More than half of U.S. marketers are predicted to spend more on digital media efforts in the future, e.g., social media or mobile outreach, specifically in order to reach the multicultural segments of the population. When it comes to the customer segments these marketers are targeting, a majority of them reveal that they are reaching out to Hispanic consumers, followed by African-American and Asian consumers (Emarketer 2012). The percentage of marketers spending more than 20% of their multicultural media budgets on digital media is on the increase (Emarketer 2012).

Certain groups of Americans rely on mobile technologies for online access at elevated levels. In particular, younger adults...
Targeted marketing has been met with increasing criticism (Smith and Cooper-Martin 1997). Specifically, more efforts have been devoted to targeting the consumer segments perceived as vulnerable. It can be argued that the aforementioned groups that are reliant on technologies are vulnerable. Compared with smartphone owners who are less reliant on their mobile devices, the vulnerable users are less likely to have a bank account and or be covered by health insurance. The controversy occurs when vulnerable consumers are targeted with products considered harmful, e.g., unhealthy foods (Smith and Cooper-Martin 1997). Many ethnic groups suffer disproportionately from health maladies that can be attributed to unhealthy diets (Centers of Disease Control 2015).

Two theoretical issues merit discussion and constitute the focus of the paper, i.e., the promotion of products of ill repute to vulnerable segments of the population and online privacy. When a detrimental product is targeted at a vulnerable group, it can be subjected to scrutiny (Cui 1998). The distinctive nature of various consumer groups, such as children, women, the elderly, and ethnic minorities, has made them attractive market segments (Cui and Choudury 2003). Targeting potentially harmful products at these vulnerable consumers has received negative publicity and has resulted in damaging litigation (Cui and Choudury 2003). In other words, a company exploiting vulnerable consumers may be accused of treating these consumers unfairly and lacking justice in the marketplace.

Privacy research in the context of public policy examines whether marketers provide notice and choice through their information requests and disclosure statements (Milne 2000), when and why consumers will make (or will not make) a tradeoff and provide marketers with their personal information. Milne (2000) points out that privacy issues associated with organizations that track consumers’ movement around the Web, often without the consumers’ knowledge or consent, warrant further policy evaluation. The paper proceeds as follows. The next section reviews the literature on digital marketing with regard to its nature, privacy issues, as well as public policies on online privacy. After that, we examine existing public policies regarding marketing to ethnic minority children online, with a focus on online privacy. The paper concludes with a summary and discussion of directions for future research.

**Literature Review**

The global nature of digital marketing distinguishes itself from traditional marketing, which relies heavily upon cultural and traditional influences on shoppers (Stahlberg and Maila 2012). Shoppers’ purchase behavior and shopping environments are pretty much identical throughout the world. Giant food and beverage companies (e.g., Coca-Cola) and large retailers (e.g., Wal-Mart, BestBuy, and Amazon) exert influence on a shopper’s purchase behavior not only in the physical store and but also through Internet and mobile technologies (Krafft and Mantrala 2006; Reinartz et al. 2011). Furthermore, both manufacturers and retailers are trying to take advantage of the prowess of digital marketing and figure out more effective and efficient ways to improve shopper marketing and manage products distribution (Stahlberg and Maila 2012).

Another feature of shopper marketing is its reliance on information technology, particularly Internet search engines, mobile devices, online customer-store interfaces, and even social networking websites (Shankar et al. 2011). Marketers have more opportunities to gain access to a shopper’s personal information, purchase history and point-of-purchase behavior (Shankar and Balasubramanian 2009). Manufacturers send digital coupons and sales information directly to shoppers through their online websites or mobile applications. On the other hand, retailers take advantage of shoppers’ purchase history, offering product recommendations, loyalty rewards, and customized coupons to different shoppers. Kraft has tried to get connected directly with shoppers through iFood, which is a mobile phone app with which shoppers can download recipes, make their own shopping list, and purchase online. Sam’s Club also relies on its members’ purchase history and sends customized coupons to different shoppers (Martin 2010). However, the collection and analysis of the vast amounts of consumer information generated while retailers, manufacturers, and other entities interact and communicate directly with consumers online has had ethical ramifications. Specifically, we will next examine privacy issues in connection to the use of digital technologies and big data, followed by a discussion of public policies for digital marketing.

**Privacy Issues with Digital Technologies and Big Data**

The Internet has now become a ubiquitous element of our lives. In 2014, around 40.4% of the world population was connected to the Internet, which was a whopping jump compared with a mere 0.3% in 1993 (Internet Live Stats 2015). About 84% of the American population had Internet connection in 2014 (Pew Research Center 2015). The pervasive use...
of the Internet has been made possible with the proliferation of digital technologies, such as mobile phones, tablets, and laptops. People constantly check emails, listen to music online, receive customized promotional emails, and use location-based services for promotional deals. However, usage of these services would require users to provide their personal information, such as demographic identifiers, location data, browsing history, purchase records, etc. As online consumer data are now increasingly collected through various devices and stored in the cloud for data analysis purposes, there have been growing concerns over online privacy.

Privacy is defined as the right of an individual to be left alone and be able to control the release of his or her personal information regarding data collection, processing, and storage (Liu et al. 2005; Gumbus and Meglich 2013). The second dimension of the definition is particularly relevant in the digital age as marketers actively implement diverse “big data” analytics to collect and process online consumer information. They collect personal information in an attempt to provide more sophisticated and targeted messages by tracking surfing behaviors, online histories, or Internet protocol (IP) information, which is typically referred to as behavioral targeting (Belch and Belch, 2015). Also, marketers frequently use retargeting techniques, which bring a specifically targeted advertisement if visitors on a website search or browse a certain product without purchasing it (Belch and Belch 2015). A number of data service companies, such as Nielsen Catalina Solutions, provide personalized digital media services based on each company’s unique set of big database. For example, Nielsen Catalina Solutions (2015) does not provide details on how they collect customer database as this comes from their two parent companies (Nielsen and Catalina) (Nielsen Catalina Solutions 2015). Yet, the database is based on actual behavior of their target consumers. While data service companies generally do not specify how they have built their consumer databases, they claim that they are based on real-time consumer behavior (either online or offline). This indeed raises legitimate questions. How do those big data service companies build such databases? What types of customer behavior data do they have? While we are not sure how they have built such databases, they actively advertise how their data services can be applied and potentially help their customers.

The data collection methodologies adopted by those big data service companies could be viewed as invading personal privacy in the digital era. More importantly, an increasing number of companies are utilizing such consumer databases and targeted services to reach out to specific segments of the population. However, there is a great need to justify the purpose and scope of data collection, informed consent, and user control (Gumbus and Meglich 2013). In response to potential privacy concerns, such as online censorship, there is also an increasingly vocal call for introducing legislation on Internet privacy. One such example is “right to be forgotten,” a European ruling instituted in 2014 and designed to grant individuals the right to request search engines in Europe to remove personal information. The ruling could be interpreted as the result of globally growing attention to online privacy, which demonstrates the need to understand, from public policy and legislative perspectives, the potential threats in big data analytics and data collection procedures.

Existing Public Policies on Digital Marketing

A review of relevant references shows that while many industries have their own policies in place regarding digital marketing, public policy institutions have significantly lagged behind in defining rules of the game for the digital marketing landscape. In the paper we focus our attention on those mapped out by the Federal Trade Commission (FTC), whose one principal mission lies in consumer protection. The organization addresses consumers’ online privacy concerns by focusing on the formulation and enforcement of online privacy policies. At the heart of these policies are the fair information practice principles of notice, choice, access, and security, which are enshrined in its 2000 report, “Privacy Online: Fair Information Practices in the Electronic Marketplace.” The notice principle states that an entity should explicitly and clearly inform consumers of its information practices prior to any attempt at information collection. The access principle implies an individual’s ability to review the data collected about herself and assess its completeness and accuracy. The security principle obligates the data collector to guard against personal information against unauthorized access, disclosure, etc. In addition, FTC emphasizes enforcement of these principles as being essential to consumer protection.

It is noteworthy that the FTC attaches prominent importance to protection of children’s online privacy. Its commitment to this is showcased by the introduction in 1998 of “Children’s Online Privacy Protection Act,” which has been continuously updated and augmented. FTC “prohibits unfair or deceptive acts or practices in connection with the collection, use, and/or disclosure of personal information from and about children on the Internet” (“Children’s Online Privacy Protection Act”). In doing so, the agency seeks to enable parents to be in control of what information and data commercial websites collect from their children online.

Implications for Future Research and Public Policy

Our discussion in the paper suggests several major policy implications. Online marketers, especially those in the food and beverage industries, promote their products amongst
young adults by employing a variety of strategies. Among these are the specialized knowledge and tools from academic disciplines, such as psychology, sociology, neuroscience, and data mining, which serve to “foster emotional and unconscious choices, rather than reasoned, thoughtful decision making” (Montgomery and Chester 2009, p. S24). These choices on the part of children may translate into compulsive or unplanned buying. Therefore, there is an imperative need for public policy institutions and other concerned constituents to encourage interdisciplinary industry and academic research spanning those fields. For example, research that blends information processing theory from psychology and digital technologies may help uncover the mechanisms underlying children’s attitudinal and behavioral changes in the online environment. Specifically, the effects of online tracking tools on children’s information processing patterns may need to be explored.

While young adults constitute a primary focus for digital marketing, those from the African-American and Hispanic segments of the population, who are viewed as vulnerable, are particularly targeted by marketers. However, a systematic review of extant legislative efforts for online marketing shows that policies designed specifically for African-American or Hispanic children are generally lacking. Thus, we foresee a need to formulate policies addressing the issues and concerns of these children online. More research should be promoted that examines the behavioral patterns of these children as online shoppers, which are differentiated from their counterparts of other races. Another high-profile public policy area that merits particular attention is increasing obesity of these minority children in relation to digital marketing. There has been research that documents the effect of TV viewing on obesity amongst children (e.g., Carvalhal et al. 2007). However, there is a dearth of work that looks at how online behavior of children, including ethnic minority children, is related to obesity. Specifically, this could be undertaken in the context of the food and beverages industry by investigating the psychological processes in which children process online information on food and beverages products. With respect to public policy, while expanding financial support for research that addresses the interconnections between online behavior and obesity among children, public policy makers should take more practical measures to foster more healthful online behavior.

With regard to the closely related issue of online privacy protection, which is the focus of our investigation, there has been an ample body of literature. Researchers have examined how consumers reduce online privacy risks (Milne and Culnan 2004) and the effects of online privacy information on consumers’ purchase behavior, among other issues. However, efforts that are directed more specifically at online privacy in the context of digital marketing and big data has been sporadic. Therefore, this is a most promising area of research. For example, we could investigate the underlying mechanisms in which the use of big data impact online shoppers’ propensity to disclose personal information. Given the focus on children on my paper, we could more specifically address the issue by targeting children. On the side of public policy, we noted that the issue of protection of children’s online privacy has not received sufficient attention. As a matter of fact, among major public policy institutions, only FTC has dedicated legislative efforts to protecting children’s online privacy. More specifically, more public policy attention should be given to the protection of online privacy of ethnic minority children. Therefore, more public policy institutions should be involved in the issue. In addition, we recognize that public policy stipulations are not universally applicable at times. Therefore, it is necessary that public policy makers introduce guidelines that address the online privacy issue of children based on their specific ethnic minority origins. For example, there should be guidelines for African American children and Hispanic children, respectively.

References
practices-electronic-marketplace-federal-trade-commission].


“Caution: May Contain Brands!”: Effects of Informational and Evaluative Textual Forewarnings of Product Placement

Tina Tessitore, IESEG School of Management (LEM CNRS 9221)
Maggie Geuens, Ghent University
Leen Adams, Antenno

Keywords: warnings, product placement, persuasion knowledge, purchase intention, self-monitoring

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
Several countries allow product placement on the condition that it is clearly identified to viewers. But, how can viewers be helped to effectively identify product placement? In three studies, we want to test whether explicit textual forewarnings are effective in helping people to activate persuasion knowledge and to react against the influence of product placement on their purchase intentions. We also test the difference in effectiveness between an informational versus an evaluative textual forewarning. Finally, we investigate the individual’s level of self-monitoring as a potential moderator in the impact of an informational versus evaluative warning on consumers’ purchase intentions.

Method and Data
Three experiments were run on the Belgian population. Participants in study 1 were between 18 and 65 years old. Participants in study 2 and 3 were undergraduate students from a large Belgian university.

Summary of findings
Study 1 shows that an explicit textual forewarning of the persuasive intent of product placement helps activate viewers’ persuasion knowledge and induces resistance against the influence of product placement on purchase intention. Study 2 investigates two types of explicit textual forewarnings that differ in the presence of evaluations about product placement and finds that both informational and evaluative warnings counter product placement effectiveness to a similar extent. Study 3 extends these findings by investigating viewer characteristics as a potential moderator and shows that informational (evaluative) warnings are more effective for low (high) self-monitors to decrease purchase intention. In each study, brand recall turns out to be a prerequisite for resistance processes to occur.

Key Contributions
This research contributes to both theory and public policy practice. First, it contributes to warning and product placement literature by showing that an explicit textual warning can induce resistance against the influence of product placement. Moreover, we suggest that a different process may underlie resistance (i.e., self-generated inferences versus reliance on inferences by others). Moreover, some warnings may be more effective than others depending on the target audience’s level of self-monitoring. Second, we provide concrete guidelines for public policy. Specifically, warning designers should consider the type of textual warning together with the level of self-monitoring of the target audience.

References are available on request.

For further information contact: Tina Tessitore, Assistant Professor, IESEG School of Management (t.tessitore@ieseg.fr).
“Twitter in Prosocial Communication”: The Mediating Role of Influence of Presumed Influence

Karine Charry, Iéseg School of Management
Tina Tessitore, Iéseg School of Management (LEM CNRS 9221)

Keywords: social labeling, children, self-concept clarity, pro-environmental behavior

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
First, we want to study whether an unknown (micro) blogger may influence consumers’ prosocial behavior (i.e., healthy eating) purely based on the source’s mere number of followers. Second, with this research we want to explain the process behind this influence. We seek to understand the mediating role of influence of presumed influence when inferring unknown sources’ credibility. Finally, we also investigate the inhibiting role of a high number of followers in the development of reactance.

Method and Data
To test our hypotheses, we conducted an experiment on 201 French adults between 18 and 25. More specifically, a 2 x 2 between-subjects design was set up in Qualtrics in which we manipulated number of followers and number of repetitions.

Summary of Findings
First, we show that unknown bloggers presenting a high number of followers may represent an effective source when recommending healthy eating. Our target group indeed declares higher intentions to consume healthy food after being exposed to sources that are highly followed in comparison with less followed sources. Second, we provide evidence that this influence is explained by the presumed influence the source has on third parties, and that their credibility is inferred by this presumed influence. Last, we demonstrate that unknown but highly followed bloggers also limit the risk of reactance, although the message is repeated.

Key Contributions
With this study, we contribute to the marketing theory by providing a theoretical explanation to the influence of sources that are unknown from the target—but highly followed—on social media. We also propose pragmatic implications to pro-social communicators. For instance, we show that having an expensive celebrity endorser may not always be necessary to have an influential communication. Convincing bloggers with a high number of followers to support a good cause may be less costly but equally effective. Then, social marketers should invest energy to make sure that the source of communication is considered a highly followed one as this will make the recommendations much more effective. We also suggest that public policy makers consider influencers involved in pro-social communication with benevolence while being more stringent on commercial companies that pay for fake followers.

References are available on request.

For further information contact: Karine Charry, Associate Professor, Iéseg School of Management (k.charry@ieseg.fr).
To Disclose or Not to Disclose? Bloggers and the Consequences of Transparency About the Nature of the Relationship with the Brands They Recommend

Alice Audrezet, ISG
Karine Charry, Iéseg School of Management (LEM CNRS 9221)

Keywords: fashion blogger, disclosure, followers’ responses

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
With this research we want to investigate the impact of disclosure of a partnership with a brand on the three dimensions of the source credibility. Setting our study in the context of blogs, we will first look at a commercial partnership and then we will test the impact of disclosure in a case of independence from commercial relationship.

Method and Data
To test our hypotheses, we conducted two between-subjects experiments. Study 1 (N = 58) tests the effect of two levels of disclosure on the source’s credibility (subtle versus overt disclosure). Study 2 (N = 88) investigates three levels of disclosure stating the non-commercial nature of recommendations and its impact on blogger’s credibility. We compared three levels of disclosure of independence (no disclosure, subtle disclosure and overt disclosure).

Summary of Findings
First we show that disclosing a commercial relationship decreases the attractiveness dimension of credibility, but that interestingly, only this dimension is affected. Furthermore, it requires a high level of disclosure to achieve these results. In the case of disclosure of independence from any commercial partnership, however, the trustworthiness of the blogger increases, but only in case of subtle disclosure.

Key Contributions
With this study, we contribute to the marketing theory by providing additional insights to the role of disclosure on a source’s credibility. We show that disclosing in an unambiguous way changes the audience’s perception of the source’s perceived attractiveness, somewhat indicating that disclosure helps the target to understand the commercial nature of the partnership. In the case of an independent blogger, we show that stressing—not too obviously—this independence tends to increase the source’s trustworthiness. These results also contribute to public policy makers’ difficult task. It indeed supports the idea that imposing an overt disclosure helps consumers understanding the commercial relationship behind some bloggers recommendations and are better able to protect themselves against unwanted persuasive attempts. Furthermore, it provides managerial insights to independent bloggers, suggestion that may eventually help them benefit from their independence.

References are available on request.

For further information contact: Alice Audrezet, Assistant Professor, ISG Paris (alice.audrezet@isg.fr).
The Double-Edge Effect of Donation Size in Retailers’ Charity Promotions: When Skepticism Cools the Warm-Glow Effect

Aida Mimouni Chaabane, Cergy–Pontoise University
Béatrice Parguel, CNRS-DRM Université Paris–Dauphine

Keywords: charity promotions, donation size, warm glow, skepticism, altruism, familiarity with charity promotions

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
Charity promotions—linking product sales with donations to charity—are popular with consumers because they produce warm-glow feelings (the positive route). But when they involve large donations, they may trigger consumers’ skepticism, reducing the warm glow (the negative route). The purpose of this research is to examine whether large donations in charity promotions can produce consumers’ skepticism and reduce consumers’ warm glow and positive attitude toward the retailer.

Method and Data Used
An experiment varying the donation size (large, medium, small) in a charity promotion run by an office equipment retailer is set up. Hypotheses are tested using bootstrapping regression analyses.

Summary of Findings
The negative route has the greater effect: skepticism toward the offer mediates the relationship between donation size and the warm glow. Furthermore, skepticism toward a large donation is higher (lower) for respondents scoring low (high) on altruism and high (low) on familiarity with charity promotions.

Key Contributions
This study contributes to the recent research examining the negative effects of charity promotions by explicitly conceptualizing and measuring skepticism toward charity promotions. The findings are also valuable because they indicate the importance of a shift in focus, away from the conventional question of charity promotion effectiveness to the more specific and under-investigated problem of the appropriate core target consumers. From a more practical point of view, it is in the public interest to discourage the development of a general skepticism towards charity promotions among consumers. Such skepticism can erode the donators’ attitudes (toward the offer and toward the retailer or the brand) in the medium term and could reduce consumers’ participation in the long term. Our findings therefore encourage public policy makers to issue guidelines intended to help charity promotions managers design effective charity promotions programs. In particular, the guidelines should help practitioners choose their features and target audience carefully in order to reduce skepticism, such as favoring small over large donations, supporting several charities with small donations instead of directing large donations at a single charity or combining small donations with other charity programs. Such public policy actions should diminish the chance of developing a general skepticism towards charity promotions among consumers.

References are available on request.

For further information contact: Beatrice Parguel, CNRS-DRM Université Paris–Dauphine (beatrice.parguel@gmail.com).
When Should a Nudge Become a Shove? 
Young Adult Smokers’ Perceptions of Tobacco Endgame Strategies

Janet Hoek, University of Otago 
Jude Ball, University of Otago 
Heather Gifford, Whakauae Research Services 
El-Shadan Tautolo, AUT University 
Teresa Taylor, T&T Consulting 
Stephanie Erick, ASH New Zealand

Keywords: smoking, young adults, tobacco endgame, personal autonomy, public policy

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question 
Tobacco endgames aim to reduce smoking prevalence to minimal levels and require novel measures to achieve ambitious target dates. These goals thus require researchers to identify interventions that could promote and support the rapid behavior change sought, and to explore how acceptable these interventions will be. Current research has examined changes to all elements of the marketing mix, for example non-profit supply models; new, less addictive, tobacco products; curtailing supply channels, and instilling larger and more frequent excise tax increases. While surveys have examined the likely acceptability of these measures, these rarely provide nuanced insights and often use a limited theoretical framework. We used theory on nudging and personal autonomy to explore how young adults, a priority group given their relatively high smoking prevalence, interpreted different endgame strategies. Specifically, we explored the tension between individuals’ rights to act versus their rights to be free from addiction, and examined how those targeted by endgame measures interpreted these.

Method and Data 
We collected data from thirty participants via seven focus groups and one in-depth interview; all participants were either current smokers or very recent quitters. Ethics approval was granted by the University of Otago Human Ethics Committee; all participants provided written consent. Our interview guide drew on data from earlier work that explored a claim often made by New Zealand tobacco companies, namely that smokers make “informed choices” to smoke. Our earlier studies had identified barriers that undermined informed and autonomous choices; we developed potential interventions that could address these barriers and explored how participants interpreted these. Focus groups promoted interaction between participants and foster debate over the benefits or limitations of the proposals suggested and lasted between 60 and 120 minutes.

Interviews were recorded with participants’ consent and subsequently transcribed verbatim. We used a two stage process to analyze the data; first, we developed codes that aligned with the interview guide to analyze responses to each potential measure. Following an in-depth assessment each potential measure, we undertook a thematic analysis, where we examined broader questions of freedom and autonomy, and developed overarching themes that reflected responses to these issues.

Summary of Findings 
Participants thought young people would increase purchase age measures by using proxies or seeking out non-compliant retailers. While they more enthusiastic about a smoke-free generation proposal, some queried whether it could make smoking more attractive to those unable to access tobacco.

For further information contact: Janet Hoek, Professor of Marketing, University of Otago, New Zealand (Janet.hoek@otago.ac.nz).
Some thought limiting when tobacco could be sold would be effective and, while most disliked making areas outside bars smoke-free, they thought this measure would change norms around smoking, though noted it may elicit resistance. Participants supported programs promoting social skills, though queried if these would bring change among young people who lived with smokers. Most thought social marketing campaigns lacked the power to change entrenched social norms regarding smoking, and felt a smoker’s license could become a rite of passage.

Many saw smoking as a “right” that asserted control and created social connections, and disliked measures that limited their perceived control. Some privileged the “right” to harm over the “right” to safety, if the latter required them to cede their autonomy; they favored measures they saw as empowering, such as education. Overall, the more constraining participants considered a measure, the lower its popularity, despite its potential effectiveness.

**Key Contributions**

The prospect of a society largely free from the harms caused by tobacco use holds many appeals but raises important questions about competing rights. Our findings suggest smoking maintains an important appeal as a symbol of maturity; participants consistently privileged their freedom to act over their right to freedom from harm, which most saw as neither personally relevant nor imminent. Evidence that cognitive biases and environmental factors affect young adults’ ability to make informed choices about smoking, anticipate addiction, or contemplate a severely reduced quality of life as they age, question whether the interventions favored—education—would promote cessation or reduce smoking uptake.

Participants’ comments often mirrored arguments adduced by tobacco companies and few held tobacco companies responsible for harms caused by smoking. Presenting tobacco companies, rather than individual smokers, as responsible for addiction could offer a stronger rationale for comprehensive endgame strategies. More generally, greater use of industry denormalization strategies, hitherto not widely used in New Zealand, could encourage individuals to privilege their right to freedom from addiction above their right to engage in risk behaviors.

*References are available on request.*
The Effects of Demarketing Campaigns on Consumer Attitudes and Actual Consumption

Edward Ramirez, University of Texas at El Paso
Saeed Tajdini, University of Texas at El Paso

ABSTRACT
Leveraging the stimulus-organism-response (S-O-R) paradigm, this research contributes to our understanding of the effects of a demarketing campaign on consumer attitudes and actual behaviors. In particular, it examines the impact of a green integrated marketing campaign (IMC), which calls attention to potential electricity savings ideas, on consumer appraisals and consumption. A pair of studies indicates that the enactment of a demarketing campaign creates positive perceptions of the organization, and subsequently affects consumption behaviors. Specifically, study one suggests that a green IMC positively affects factors related to consumer choice, such as perceptions of an organization’s trustworthiness, market orientation, and environmental-sensitivity, while study two indicates that an IMC may help shape consumer responses, such as reducing the growth of electricity usage. Taken collectively, the results suggest that demarketing campaigns not only facilitate changes in real consumption practices and thus contribute to societal welfare, but such efforts also serve to positively position the organization in the consumer’s mind.

Keywords: demarketing, environmental sustainability, consumption, public policy

Introduction
Demarketing campaigns, integrated marketing programs where an organization calls for decreased consumption of its own products, in many cases have proven to be a catalyst to consumption reduction and an effective antidote to overconsumption. While significant strides have been made to our understanding of such appeals and their effects on consumer attitudes, less is known about the effects of demarketing campaigns on actual consumption behaviors (Grinstein and Nisan 2009). Given the increasing prevalence of demarketing campaigns and their underlying objective of improving societal welfare, as well as the sizable investment required for implementation (the CDC’s antismoking campaign cost $48 million) (Stobbe 2013), research that assesses their efficacy adds value to campaign beneficiaries, marketing managers, and researchers (Andrews et al. 2004).

By examining the effects of an organization’s demarketing program, the research presented attempts to fill this gap. In particular, it uses the Stimulus Organism Response (S-O-R) paradigm to explore the effects of a green integrated marketing campaign (IMC), designed to persuade consumers to reduce their electricity consumption (Bagozzi 1983; Belk 1975). The first of two studies tests the effects of an organization’s announcements on consumers’ impressions. The findings suggest that consumers consider organizations that promote themselves using a green IMC to be more trustworthy (Morgan and Hunt 1994), market oriented (Webb, Webster, and, Krepapa 2000) and environmentally-sensitive (Cude 1993) than those not doing so. Second, to determine whether demarketing efforts can shape actual consumer behaviors and are thus a worthwhile investment, a quasi-experiment assesses the effects of implementation on consumers’ electricity consumption. The results provide strong support for the notion that demarketing campaigns can alter the consumption of a low demand elasticity, non-substitutable service, thus demonstrating their value for organizations, society, and the environment (Grinstein and Nisan 2009).

In the sections that follow, a brief discussion of the effects of demarketing campaigns on consumer attitudes and behav-
iors is offered. Next, a description of green IMCs and their effects follows. In addition, an overview of the S-O-R paradigm is provided. Against this backdrop, hypotheses are developed to test the effects of a demarketing campaign touting an organization’s commitment to environmental-sustainability. Two studies, which test these hypotheses, are then described. Lastly, the findings, implications, and limitations of this research are addressed.

Conceptual Background
As alluded to above, demarketing campaigns involve an organization’s counterintuitive call for a reduction in consumption of its own product offerings. The effects of such demarketing campaigns have been studied across a wide variety of contexts. For example, its effects have been tested on smoking cessation (Andrews et al. 2004), new product quality assessment (Miklós and Zhang 2013), water consumption (Grinstein and Nisan 2009), fire arms diversion (Gundlach, Bradford, and Wilkie 2010), illegal drug use (Kelly, Swaim, and Wayman 1996), and electricity consumption (McDougall, Claxton, Richie, and Anderson 1981). Broadly speaking, research on demarketing campaigns suggests a linkage between consumers’ affective, cognitive, and behavioral responses (Grinstein and Nisan 2009). For example, demarketing campaigns interacted with consumer attitudes related towards the campaign, prior trial behavior, and social influence to directly impact smoking intentions (Andrews et al. 2004). In this regard, investments in demarketing campaigns represent investments in the future of society, as they might serve to prevent someone from ever smoking. In another example, a demarketing campaign undertaken in an arid climate demonstrated that consumers would be willing to reduce their consumption of water—a highly-valued, life-giving, necessity—as a result of such a campaign (Grinstein and Nissan 2009). Interestingly, demarketing campaigns have proven to be more effective on a given society’s majority than on its minority groups. Despite these advances to our understanding of demarketing campaigns however, additional research on their effectiveness to sway actual behaviors is needed (Grinstein and Nissan 2009).

A green IMC, an organization’s effort of harmonizing its marketing messages with the purpose of portraying it as environmentally-friendly (Polonsky and Rosenberger 2001), represents a particular type of demarketing campaign. Although a relative dearth of research specifically addresses green IMCs, the literature suggests that firms may stand to benefit as a result of implementation, as such an alignment of marketing efforts can positively affect its entire range of stakeholders, and may thus spur pro-environmental behaviors (Grinstein and Nisan 2009). Consider that an organization’s advertising efforts, which broadcast its environmentally-sustainable business practices, are shown to positively affect consumer attitudes (Carlson et al. 1996). In fact, research suggests that environmentally-sensitive consumers show strong purchase intentions towards firms featuring green ad campaigns, claiming to be willing to make special efforts to purchase green offerings and, if given the option, to switch to greener alternatives (Diamantopoulos et al. 2003).

When integrating marketing efforts, organizations may also choose to label their offerings as environmentally-friendly. Although governmental agencies regulate these activities, and in some instances force firms to label their products, firms welcome such regulations, as labels have been shown to be an effective promotional device (D’Souza et al. 2006). Consider for instance, that Australian consumers maintain that labels increase product credibility and customer satisfaction, arguing that labels act to legitimize the firm’s claims of environmental-sensitivity. By signaling that products are genuinely green, labeling reduces complexity in consumer search efforts and therefore elevates satisfaction levels (D’Souza et al. 2006). In short, product labeling that attests to a product offering’s level of environmental-sustainability may alter consumers’ attitudes and behaviors.

Finally, the stimulus-organism-response paradigm is useful for explaining the effects of demarketing campaign implementation in general, and those associated with green IMC campaign adoption in particular. The S-O-R paradigm suggests that a managerially controllable stimulus (S) can influence consumers’ impressions and choice related processes with regards to a given organization (O) (Bagozzi, 1983; Belk, 1975). These choice related processes in turn affect behaviors (R) (Eroglu, Machleit, and Davis 2001). For example, Li and Lee (2012) used the S-O-R paradigm to examine the effects of three types of CSR programs on consumer identification with, and their subsequent evaluations of, the enacting organization. The S-O-R paradigm has also been used to study the influence of navigation cues on commercial websites (Dailey 2004), restaurant atmospherics on consumer behavioral intentions (Jang and Namkung 2009), and consumer involvement with a convenience good (Slama and Taschian 1987). Thus, the S-O-R paradigm would predict that an organization’s green IMC (S) would impact consumers’ attitudes towards the organization (O) and consequently influence their behaviors (R). More formally, the following hypotheses are proposed.

**H₁:** Green IMC implementation positively impacts consumer attitudes.

**H₂:** Green IMC implementation positively affects consumer behaviors.
Study One
The above hypotheses were tested using a two-step process, with the first step testing the relationship between the stimulus and the consumer’s choice related processes. To test the hypothesis that a green IMC impacts consumer attitudes, an experiment manipulating the presence or absence of an IMC was conducted. More specifically, the effects of a simulated monthly electricity bill, with one containing evidence of green IMC adoption and the other without, tested the research hypothesis (H₁) that a green IMC positively affects consumers’ perceptions of an organization’s trustworthiness, market orientation, and environmental-sensitivity. These three attitudinal variables were used as dependent measures, as prior research indicates that organizations purporting to be environmentally-concerned must appear genuine about their efforts, motivated to satisfy environmentally-sensitive stakeholders versus by the prospect of financial gain, and sensitive to the needs of the marketplace (Becker-Olsen, Cudmore, and Hill 2006). The following sections discuss the participants, procedures, and results of this experiment.

Participants
Sixty-four undergraduate students enrolled in a marketing course at a large southeastern public university were randomly assigned to one of two experimental conditions. After receiving the stimulus, participants were asked to complete a brief survey. Twelve surveys were eliminated from consideration for inappropriate responses to embedded quality assurance items, leaving a total of 52 usable surveys. Forty-four percent of the respondents were males, 73% are Caucasian, 6% were African American, 15% were Hispanic, 2% were Asian, 2% were Native American, and 2% report themselves as “Other.” Ninety-eight percent were 18-24 years old.

Procedure
Participants were randomly distributed simulated electricity bills from a hypothetical electric company, the City Utilities Company (CUC). Those in the treatment condition received a simulated electric bill, representing a component of a green IMC. The stimulus contained a sealed envelope, an itemized bill, and a one-third page educational insert. The envelope was labeled with the utility company’s name and address, a pseudo customer name and address, and an inscription in green-colored ink alluding to the fact that the company featured environmentally-friendly services. In particular, the inscription read, “Visit our website at www.wwww.wwww for tips on how to protect the environment using CUC smart metering.” The simulated billing statement found in the sealed envelope mimicked a standard electric bill, as it contained itemized charges representing a month’s usage. The simulated bill was also labeled with the same inscription found on the face of the envelope that attested to the organization’s environmental-sensitivity. Finally, a one-third page educational insert was found in the envelope that described how consumers can simultaneously reduce their electricity consumption, while protecting the natural environment. The insert was labeled to suggest that the fictitious utility company has adopted a more sustainable approach to doing business.

In the control condition, participants received a bill reflecting the absence of a green IMC. More specifically, the stimulus featured a relatively plain envelope and a standard itemized bill. Also, the control bill did not contain a demarking message. In fact, neither the envelope nor the billing statement was labeled to support the notion that the organization encourages consumption reduction strategies. In contrast with the experimental condition stimulus, the control condition envelope did not contain an insert which would indicate that the organization is environmentally-sensitive. It should be noted that participants in both conditions were instructed to open the simulated bills and then to complete a brief web-based survey containing several dependent measures. The following section discusses the survey’s contents.

Dependent Measures
Scales measuring perceptions of the organization’s trustworthiness, market orientation, and environmental-sensitivity were included in a survey using a seven-point Likert (1 = “Strongly Disagree” to 7 = “Strongly Agree”) format. Trust in the organization was measured with a three-item scale, containing one reverse-coded item (Morgan and Hunt 1994), while a five-item scale measures perceptions of the organization’s market orientation (Webb et al., 2000). Finally, a five-item scale measuring perceptions of the organization’s environmental-sensitivity was included (Cude 1993). Each scale was found to be unidimensional and highly reliable (.92 < α < .95). Summated scales for each construct were calculated and subsequently used in the analysis (See Appendix for scale items).

Results
To test the hypothesis that a green IMC influences consumer choice related processes, a series of independent samples t-tests were conducted. The results, first, suggest that perceptions of the organization’s environmental-sensitivity is significantly higher for participants receiving the simulated bill featuring a green IMC component than for those receiving a bill lacking one, t (50) = 3.55, p < .005, r = .47. Finaly, perceptions of the organization’s market orientation is higher for those in the treatment condition than for those in the control condition, t (50) = 3.81, p < .005, r = .44.
Therefore, the results support the hypothesis that a green IMC positively affects consumer attitudes towards the announcing organization. Furthermore, the results suggest that the implementation of a green IMC results in both medium and large effects on these variables, with effect sizes of .44, .47, and .80 for each summated scale.

**Study Two**

Study one supports the hypothesis (H1) linking green IMC implementation and consumer attitudes towards the organization. Study two is designed to complement study one by investigating the relationship between the stimulus and subsequent consumer behaviors. In particular, study two examines how green IMC adoption impacts the growth of household electricity usage. This objectively measured outcome was chosen as energy conservation has been tested in prior studies and is regarded as a sustainable behavior (Grinstein and Nisan 2009; McDougall et al. 1981).

**Design and Participants**

In order to further evaluate the efficacy of an organization’s green IMC, a repeated-measures, one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) was conducted. This type of research design measures the participants more than once (e.g., longitudinally) on a particular variable. In this study, participants’ actual electricity consumption for two time periods was considered. Specifically, participants were instructed to complete an anonymous survey in which they are to record their monthly electricity usage in kilowatt hours for the current month \(t_2\) and for the same month, a year prior \(t_1\). In addition, participants were asked about their knowledge of their electricity company’s green IMC. In particular, respondents were asked if their electric company had a pro-environmental program. This process creates a naturally occurring variable, which is named “program.” In the event of statistically significant results for the “program” variable, the findings would suggest that there are differences in consumption between participants who are aware and those who are unaware that their service provider has adopted a green IMC.

With regards to the sampling procedure, trained student assistants recruited 278 electricity consumers to participate in the study. More specifically, students were offered extra-credit in a marketing course at a large southeastern university for recruiting survey respondents. The students were given specific instructions about the survey protocol and were closely supervised by faculty members and a PhD candidate throughout the process. In particular, participants’ gender and age were controlled for via a quota sampling procedure, with a goal of matching the sample’s demographics with those of the local population. Furthermore, 38 responses were eliminated due to participants answering imbedded quality assurance questions, resulting in 240 usable surveys. Forty-two percent of the participants were males, 87% were Caucasian, 2.9% were African American, 2.5% were Latino, less than 1% were Asian, less than 1% were Native American, and 1.7% reported themselves as “Other.” Twenty-four percent were 18-24 years old, 2.9% were 25-31, 2.5% were 32-38, 10.5% were 39 to 45, 30.5% were 46 to 52, 15.1% were 53 to 59, 7.1% were 60 to 66, 2.9% were 67 to 73, and 5% were 74 years of age and older.

**Results**

A 2 (monthly electric consumption in kilowatt hours) X 2 (participant supplied experimental factors—awareness of the existence of the demarketing campaign) repeated-measures, ANOVA was conducted. Here, the two objectively measured consumption factors represented the within-subjects variables, while the experimental factors served as the between-subjects variables. The results suggest that the change in electricity usage over time is associated with the company’s green IMC \(F(1, 59) = 5.629, p < .05, \eta_p^2 = .087\). More specifically, the change in mean electricity consumption for participants who knew that their electric company had a program is significantly lower than that of participants who were unaware of its existence (Mean usage \(t_1\) = 1518.64 kilowatt hours and Mean usage \(t_2\) = 1559.72 kilowatt hours—a 2.7 percent increase—versus Mean usage \(t_1\) = 2039.36 kilowatt hours and Mean usage \(t_2\) = 2734.64 kilowatt hours—a 34.1 percent increase). Additionally, the results suggest that 8.7 percent of the variance in change in consumption is explained by participants’ awareness of the program’s existence.

**Discussion**

The research presented contributes to our understanding of demarketing campaign adoption in several ways. First, it contributes to theory by using the S-O-R paradigm to advance knowledge on demarketing campaigns by examining the effects of a green IMC on consumers’ choice related processes and responses (Lii and Lee 2012). This research also contributes to practice in that it indicates that demarketing campaigns can be influential in shaping behaviors in such a way that they encourage consumer wellbeing, while positively positioning the organization in consumers’ minds, thus demonstrating their value as long-term investments. The following discussion describes each contribution in turn.

The present research contributes to a growing body of research that leverages the S-O-R paradigm, as it explores demarketing’s potential impact as an exogenous factor and confirms several nomologically valid relationships between it and a series of related factors. In study one, a firm adopt-
ing a demarketing campaign that features a pro-environmental stance was shown to impact consumer choice related processes, expanding on what is currently known about demarketing within this context. The results also suggest that a green IMC influences consumer perceptions in a positive way. Whereas previous research suggests that consumer choice related processes—such as positive attitudes towards the organization—are affected by an IMC, the second study enhances our understanding of the mechanisms through which actual behaviors are influenced. Taken collectively, the findings provide support for the idea that the relationship between demarketing campaign implementation and actual behaviors is mediated by consumer impressions of, and attitudes towards, the organization, thus paving the way for future investigations.

The present research also suggests that consumers’ attitudes towards, and impressions of, the enacting organization are positively affected by such efforts. In particular, the results from study one point to an increase in consumers’ perceptions of socially responsible organizations’ trustworthiness, sensitivity to the demands of the marketplace, and sense of environmental concern. This finding is particularly noteworthy, as it suggests that demarketing campaign implementation enables organizations to better position themselves in consumers’ minds. Thus, organizations can reap additional benefits through enactment, while benefiting society.

Additionally, the research presented implies that consumers’ awareness of demarketing campaigns affects their behavioral responses. In particular, the findings from study two indicate that when consumers are aware of the existence of an organization’s demarketing campaign, they tend to alter their normal consumption practices. Specifically, the rate of increase in electricity usage for those who were conscious of the electricity company’s green IMC was significantly less than that of those who were unaware. This finding, ultimately, suggests that demarketing campaigns may be effective at shaping actual behaviors—and, in this case, transforming the consumption patterns of a commodity with high demand inelasticity. Since this finding provides support for demarketing campaign efficacy, it suggests that their usage may reduce the growth rate of any number of potentially damaging consumption practices. As such, demarketing campaigns can work to improve people’s lives (Andrews et al. 2004).

**Conclusions, Limitations, and Research Extensions**

The research presented adds to the growing body of literature on demarketing campaigns by examining the linkages between their implementation and subsequent consumer responses. More specifically, two studies provide support for the effectiveness of a demarketing campaign as a method for improving perceptions of the organization, setting the stage for positive subsequent behavioral reactions. The findings also lend credence to the notion that a demarketing campaign may influence the consumption of a highly-valued and non-substitutable commodity. These findings are relevant to both marketing scholars and managers in that they enlarge the field’s understanding of demarketing as a theoretical construct, while providing evidence of its power to shape consumers’ attitudes towards the organization, as well as its behaviors.

While the research presented makes the aforementioned contributions, it is not without limitations. For example, whereas previous research suggests that student samples are appropriate for research endeavors that focus on internal validity (Calder, Phillips, and Tybout 1981), some readers may take issue with results’ external validity. Since study one’s contribution lies in testing the effects of a particular treatment—a green IMC—on consumers’ perceptions and since the students in the sample each receive a monthly utility bill, this concern may not be applicable. Nonetheless, this limitation should be noted and future confirmatory research conducted with a more generalizable sample. Also consider that while study one indicates that consumers respond positively to organizations’ demarketing campaigns, this finding may be limited in that the experimental stimulus represents only one component of a green IMC. Therefore, this finding calls for future research that tests other IMC components, such as green ads, green alliances, and the like (Lafferty and Goldsmith 2005).

In addition, while study two contributes to the field’s understanding of demarketing campaign implementation through the development of unique dataset featuring objective data in a longitudinal design, it also has limitations that should be addressed. In particular, while the experiment uses actual consumption data that were harvested from participants’ monthly utility bills and although it provides support for the hypothesis that a green IMC may affect consumers’ actual consumption behaviors, these results may be biased as a large percentage of the participants (61) did not answer the question capturing their awareness of the green IMC. For this reason, the results should be used with caution. Moreover, although the results supported the power of a demarketing campaign in this particular context, additional confirmatory research should test these effects across several different contexts. Such extension efforts could provide additional support for demarketing campaign implementation.
Appendix

Survey Items

Trust (adapted from Morgan and Hunt 1994)
1. This company cannot be trusted at times. (reverse coded)
2. This company can be counted on to do what’s right.
3. This company has high integrity.

Market Orientation (adapted from Webb, Webster, and, Krepapa 2000)
1. This company understands customers’ needs better than its competitors do.
2. This company creates value for customers.
3. This company responds to customer requests.
4. This company responds more rapidly to competitors’ actions than their competitors.
5. They understand their industry.

Environmental responsiveness (adapted from Cude 1993)
1. This company’s actions help reduce the harm done to the environment.
2. This company’s practices pollution controlling measures.
3. This company truly is concerned about the environment.
4. This company is more concerned about sustainability issues than its competitors.
5. One of this company’s main goals is to fix the environmental problem.

References

Miklós-Thal, Jeannie and Juan Zhang (2013), “(De)marketing to Manage Consumer Quality Inferences,” Journal of Marketing Research, 50 (February), 55-69.
Unpacking Co-Creation in a Smokefree Program: A Service Perspective

Nadina R. Luca, University of York

Keywords: social marketing, co-creation, smoking, service, stakeholder engagement

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
1. What are the factors influencing co-creation in a social marketing smoke-free homes and cars initiative?

2. How can actor engagement and co-creation practices contribute to capacity building in a health social marketing program?

Methods and Data
The study adopts a case study approach to investigate co-creation in a smoke-free homes and cars initiative in a city in England. It draws upon interviews with staff and service users engaged in the Smokefree program, field observation and document analysis. The data collection involved 45 participants. The study includes 45 semi-structured interviews with participants from the main stakeholder groups involved in the program (STOP staff; Children’s Centre staff, including family support officers, receptionists, managers, child-care teachers, play leaders; health visitors; midwives; community health development coordinators; and members of the public). The data are analyzed using a thematic analysis framework (Miles and Huberman 1994).

Summary of Findings
Adopting a co-creation approach to developing and implementing a health social marketing program requires understanding actors’ roles, practices and relationships within networks in order to facilitate actor engagement with the program. The findings suggest that structures such as networks, roles and practices may both, facilitate and constrain choices and action. The study identifies management support, providing feedback and learning as central processes facilitating co-creation. The “interaction-information-empower” approach espoused by the majority of the staff actors involved in the Smokefree network suggests that by adding the interaction element the program goes a step further than traditional programs centered on providing information only. This study supports existing literature that sustainability of health programs requires long-term planning, management support and on-going resources. In addition, this study highlights that sustainable health programs require a design that enables integration within existing structures and the capacity to do so. The study also reveals that the fluidity of actor priorities and policy changes have an impact on actor engagement with Smokefree. It indicates that the collaborative model centered on interaction contributed to staff capacity building to address smoking related issues.

Key Contributions
The study contributes an empirically informed account of co-creation as a network based process in a social marketing service context which has been less explored in the literature. It contributes to understanding the value creation processes in a social marketing context with a focus on the midstream level of collaborating staff and their interactions with final users. It is one of the few studies to apply service concepts to social marketing within the efforts to explore novel frameworks for understanding collaboration processes and support multi-level action for change.

References are available on request.

For further information contact: Nadina R. Luca, Lecturer/Assistant Professor in Marketing, University of York (nadina.luca@york.ac.uk).
Predictors of Effectiveness of Public Service Announcements (PSAs): A Systematic Analysis of Campaigns

Aysha Keisler, Ipsos Public Affairs

ABSTRACT
Public service announcements (PSAs) are unpaid messages disseminated over a variety of media to raise awareness and shape attitudes and behaviors regarding health, social, or other issues. Research on communication, psychology, and advertising is frequently applied to PSA development to optimize effectiveness. Although the approach of a given PSA campaign will vary by the message goals, findings from systematic manipulations of campaign features can guide development. For instance, the use of gain-framed or loss-framed arguments (Siu, 2010) and emotional appeal (Fishbein, Hall-Jamieson, Zimmer, Von Haeften, and Nabi 2002; Myrick and Oliver 2015; Paek, Hove, Kim, and Jeong 2011) have been shown to impact the perceived effectiveness of PSAs. Demographic characteristics of the target audience may also moderate message effectiveness (Boyle et al. 2014; Weber, Huskey, Mangus, Westcott-Baker, and Turner 2015). However, little is known about factors that predict success in PSAs, likely because of the heterogeneity in real world messaging: topics, message frequency, and the quality of the media content vary considerably between campaigns.

Keywords: public service announcement

Methods
We examined a large database of PSA outcomes data to understand factors that contribute to campaign effectiveness. The dataset consisted of survey data regarding over 35 unique national campaigns. The campaigns pertained to a variety of topics, including environmental, parenting, health, safety, and other issues. The goals of the campaign varied as well. While some encouraged a specific behavior, others aimed to raise awareness of an issue. Each campaign was disseminated via a combination of television, radio, print, web, and “out of home” (e.g., ads at bus stops) ads.

The campaigns were coded on a set of predictor variables: media budget; tone of the ad (funny/serious); presence of a celebrity endorsement; the number of unique ads associated with the campaigns; metrics related to ad distribution; target audience (parents/kids/general population); the difficulty of the campaign “ask” (assigned by coders; for instance, tobacco cessation would be considered more difficult than recycling); the type of issue (health, environmental, safety, etc.).

National survey data was collected for each campaign to assess effectiveness. Although the surveys were customized for each campaign, the surveys followed a common format, allowing cross-campaign comparison of outcomes. Surveys included assessments of attitudes (e.g., perceptions towards the target issue), key outcomes (e.g., engagement in the target behavior), ad recognition, and a variety of demographic and psycho-social factors. External data was also included in the dataset, including the degree of “buzz” associated with the campaign topic (assessed by Google metadata on key terms related to the campaign); web traffic for a website associated with the campaign; a metric of ad play volume (e.g., frequency that TV and radio ads were played). A variable was created for each campaign to indicate campaign effectiveness (e.g., the percentage of respondents who quit smoking, began recycling, or were aware of a health recommendation).

The sample size and field period varied between campaigns. For some campaigns, surveys were fielded in two waves, separated by several months. For others, surveys were fielded continuously for over a year. Most campaigns included a “pre” and “post” period of data collection, wherein surveys were fielded before and after the launch of the campaign media.

For further information contact: Aysha Keisler, Ipsos Public Affairs (aysha.keisler@ipsos.com).
Results
The data were analyzed using hierarchical modeling (SAS PROC MIXED) to account for both within- and between-campaign differences. We examined the degree to which campaign features predicted campaign success. We also examined the time course of campaign impact, including an investigation of cycles in the target outcomes (e.g., over the course of the year).

On aggregate, the campaigns imparted a positive effect on the target behaviors and attitudes. As would be expected, campaign effectiveness varied considerably between campaigns. Campaigns with a high degree of “buzz” tend to be more recognized by respondents (Figure 1). Campaigns that target parents (as opposed to kids or the general population) were also associated with greater incidence of the target behavior/attitude (Figure 2), although this effect may be independent of the campaign; in other words, parents may be “better behaved” than the general population in terms of the issues assessed in the current study. Campaigns that target children may be more effective. Interestingly, the cost of ad development had little predictive power on the effectiveness

![Figure 1](image1.png)

**Figure 1.** Ad recognition as a function of the level of “buzz” surrounding the campaign issue, as determined by Google metadata.

![Figure 2](image2.png)

**Figure 2.** Proportion of campaign “conversion,” a measure of campaign effectiveness. Conversion is defined for each campaign depending on behavior, attitude, or knowledge targeted by the PSA. For instance, conversion may be defined as tobacco cessation or awareness of a health guideline.
of the campaign. No systematic effects were identified regarding the type of PSA issue (health, safety, etc.).

**Discussion**

The current dataset offers a unique opportunity to compare a large body of diverse PSAs to understand factors that support campaign effectiveness. By examining a common metric of campaign effectiveness, we could examine the degree to which key PSA features predict effectiveness. Our analyses indicate that the target audience may play a crucial role in campaign effectiveness, consistent with research on the effectiveness of tailored communications (Kreuter and Wray 2003; Rimer and Kreuter 2006). PSAs concerning topics with a high degree of “buzz” were more likely to be recognized by respondents. Possibly, consumers attend more to PSAs that touch on highly salient topics. The current findings may aid PSA developers and other social marketers in developing optimally effective campaigns.

**References**


---

**Figure 3.** Ad recognition as a function of ad cost. The cost of the media associated with the campaign (TV, radio, web ads, etc.) had little predictive power on ad recognition.
Trait Transference: Inferring Product Traits from Environmentally Conscious Packages

Jessica Rixom, Florida International University
Debra L. Scammon, University of Utah

Keywords: packaging, trait transfer, environmental conscious, green marketing, sustainability

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
Environmentally conscious packaging (e.g., plant-based material, recycled plastic material, recycled paper fibers) is widely available in the marketplace. The use of such packaging is independent of the environmental consciousness of the products contained within the package and should have no impact on how the product is viewed. However, reliance on package-related information to infer product-related information could lead consumers to infer that products with environmentally conscious packaging are more environmentally conscious than they are in reality. In this research, we first consider consumers’ inferences related to products contained within environmentally conscious relative to standard, non-environmentally conscious packaging materials. Then, we assess whether the relationship between the packaging’s environmental consciousness and the consumer’s product-related inferences are mediated by perceptions that the identity of the product overlaps or is entwined with the identity of the package. Finally, we explore whether reminding consumers that marketing managers make decisions that influence consumers’ perceptions will attenuate the effect.

Method and Data
Three experimental studies were conducted with participants randomly assigned to see packaging made of environmentally conscious or standard materials with a chart supporting the claim. Study 1 participants evaluated car wash cleaner. After seeing the image and chart, participants rated the product’s gentleness (Luchs et al. 2010) and environmental consciousness. Study 2 participants evaluated baby shampoo. After seeing the image and chart, participants indicated perceived overlap between the package’s identity and product’s identity and then rated the product’s environmental consciousness. Study 3 participants first read a brief overview of marketing managers’ job responsibilities. The readings explained either that marketing managers make decisions that vary based on company needs or that marketing managers influence perceptions through decisions related (e.g., ingredients) or unrelated (e.g., package size) to the product. Following the reading, participants saw an image and chart related to bug spray and then evaluated the product’s environmental consciousness.

Summary of Findings
Across studies, we find that consumers infer that products are more environmentally conscious when the packaging uses environmentally conscious materials rather than standard, non-environmentally conscious materials. Results of study 1 also show that consumers not only view the product (car wash liquid) as more environmentally conscious, but also as gentler compared to products with standard, non-environmentally conscious packaging. Study 2 demonstrates that this tendency to transfer the packaging’s environmentally conscious traits to the product inside is mediated by consumer’s perceptions that the package’s identity and the product’s identity are overlapped or entwined. While the first two studies demonstrate consumers’ tendency to transfer a package’s environmentally conscious traits to the actual product, in study 3, the effect is attenuated by reminding consumers that marketing managers make decisions that can affect consumers’ perceptions. When consumers receive this reminder, perceptions of the product’s (bug spray) environmentally conscious traits are lower than when consumers do not receive this reminder.

For further information contact: Jessica Rixom, Assistant Professor, Florida International University (jrixom@fiu.edu).
Key Contributions
The current research adds to the growing knowledge of packaging’s influence on consumers’ product-related inferences. It does this by showing that consumers infer a product’s environmentally conscious traits from the package’s traits. This research also suggests that a perceptual overlap between package and product identities acts as a mechanism to explain this trait transference tendency. The findings also demonstrate that consumers infer that products are more environmentally conscious when the packaging uses environmentally conscious rather than standard, non-environmentally conscious materials. This provides companies an incentive to use environmentally conscious packaging but may simultaneously reduce the incentive to develop products that actually are environmentally conscious. We also find that consumers infer that products with environmentally conscious packages are gentler relative to when standard packaging is used. This may lead some companies to use and emphasize the use of environmentally conscious packaging to encourage gentleness perceptions when gentleness is a desirable product attribute but to avoid such use when strength is a desired product attribute.

References are available on request.
A Tale of Two Goods, Green Versus Non-Green: The Effects of Apathy and Myopia on Purchase Intentions

Ayşen Coşkun, Akdeniz University
Andrea Vocino, Deakin University
Michael Polonsky, Deakin University

Keywords: green behavior, apathy, myopia low involvement, developing country

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
How do impediments of pro-environmental behavior (myopia and environmental apathy) along with environmental locus of control affect environmental attitudes and purchase intentions for a low involvement product with varying perceived environmental impact in a developing country context (Turkey)?

Method and Data
We collected the data with a questionnaire designed with contracts those are based on validated scales in previous studies from a Turkish commercial online panel. A total of 679 usable respondents (339 for the rechargeable batteries and 340 for disposable batteries) were acquired. We chose batteries (disposable and rechargeable) as the low involvement product with varying perceived environmental impact, which, we validated the difference of perceived environmental impacts through pre-test. We analyzed the data with exploratory factor analysis using maximum likelihood with direct oblimin rotation. Following, we conducted confirmatory factor analysis to assess the measurement models, construct validity and reliability. Finally, we used structural equation modeling to display cause and affect relationships in the research model. Additionally, we tested hypothesized moderation effects to determine whether the battery type (disposable vs. rechargeable) affected the relationships with structural equation modeling.

Summary of Findings
We found that environmental apathy had significant effects on the hypothesized relationships in disposable batteries context, while it partially affected the hypothesized relationships in rechargeable batteries context. We also supported the hypothesis that myopia had an impact on internal locus of control in both contexts. Additionally, locus of control constructs had a partial significant effect on attitudes and intentions since we analyzed two low involvement products to test the hypothesized relationships. Attitudes found to affect intentions in both contexts. Finally, we found that moderation effects were held in six of ten relationships that indicated that the type of low involvement (environmentally friendly vs. non-environmentally friendly) played a role in consumers’ decision making.

Key Contributions
We found significant effects of environmental apathy and myopia, which were evaluated as impediments of pro-environmental behavior, on consumer decision making in regards to purchase intentions for low involvement goods. The results suggested that negative factors impede consumers evaluating the environmental components in routine low-involvement decisions. Possibly what is equally interesting is that these were all supported within the context of the “traditional” disposable battery context. This is important given many low involvement goods presently do not use environmental appeals and thus negative consumer factors (i.e. apathy and myopia). This suggests these negative factors impede consumers evaluating the environmental components in routine low involvement decisions.

References are available on request.

For further information contact: Ayşen Coşkun, Department of Marketing, Akdeniz University (aysencoskun@akdeniz.edu.tr).
How Can Policy Makers Efficiently Incentivize the Adoption of Solar Panels?

Hossein Eslami, Lebanese American University

Keywords: renewable energy, diffusion, incentive policy, policy instruments, word of mouth, investment in new technology

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
Policy makers have used variety of incentive schemes to promote the adoption of renewable energy. So far, there has been no consensus as what would be the most efficient incentive policy (or mixture of policies) to maximize the diffusion of renewable energy.

Method and Data
I propose a model to capture the solar panels adoption decision by households using the choice modeling framework. The model is estimated using a household-level solar panel adoption data from Germany.

Key Contributions
The proposed model shed light on the underlying adoption mechanisms in the solar panel market. The model captures the investment aspect of solar panels adoption. The framework allows running policy experiments on how three incentive policy instruments (i.e. seeding, subsidy, and feed-in tariff) accelerate the diffusion of solar panels. The insights would have implications for policy makers in the renewable energy field.

Summary of Findings
On average households have negative perception on the performance of solar panels; this can be true for all the new technologies in their initial diffusion phases.

The financial aspects (i.e. future savings and revenues from investment in solar panels) of the investment moderate the negative view.

As more households adopt the solar panels, the probability of adoption by non-adopters increases due to the positive word of mouth.

Word of mouth can be an important leverage in designing the incentive policies by policy makers in the renewable energy field.

References are available on request.
“Do as I Do”: Effect of Descriptive Social Norm and Endorsement on Ad Credibility and Intention to Purchase Non-Overpackaged Products

Elgaaied Leila, University of Cergy-Pontoise–Thema (UMR CNRS 8184)
Monnot Elisa, University of Cergy-Pontoise–Thema (UMR CNRS 8184)
Reniou Fanny, University of Paris-Est Créteil–IRG (EA 2354)

Keywords: overpackaging, social norms, ad credibility, endorsement, green purchasing

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
The purpose of this research is to provide further insights regarding the conditions under which social norms are likely to stimulate pro-environmental behaviors. Social norms have indeed been acknowledged to influence consumer behavior in general and green behavior in particular (e.g. Melnyk et al. 2011; 2013). However, in order to reach optimal effects, public service advertising should activate both facets of social norms, namely injunctive and descriptive norms, referring respectively to what most people approve of and to what people typically do (Cialdini, Reno, and Kallgren 1990). While injunctive norms are usually well understood and used appropriately, descriptive norms are sometimes activated inadequately which may lead to counter-productive effects.

Based on the observation that descriptive norms can only result in beneficial behavior when they are framed positively (Cialdini 2003), our research raises the question of the efficiency of such norms in a context where the prevalent behavior is not environmentally friendly. Our research question is the following: How should public policy makers promote environmentally beneficial behavior using descriptive social norms when environmentally harmful behavior is actually prevalent among the population?

Method and Data
Three experiments were conducted (n = 145; n = 173; n = 159). For the purpose of this research, we chose to focus on a specific pro-environmental behavior: purchasing of non-overpackaged products. Using an infomercial we manipulated: (1) the presence (vs. absence) of a descriptive social norm and its valence (positive vs. negative); (2) the presence (vs. absence) of an endorser and his/her similarity (vs. dissimilarity) with the receiver in terms of age; (3) the type of endorser (celebrity vs. typical-consumer) and his/her connection (vs. no connection) to environmental causes.

Summary of Findings
Study 1 showed that the presence of a descriptive norm influences intention to purchase non-overpackaged products indirectly, through ad credibility. This process is moderated by the valence of the descriptive norm. Study 2 and 3 sought to go further by identifying relevant execution techniques that might positively affect ad credibility while still focusing on a positive descriptive norm. Study 2 showed that the presence of an endorser influences intention directly and that the profile of the endorser (similar vs. dissimilar to the target in terms of age) indirectly influences intention through an identification process. Finally, Study 3 showed that celebrity endorsement in itself is neither a significant predictor of ad credibility nor of behavioral intention while the profile of the celebrity does affect ad credibility.

Key Contributions
Our research provides insights into how descriptive norms should be used to promote pro-environmental practices in a context where the prevalent behavior is not environmentally friendly. Our second contribution lies in the evaluation of the
impact of social norms on ad credibility. Finally, our research also highlights effective endorsement practices to foster green purchasing behavior.

From a practical viewpoint, this research holds important implications since public service ads tend to activate descriptive norms inappropriately when the prevalent behavior among the population is environmentally unfriendly. Our findings suggest that triggering a positive descriptive norm might result in the adoption of pro-environmental behavior, even though it does not entirely reflect reality, provided that the ad is perceived as credible.

References are available on request.
When Pay Does and Doesn’t Matter: How Employee Compensation Affects Consumer Perceptions of Firms

Nora Moran, California State University, Northridge

ABSTRACT

Stagnation of wages, particularly at the low end of the pay scale, is a problem affecting millions of Americans. However, little research has addressed this issue from a consumer behavior perspective, to determine if willingness to purchase from firms is affected by knowledge about their compensation practices, particularly towards their lower-level employees. In this research, I investigate whether providing information on employee compensation increases affects consumers’ willingness to shop at retailers, and also how this willingness may be affected by the store’s reputation for service. I show that providing information on compensation increases can have a positive effect on willingness to shop at retailers, but more so when stores are already known for high quality (vs. average) service. Moreover, I show this occurs not because individuals have higher service expectations, but because they consider compensation procedures to be more (vs. less) fair. In addition, I show it is possible to reverse these effects by making the procedures used to determine compensation appear more or less fair.

Keywords: corporate social responsibility, wage stagnation, wage inequality, poverty, services research

The lack of promising economic opportunities available today is an issue of growing national concern. A particularly acute issue is the low rate of economic mobility for the many Americans in lower-income brackets, who have limited access to high paying jobs, and as such little opportunity to attain economic security (Chetty et al. 2014). Although researchers have noted that this predicament threatens the welfare of the entire economy (Piketty 2014), little progress has been made to address the issue on a broader level.

Given that wage stagnation is often noted as an impediment to economic mobility (Damon 2014), many have argued that increasing wages is a practical way to combat this problem (Neumark and Wascher 2002). Protests among workers across the country have increased attention towards this remedy, and a few local governments have responded by proposing mandatory increases to the minimum wage (Hirsh 2015). In addition, several corporations have addressed the issue directly, with certain retail firms indicating plans to increase compensation for employees in the coming years (Greenhouse 2014, Ramakrishnan 2015).

Despite the attention surrounding this issue, little research has examined this topic from a consumer behavior perspective. That is, while research has examined attitudes towards such subjects as wage inequality, we have limited insight into how consumer buying behavior might be affected, and if individuals will be more willing to patron a store when it makes a move to increase employee pay. In this research, I use a service context to investigate how providing information on salary increases for lower-level employees affects willingness to shop at retailers, and how this willingness to shop may interact with the store’s reputation for service. I show that providing this information can have a positive effect on willingness to shop, but more so when a store is already known for high quality (vs. average) service. Moreover, I demonstrate that this occurs not because individuals feel that they will have better experiences at these stores (service expectations are higher), but because individuals consider procedures determining compensation for workers to be more fair (perceptions of procedural justice are higher). I also show that it is possible to alter these results (decrease willingness to shop at stores with high quality service, and increase willingness to shop at stores with average service) by making the procedures used to determine compensation appear more or less fair.

In all, this work enhances understanding of how company actions to increase compensation affects consumer attitudes

For further information contact: Nora Moran, California State University, Northridge (nora.e.moran@gmail.com).
and behavior. Moreover, my findings show that for this particular issue, consumer perceptions are mainly driven by concerns about fairness of compensation practices. As such, this work provides practical advice for service firms, as well as for policy makers looking to create support for such initiatives. I conclude by discussing additional implications as well as directions for future research.

**Theoretical Background**

Many researchers have acknowledged the absence of promising employment opportunities in the United States today, and it has been well-noted that the majority of job opportunities available are often low paying. For instance, since the most recent recession there has been a dramatic increase in the number of Americans employed in low level service industry positions, which seldom provide a living wage (Damon 2014, Plumer 2013). Moreover, many service and retail firms have received criticism in recent years for failing to increasing wages more substantially, despite the fact that doing so is often considered economically feasible (Garofalo 2013).

However, it is important to note that we have little insight into whether such actions would have any benefit to firms. More specifically, we do not know if moves to increase lower-level employee wages would positively affect consumer buying intentions, or if such actions would have a more beneficial effect for some companies versus others. On the one hand, much research has indicated that firms implementing corporate social responsibility initiatives do reap financial benefits (Luo and Bhattacharya 2006). Moreover, if providing higher compensation for employees is considered desirable by many (i.e. providing a higher wages is considered a desirable social outcome) we could expect that this action would lead to enhanced consumer perceptions. Still, much research on the impact of CSR suggests that factors relating to the firm (Sen and Bhattacharya 2006) and to the consumer (Mohr, Webb, and Harris 2001) can affect whether such activities are received positively. In addition, since little research has examined how customers feel about this practice, there is little certainty as to how they might react.

It is also possible, given the nature of this issue, that a move to increase wages could be interpreted in different ways. For one, this issue could be considered unique because the social benefit provided can also lead to direct benefits for the consumer. That is, providing raises to employees in a service-oriented businesses could lead consumers to infer that this move will provide them with a better service experience. In this way, helping employees could be seen as an added benefit, and overall firm perceptions should increase (Newman, Gorlin and Dhar 2014). If this is the case, we could expect positive effects to emerge regardless of service reputation, if individuals feel that providing increased compensation will lead to better service. It may even be expected that companies not necessarily known for high quality service could expect a greater benefit, if consumers feel their experience would be more noticeably improved as a result.

However, it is possible consumers could have different reactions. For one, some motivational theories suggest that compensation may not motivate better performance (Herzberg 1986), and as such consumers may not consider the benefits this action could have for themselves. Moreover, while individuals could feel that increased wages are a desirable outcome, in many contexts it is not the outcome itself (in this case, whether incomes are adequate) that affects subsequent judgments of firm action. Rather, the reasoning and decision making processes of firms, and whether these practices could be considered fair (ratings of procedural justice) can be as influential on attitudes as beliefs about outcome fairness (ratings of distributive justice; McFarlin and Sweeney 1992). If concerns about fairness of practices drive behavior, providing compensation increases may only increase perceptions in certain cases. For instance, we may not expect information on compensation increases to boost willingness to patron stores known for just average (vs. high quality) service. That is, while employees in high quality firms “should” get raises to reward good performance, it is less clear why employees from average quality firms would get a raise, and as such procedures behind this decision would be deemed less fair.

In this research, I examine whether service expectations, or concerns about fairness, drives willingness to shop at stores that increase compensation for their lower level service employees. Results of these studies show that customers tend to rate companies higher (indicate greater willingness to shop at and recommend stores) when procedures used to determine compensation are deemed fair. In study 1, I find that individuals are more willing to shop at stores that have reputations for high (vs. average) service, not because not because they feel the service will be better, but because they rate companies as having more just compensation practices (i.e. have higher perceptions of procedural justice). In study 2, I reverse the effect and show that when reasoning behind compensation decisions are seen as unfair for stores providing high quality service, individuals are less willing to shop at these stores. Finally, in study 3, I show that providing different kinds of compensation can increase willingness to recommend stores known for providing just average (vs. high quality) service.

**Study 1**

The purpose of study 1 is to test how individuals react to information regarding compensation increases, when the retailers are known for providing high quality (vs. average) service. In addition, I measure process variables to deter-
mine what drives behavioral intentions (willingness to shop at stores) when given this information about stores with varying reputations for service.

**Design and Procedure**

60 participants (43% female; M<sub>age</sub> = 35.40) from an online panel took part in the study for nominal payment. Participants were randomly assigned using a 2 Service Quality (High/Average) between subjects design. At the start of the survey, individuals were told that they would read an excerpt from a newspaper about a national retailer (which was remained nameless). It stated that some news had been released regarding this retailer, and that in the near future, salaries for its lower level employees would be increased. For the high quality service condition, individuals were told that the store was known for providing high quality service, while in the average service condition, individuals were told that the store was known for providing average service. Individuals were then asked to give their opinions on the store. Specifically, they were asked how willing they would be to shop at this store (1 = not at all/7 = very).

Following this, individuals were asked questions to determine rating of distributive justice: Do you think that the compensation for employees at this company is fair (1 = not at all/7 = definitely). In addition, individuals were asked questions to measure rating of procedural justice: Do you think the procedures the company uses to determine compensation for employees are fair (1 = not at all/7 = definitely). Finally, individuals were asked questions to measure service expectations: Would you expect that these employees will be more helpful to customers; would you expect that these employees will provide better service overall (1 = not at all/7 = definitely $\alpha = .92$).

**Results.** A one way ANOVA was run with willingness to shop as the dependent variable. Results revealed that individuals were more willing to shop at the store known for high quality service ($M_{high} = 5.65$ vs. $M_{average} = 4.73$; $F(1, 58) = 7.11, p = .01$). To examine process variables, separate one way ANOVAs were run with measures of distributive justice, procedural justice, and service quality as dependent variables. When looking at measures of procedural justice, participants rate this as higher for the high quality service condition ($M_{high} = 5.24$ vs. $M_{average} = 4.54$; $F(1, 58) = 3.97, p = .05$). However, no differences emerged for distributive justice ($M_{high} = 5.47$ vs. $M_{average} = 5.08$; $F(1, 58) = 1.25, p = .27$), or for expected service ($M_{high} = 5.41$ vs. $M_{average} = 5.87$; $F(1, 58) = 1.83, p = .18$).

I predicted a mediation model, wherein service quality increases perceptions of procedural justice, which in turn influences willingness to shop (using INDIRECT, Preacher and Hayes 2008). The indirect effect of service quality on willingness to shop (service quality $\rightarrow$ perceptions of procedural justice $\rightarrow$ willingness to shop) was positive and significant for perceptions of procedural justice (.33, 95% CI = .02 to 1.04).

**Discussion.** The results of Study 1 indicate that when looking at stores that have varying reputations for service quality, receiving information on raises for employees will increase willingness to shop at stores known for high quality service. Surprisingly, this does not occur because customers feel they will get a benefit from the raise—that is, service quality expectations are not higher for this condition. In addition, the fairness of the outcomes (whether compensation is considered adequate) does not vary by condition. Rather, it appears that concerns about procedural justice drive behavioral intentions.

**Study 2**

The purpose of the next study is to further determine whether willingness to shop at retailers increasing employee compensation depends on perceived fairness of compensation practices. The last study would suggest that consumers feel it is fair increase wages when it appears to be a way to reward higher performance, but less fair if performance is known to be just average, and that these perceptions drive willingness to patron stores. I test this idea more explicitly in the next study, by providing the reasons why companies provide raises. That is, instead of measuring perceptions of procedural justice as in the last study, in the current study I manipulate what moved the decision to increase wages, and make procedures appear more versus less fair for those employees at high quality service stores.

If individuals feel that the procedures and reasoning behind the raise are fair towards these employees, I expect that individuals will show an increased willingness to shop when the store is known for high quality (vs. just average) service. For instance, if it is known a company gives a raise specifically because it wanted to reward performance, I would expect that willingness to shop would be higher for the high quality (vs. average) service store, as the decision appears more fair in the high quality condition. However, if the procedures and reasoning for a raise seems unfair toward these employees, then I do not expect a difference to emerge in willingness to shop. That is, if it is known a company gives a raise to attract more competent workers and motivate performance, this would seem like a less fair procedure for a store already known for its high quality service. As such, one would not expect a boost in willingness to shop at these stores (compared to stores with just average service).

**Design and Procedure**

126 individuals (47.6% female; $M_{age} = 38.80$) from an online panel participated in the study for nominal payment.
Participants were randomly assigned using a 2 Service Quality (High/Average) x 2 Reasoning (Reward/Incentive) between subjects design. Individuals were provided with the same scenario as in study 1. However, they were also provided with additional information as to why the company decided to increase wages. In the reward condition, individuals were told that the company was making the decision to increase wages to reward employee performance. In contrast, individuals in the incentive condition were told that the company was making the decision to increase wages as a move to help motivate employees and also hire more qualified workers. Willingness to shop at the store (1 = not willing at all/7 = very) was used as the main dependent variable.

Results and Discussion

A 2 x 2 ANOVA was run with willingness to shop as the dependent variable. While no main effects were found, a significant interaction did emerge (F (1,122) = 4.27, p = .04). In the reward condition, willingness to shop was significantly higher in the high quality relative to the average service condition ($M_{\text{high}} = 5.68$ vs. $M_{\text{average}} = 4.70$; F (1,122) = 7.00, $p = .009$). In contrast, in the incentive condition, no significant differences in willingness to shop emerged based on reputation for service quality ($M_{\text{high}} = 5.00$ vs. $M_{\text{average}} = 5.14$; F (1,122) = .12, $p = .73$).

Discussion. This study provides further evidence that individuals are more willing to shop at stores increasing compensation for lower level employees, but only when the reasoning behind the compensation increase appears fair. Specifically, individuals show an increased willingness to shop at stores with high quality service reputations when raises are given as a reward, but not when given in order to motivate performance and hire more competent workers. Consistent with the first study, this shows that for the high quality service condition, the move to increase compensation itself does not drive willingness to shop as much as the reasoning behind the compensation decision. This study also makes it clear that service expectations do not drive these differences. That is, while results of the first study could lead one to conclude that individuals should be more willing to shop at stores known for better service, here we show that such differences only emerge when individuals feel that the compensation is enacted for proper reasons. Moreover, looking at the results for retailers with average quality, no differences emerge in willingness to shop based on reasoning for the raise. Thus, it appears that providing raises as a way to reward performance, or incentivize better performance, does not significantly increase willingness to shop at stores not necessarily known for their service.

Study 3

Study 2 affirms that individuals show an increased willingness to shop at stores providing raises to employees, but only when reasoning for the raises are considered fair. In addition, the results from the past study show that individuals do not feel monetary compensation is an appropriate way to motivate better performance in this context. Rather, increasing wages should serve as a way to reward performance. Thus, regardless of how such actions actually benefit employees, it appears that companies get a more substantial boost when their procedures for determining compensation appear fair.

One important question remaining is whether or not any action can make individuals more willing to shop at retailers improving employee compensation, even when retailers are not as well known for high quality service. One option may be to change the form of compensation. Past research has shown that giving individual employees money (vs. other types of non-exchangeable resources) could activate more concerns about fairness practices (Devoe and Iyengar 2010). Following from this, it could be seen as more fair to reward employees with non-monetary benefits (e.g. medical benefits, time off) since these could be considered both more necessary, but also more fair than arbitrarily giving monetary rewards. Thus, if employees receive increases in non-monetary (vs. monetary) compensation, we would expect that individuals would have more positive attitudes towards stores, regardless of their reputation for service.

Design and Procedure

130 individuals (49% female; $M_{\text{age}} = 21.01$) from a large public university participated in the study for course credit. Participants were randomly assigned using a 2 Service Quality (High/Average) x 2 Compensation Type (Money/Benefits) between subjects design. Individuals were presented with the same scenario as in study 1. However, in the benefits condition, individuals were told that in the near future, employees would be getting improved benefits packages (time off, improved medical benefits), while those in the money condition were told they would be getting their salaries increased (as in study 1 and 2). We then ask individuals how likely they would be to recommend this store to someone else (1 = not at all/7 = very).
the benefits condition, individuals were equally likely to recommend a store when it provided benefits versus salary increases ($M_{benefits} = 4.85$ vs. $M_{average} = 3.99$; $F (1,126) = 18.26, p < .001$). A significant interaction did also emerge ($F (1,126) = 19.09, p < .001$). We found that for the money condition, individuals indicated they were more likely to recommend the high quality service store, relative to the average quality store ($M_{high} = 4.70$ vs. $M_{average} = 3.27$; $F (1,126) = 24.92, p < .001$). However, for the benefits condition, individuals were equally likely to recommend either the high or average service stores ($M_{high} = 5.03$ vs. $M_{average} = 4.67$; $F (1,126) = 1.48, p = .23$).

Discussion. The results of this study show that it is possible to improve perceptions towards stores known for average service that increase compensation. By changing the type of compensation, individuals are as willing to recommend stores known for average service as they are for stores known for high quality service. This finding is consistent with the idea that individuals base their judgments of stores on their perceptions of procedural fairness—that is, individuals are not opposed to increasing compensation to employees, but procedures for determining appropriate compensation should be easily justified in order to positively affect their attitudes towards the store.

General Discussion

The stagnation of wages, particularly at the low end of the pay scale, is a problem affecting millions of Americans. One way to rectify this issue would be for firms increase compensation for their workers. A question that has not been addressed is how consumers might react to this—will they be more likely to buy from firms that increase compensation for low level employees? With more political attention being paid towards this issue, and more companies considering their options, it makes sense from both a policy and managerial perspective to consider how these initiatives affect consumer perceptions.

I find here that individuals are more (vs. less) willing to shop at stores providing raises, based on whether they have a reputation for high (vs. average) service quality. In addition, I find perceptions of procedural justice drive these judgments, and show how these effects can be reversed by making procedures appear more or less fair. This research has several important implications. For one, in advocating for these types of company actions, it appears that caution should be taken in how such moves are promoted. For one, it is possible that selling the need to increase employee compensation as “the right thing to do” for employees may not work for all companies. Rather, consumers need to be reassured that employees actually deserve the benefits they receive. As such, future research may explore how compensation increases can be framed so that different types of businesses can leverage these moves for their benefit.

This research also opens up some additional questions worth exploring. For one, it is interesting that consumers perceptions of fairness has this effect on their willingness to shop. This is a surprising finding, considering that whether or not a company makes decisions fairly regarding their employees does not directly affect consumers. It would be interesting to explore this more in depth to see why consumer perceptions of fairness play such a prominent role here. Finally, this research was limited to a service context, and examined mainly how service reputation affects willingness to shop at stores positioned to increase compensation. In the future, it would be helpful to examine other relevant factors that could play a part in how people judge firms that make such compensation changes. For example, would providing more details on the broader economic context change whether or not a raise would be considered fair? In all, it appears that much future research on this topic is needed in order to get consumers to fully support the movement to increase wages.

References


Serving Two Masters: Can a Firm Care About People and the Planet at the Same Time?

Colin Gabler, Ohio University
V. Myles Landers, Rochester Institute of Technology

Keywords: pro-social identity, environmental strategy focus, stakeholder theory, triple bottom line, strategic alignment

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
Our question is simple: can firms satisfy multiple stakeholders simultaneously? Specifically, we examine if firms can be both environmentally and socially conscious at the same time or if emphasis on one begins to detract from the other’s objectives.

Method and Data
We collect survey data from 246 managers across 14 industries and use Structural Equation Modeling to test our hypotheses. We first analyze the linear effects model and then add the interaction term to examine the interactive effects of our focal variables.

Summary of Findings
We find that when organizations are perceived as caring about human stakeholders other than shareholders, those organizations create a positive impact in the life of the general public. This social benefit then translates to performance outcomes. Specifically, firms which create a positive pro-social impact also enjoy increases in market performance as well as the perceived quality of their offering. However, when firms add an environmental strategy to their existing pro-social agenda, it begins to detract from their social outcomes, and consequently, these performance measures.

Key Contributions
We contribute to theory by extending the discussion on stakeholder theory from a firm-centric to a societal-centric perspective. Further, we utilize strategic alignment logic to demonstrate the dilemma that manifests when firms attempt to be simultaneously socially- and environmentally-oriented. From a managerial perspective, firms have a limited number of resources. We provide evidence that in order to optimize these inherent constraints, managers must make decisions about company culture and strategic direction. If no clear strategy is in place, firms run the risk of trying to do too much at the expense of performance outcomes.

References are available on request.

For further information contact: Colin Gabler, Freeman Fellow of Marketing, Ohio University College of Business (gabler@ohio.edu).
Investigating Consumer Responses to Nonprofit Overhead Costs

Skyler King, Washington State University
Richie Liu, Oklahoma State University
Mark Mulder, Pacific Lutheran University

Keywords: nonprofit, overhead, self-determination theory, donations

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Nonprofit spending has been under close examination by many policy makers. Of particular interest to policy makers is the amount of money spent on overhead costs. Many donors are skeptical of donating to a nonprofit organization with a relatively high amount of money allocated to overhead. Because of donor concerns with how money is being utilized, nonprofit organizations face a dilemma of spending less on overhead (i.e., potentially supporting fewer innovative programs) versus spending more on overhead (i.e., potentially losing individual donations because of consumer perceptions). The present research seeks to understand consumer responses to increasing levels of overhead and explores corresponding emotions and projections about the motive of the nonprofit. Additionally, this research seeks to identify some underlying mechanisms at work in the consumer response. Higher overhead levels were found to be associated with decreases in impact, control, and felt connection.

Research Question
This paper seeks to understand how consumers respond to a range of overhead levels and the underlying mechanisms at work.

Method and Data
This paper uses a randomized design in an experimental method through multiple online panels of consumers.

Summary of Findings
This paper shows that consumers have negative emotions and perceptions of nonprofits that allocate higher percentages of donations to cover overhead expenses. This paper also shows that Self-Determination Theory is a theoretical lens through which the underlying mechanisms of the consumer response to overhead expenses can be understood. Specifically, the three components of Self-Determination Theory all mediate the relationship between overhead percent allocations and attitude toward the nonprofit organization, feeling about the donation, motives of the nonprofit organization, and the likelihood to donate to the same nonprofit organization in the future.

Key Contributions
This paper shows that consumers have consistent negative responses to higher levels of overhead. This knowledge is of value to policy makers considering legislation (i.e., Oregon Legislature’s consideration of a maximum overhead level). Further, this paper shows that Self-Determination Theory is a theoretical lens through which the underlying mechanisms of the consumer response to overhead expenses can be understood. This knowledge will be of interest to nonprofits who may find themselves wondering how to frame innovative projects that require overhead levels.

References are available on request.
The Effects of Self-Transcendence Organizational Values on Customer Satisfaction and Corporate Reputation

Monique Bell, California State University, Fresno  
Pravin Nath, University of Oklahoma  
Hyokjin Kwak, Drexel University

Keywords: organizational values, stakeholder theory, customer satisfaction, reputation, content analysis

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
The study addresses three primary research questions. First, it explores whether human values frameworks, rather than existing organizational values frameworks, can be effectively applied to investigations of organizational value. Second, using a human values framework, the current study examines whether the organizational values a firm emphasizes affect marketing outcomes (i.e., customer satisfaction and corporate reputation). Third, in light of the contemporary focus on organizational “values” or “purpose,” the study evaluates whether the values an organization emphasizes inside the firm have an effect on stakeholders outside of the firm (e.g., customers, society-at-large).

Method and Data
The study uses correlation and regression analysis of secondary data to explore relationships between the organizational values of a firm and the dependent variables customer satisfaction, capability reputation, and character reputation. Organizational values were approximated using content analysis of annual CEO letters and Linguistic Inquiry Word Count (LIWC) software with a custom dictionary. Customer Satisfaction is measured using American Customer Satisfaction Index (ACSI), capability reputation is measured with Fortune’s Most Admired scores, and character reputation is measured with Janis-Fadner’s coefficient of media favorability. The sample includes more than 100 firms of various industries.

Key Contributions
The key contributions of the study include: (1) support for the use of Schwartz’s human values as a more effective framework for measuring organizational values than existing, management-based organizational frameworks; particularly as it relates to external stakeholders of import to marketing (e.g., customers, society); (2) statistically significant support for the hypothesized positive relationship between organizations emphasizing Self-Transcendence values and character reputation as measured by media favorability; and, (3) the development of a custom dictionary for use with the LIWC software to discern firms’ organizational values.

Summary of Findings
There is support for the hypothesized positive relationship between Self-Transcendence and character reputation ($r = .34, p < .01$). Openness to Change is also positively correlated with Character Reputation ($r = .33, p < .01$). There is no support for a significant positive relationship between Self-Transcendence and Customer Satisfaction, nor between Self-Enhancement and Capability Reputation, as hypothesized. Notably, there is a significant negative correlation between Self-Transcendence and Customer Satisfaction ($r = -.24, p < .05$). Conservation and Character Reputation are also negatively correlated. As expected, no significant correlations were found among the opposing values. These findings provide support for the hypothesized framework and the proposed content analysis methodology.

References are available on request.
Accompanying the Demand for Social Change in End of Life Care: A Qualitative Study Through the Lens of Physicians, Patients, and Relatives in France

Françoise A. Passerard, PSB Paris School of Business
Xavier Menaud, PSB Paris School of Business

ABSTRACT
Starting from the premise that “there is no collective ethics without roots in each person’s own ethics,” our research question focuses on the role of deontology and spirituality from the double need to act along one’s conscience and to build one’s fair conscience. In order to better understand those two distinct universes, this study focuses on the two major concepts of deontology and spirituality. The current research is contextualized in the field of public health and more specifically offers empirical insights from the specific case of physician assisted suicide in the context of end of life in France.

Keywords: health, death, assisted suicide, deontology, spirituality

Thanks to an exploratory qualitative study, we look at the issue of end of life care in the French context. We offer empirical insight from three profiles of respondents: physicians, patients and relatives. Our conceptual background relies on the notion of deontology and spirituality. Our main findings show a need for information and pedagogy towards those three populations.

Thinking end of life care requires to tackle and contextualize several concepts from the point of view of several protagonists who are concerned by this issue. While deontology and bioethics belong to the professionals, moral conscious and spirituality are transversal among all the profiles concerned by this issue: physicians, patients and relatives.

Starting from the premise that “there is no collective ethics without roots in each person’s own ethics” (Cordier, 2007), our research question focuses on the role of deontology and spirituality from the double need to act along one’s conscience and to build one’s fair conscience. Physicians, as individuals, have their own convictions, their own lived experiences and their own culture. Moral values, religion, faith and spirituality are not only individual but strongly private. Patients and their relatives, on their side, are knowledgeable about medical deontology but can only activate their own beliefs and thoughts. Sometimes, they have to face gaps between what physicians are expected to do and what they have to do.

Talking about spirituality amounts to taking up “a complex phenomenon, hardly palpable and multidimensional.” (Foucault et Mongeau, 2004, p. 200). Personal and private values coexist with institutional and public values. In order to better understand those two distinct universes, this study focuses on the two major concepts of deontology and spirituality that we define hereafter. The current research is contextualized in the field of public health and more specifically offers empirical insights from the specific case of physician assisted suicide (PAS) in the field of end of life in France.

Although PAS, also called medically assisted suicide, remains strongly taboo, a growing part of the French population declares to consider asking for euthanasia or PAS. Precisely, 58% expect a change in the French law in order to legalize both aids in dying. Among the category of people aged between 35 and 65, 67% are in favor of PAS. They see this solution not only as a way to die with dignity, but also as a right to choose one’s way of dying. The role of physicians remains quite complex in this context. Indeed, because

For further information contact: Françoise A. Passerard, PSB Paris School of Business (passerard.psb@gmail.com).
they took the Hippocratic Oath, devoting themselves to care and cure, they can hardly assimilate the idea of helping their patients die by giving them lethal medicines. The medical code of ethics is far from mentioning such requests. Moreover, PAS is commonly associated to the hope of a chosen and peaceful death, contrary to traditional religious values that tend to respect a form of uncertainty around death.

Conceptual Background

The context of public health in general, and end of life in particular, offers significant empirical insights due to its exemplarity that relates to several components of the field such as the Hippocratic Oath, the French Code of Medical Ethics, the Public Health Code and the French Medical Council. Moreover, the context of France is specifically meaningful since the country is known as the country of Human Rights. In addition to this institutional, legal and social framework, physicians and patients and relatives add their own private beliefs. Medicine has become “a multiple reality, a true total social fact, in which we find united a medical institution, a health economy, a care policy, biotechnologies and bioethical issues.” (Le Blanc, 2002, p.72)

We rely on the following definition of PAS: “In physician-assisted suicide, the patient self-administers medication that was prescribed intentionally by a physician.” (Onwuteaka-Philipsen, 2012, p. 908). The difference between PAS and euthanasia relies on who makes the gesture that will let death occur, whose hand acts. In the case of euthanasia, it is the physician who injects the lethal product. Hence, PAS corresponds to the four following descriptions: the patient must be diagnosed with a physical suffering and there is no chance that any improvement may occur in terms of curing and in terms of quality of life; the patient is the one who makes the decision, the medical team provides the patient with lethal products that will end the life of this patient; so the person who acts to lead to death is the patient.

Contemporary medicine relies on a trilogy made of the symptom, the diagnostic and the therapy. In the field of scientific medicine, technological innovations have increased tenfold the possibilities and pushed back the limits in terms of care and medical gestures. Because physicians have access to tremendous technical efficiency that, sometimes, convey the myth of almighty medical means.

Moral values and spirituality stand at the crossroad of personal and social responsibilities. Within personal responsibility, we can distinguish different types of duties related to the bonds between the person, others and their natural environment (Fuchs, 1996). Medical ethics is the field of application of social responsibility, raising issues such as reciprocal rights and duties between physicians and patients, bioethical issues linked to beginning and end of life, genetics and development, health costs, ageing population, etc. Each of these questions are profoundly linked to spirituality.

The World Health Organization presents the five roles dedicated to physicians as such: “The physician will be a dispenser of preventive and curative quality care thanks to a global approach of the patients; a decision-maker thanks to an efficient reasoning that integrates the balance of benefits/risks and cost/efficiency where the ethical dimension is present; a communicator who informs and trains the patients; conscious of the community’s needs by participating to social and sanitary actions led by public health institutions which goals are to promote health; a manager integrated to care networks.” (Hercek, 2003, p. 188)

Nowadays, the notion of professional deontology concerns the whole set of duties that are recognized by, and for, a profession. Thanks to it, the profession aims to solve two major problems that happen to any social group: the internal harmony (individuals’ own practices should not destroy the cohesion of the group), and the recognition from the outside (the profession needs to be seen as socially useful). Brotherhood, fraternity and respect are the structure of the code of ethics.

According to Folscheid, “a physician is, ethically speaking, more or less a double being: on the one hand, a physician will have ethical options, like any citizen, and on the other hand, ethical obligations as a physician.” (Folscheid, 1997, p.154) Personal ethics involves more than intuition. It is capable of a well-argued reasoning to firmly fix one’s choices in principles, laws and universal rules. Endowed with memory, it has recorded past experiences and allows what Ricoeur calls “the exercise of a prudent judgment” (1996, p. 10) Prudence, or discretion, consists in “discerning what needs to be done to live a good life.” (Fuchs, 1996, p.195) This double intention of prudence and good life joins some features linked to ethics such as “defining, into concrete action, the aim of the universality of good that constitutes the order of what is reasonable. […] Action, as the effective communication of our acts towards the world, and into the interrelation of human involvements, leans on ‘you must’, thanks to the responsible and committed discernment of the free subject.” (Florival, 2003, p. 33)

In France, the issue of end of life remains a very sensitive and taboo topic. The public debate is regularly mediatized due to new projects of change in the legislation, or to some cases of medical assistance to dying despite the fact that it is forbidden. In this debate where partisans and detractors virulently oppose their opinions, one observation is striking: some practices of euthanasia or medically assisted suicide do happen, but illegally and secretly. We have to be aware of
this reality. Indeed, we need to understand the daily life of the sick and their relatives in order to better understand where physicians’ and patients’ worlds meet or not, and how.

In March 2015, the French Assembly brought a new project to modify the existing laws dedicated to end of life, and especially to the most recent ones that dates from 2005. The possibility to legalize assisted suicide was rejected.

**Method and Fieldwork**

A threefold exploratory qualitative study was led during the year 2015, in Paris, France, with ten physicians, ten patients and ten relatives about their perception of medically assisted suicide. All interviews were face to face and semi conducted. As for many subjects linked to fundamental issues like birth, life or death, respondents have spontaneously talked about their values that they identify as rooted into spiritual, religious or sociocultural aspects.

**Findings and Discussion**

Moral conscience can judge the morality of any act. For instance, if someone acts in alignment with his or her conscience, then this act can be seen as a good act even though it would objectively be transgressing some values. Intention, will and deliberation take place here. Taking the time to deliberate lets some affective shocks go back to calm and leave space for deliberation. Each ethical decision carries a part of risk and of unpredictability. Acquiring a form of prudence, dear to Ricoeur, helps reach a good life, that is to say be responsible for one’s acts in front of oneself, others and in a triangulated relation with the institution. This responsibility relies on the three following axes: self-esteem, solicitude for others and life into fair institutions. Consider the following reflection of one informant who is oncologist: “During a medical staff, I can give voice to what many are saying in private, such as: ‘when relatives thank me for my compassion and devotion, I would rather be thanked for my expertise and my professionalism.’”

Even though vocation is often cited as “a life project” (Schlanger, 1997, p. 27), it is also a long-term challenge to win. Boutinet defines the vocational development as a confrontation to “action, tasks to accomplish, a new round of events and routes, and a reorientation of the paths to pursue (Boutinet, 1999, pp. 44 et 77).

Among the goals that individuals decide for themselves, there are three imperative features that intertwine: the self history and lived experience, the momentary psychology and sociological factors. They all allow individuals understand and justify their own choices to get committed in such or such project or action (Boutinet, 2015, p. 304).

Our society invests a group of almighty physicians who will take care of a group of vulnerable people. This dissymmetry in the relationship stands precisely here. While a patient is desperately waiting for a miracle from the physician, at the same moment the physician experiences a form of vulnera-

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fieldwork</th>
<th>Data Collection</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Main Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Interviews with physicians | • 10 face to face and semi-conducted interviews  
• One interview guide  
• Observation during 4 ethical staff meetings  
• 5 women and 5 men, specialized in Palliative Care, Intensive Care or Emergency  
• Age: 35 to 55. | • Interview transcripts- field notes  
• Content analysis  
• Cross analysis with data from the patients and the relatives. | Whatever the legal context and their decisions toward patients who ask for PAS, they tend to fear to have regrets and/or feel guilty. |
| Interviews with patients | • 10 face to face and semi-conducted interviews  
• One interview guide- 5 women and 5 men  
• Age: 25 to 75. | • Interview transcripts  
• Field notes  
• Content analysis  
• Cross analysis with data from the physicians and the relatives. | The main reason why they plan to ask for PAS is the fear of dying in agony. They tend to see PAS as a peaceful way to die while they are still enough to choose and to act. |
| Interviews with relatives | • 10 face to face and semi-conducted interviews  
• One interview guide  
• 5 women and 5 men  
• Age: 25 to 75. | • Interview transcripts  
• Field notes  
• Content analysis  
• Cross analysis with data from the physicians and the patients. | They tend to feel divided between their desire to respect their relatives’ last will and their own convictions in case both would be very different. |

---

Table 1. Methodological Synthesis
bility too. Ricoeur said that “to believe that I can is already to be capable.” (2001, p. 90). More specifically, saying “I can” does not mean “I can everything.”

This is why most of our physicians respondents explained that they use deontology as a professional tool in front of uncertainty to help them make their decisions. Whereas respondents from the patients or relatives rather question their spiritual value to help them find answers when having to make a difficult decision. This decisional process, structured by general principles and norms, must lead to a consensus. Yet, physicians face the ineluctable question: “Is it ethical to …?” Their lack of understanding concerns authority, or the person who will judge their decision or behavior as ethically acceptable or unacceptable.

What is common to the three profiles of our informants can be summed up in one question: “We have the feeling that a decision will be ethical if, and only if, the decision meets a consensus. But in the name of what? In the name of who? How can we know who will carry the responsibility? The consensus is not a proof of being right…. Concerning the case of PAS, many respondents, from all profiles, have the feeling that assisting suicide thanks to lethal medicine is unnatural or counterintuitive because it would sign the end of hope and faith. And that is when spirituality is the most present. For instance, some physicians and relatives explained that the way they nourish the relationship with the sick patient or relative is coherent with their own spiritual values since it is the presence that counts the most, according to them.

What is more unexpected is to see how the three profiles of respondents’ experience, at some point, though in very different ways, a state of vulnerability. Past experiences intensively come up to their mind when facing an end of life issue. For instance, physicians explain how their long years of studies offer them several occasions to train to decision-making while they are building their first years of professional. They often operate as a break between past and future, like an event in itself. They have to accept the past, even if recent, and to invent a future. Each event takes place in the chronology of their intertwined professional and personal life. Of course, decisions about end of life are always taken collegially. Still, physicians express a need to talk about it, to share about the way they have experienced it, as the following comments from a physician in a Palliative Care unit: “We have the feeling that is ethical what is decided together. But in the name of what? How can we know for sure who holds the responsibility of the decision we make together? Consensus is not evidence.” In a similar manner, relatives express the same need to help them feel stronger with the decision, and help them start their mourning period.

To understand the lived experience of individuals in a situation of vulnerability, it is important to describe how vulnerability imposes tensions in individual notion of temporality and changes in the way they allocate time (Holbrook and Hirschman, 1982). The nature of time in action can be analyzed from three different, but related, approaches: the temporal attitude, time influence in decision-making, and the notion of anticipation. Each has implications for individuals in vulnerable situations.

In terms of the temporal attitude, and from a phenomenological approach, time is constituted from consecutive moments that enable individuals to perceive the world (Heidegger, 1962). Under this premise, time takes a character of a social dimension by which individuals make sense of their behavior and choices: individuals’ present actions are influenced by their viewed past and envisioned future. Bergadaa (1990) analyzed the temporal systems of consumers, establishing a continuum between two patterns of temporal attitudes regarding perceptions of control about the future. For the author, those individuals that believe to be masters of their future have a voluntarist approach to life in general, while those individuals that feel a lack of control over their future have a deterministic approach about life.

Individuals in vulnerable situations are usually represented as individuals that are present-oriented due to the uncertainties of their situation, and whose lives are guided by an exogenous determinism (Bergadaa, 1990). However, our results show that even in vulnerability situations, individuals can develop future-oriented actions that help them regain control of their future, whatever the length of their temporal perspective.

The decision making approach is related to how individuals make their choices. Studies under this approach have usually seen consumers as logical thinkers that follow traditional hierarchies of needs (Maslow, 1954). Under this premise, vulnerable people are commonly characterized as irrational decision makers. However, a profound view of their lived experience of vulnerability may show that these decisions are not only rational but also necessary. Commenting on the way she built up her own discernment, a physician from an Intensive Care unit remarked: “Whatever our status, we all experience the same human condition. We, as physicians, must accept to maybe disappoint the sick, the relatives, our colleagues or even ourselves regarding our own ideals.”

Experiencing a state of vulnerability, be it transitory or long-term, deeply impacts the way people anticipate time. Anticipation is a behavior that brings a continuum into individuals’ lived time, integrating uncertainty in a world of new tailor-made possible. Anticipating requires an ability to suspend time, keeping certain distance with the context, to find out
how future may evolve. A seropositive patient draws direct parallels from his disease to the uncertainty he is facing in his own life: “Since I've learnt that I am HIV positive, I have less freedoms. I do consider assisted suicide as an option when the day has come. I don't want my family and relatives to see me agonizing. I don't want them to lose the image of who I am, nor to see my identity vanish in my agony. I'm not afraid to die, I'm afraid to suffer. I don't want to feel my body sapped by illness. So I'm ready to be active until the very end if needed.” The ability to anticipate stands, here, for a coping strategy. Anticipatory coping is a concept that refers to “efforts to deal with a critical event that is certain or fairly certain to occur in the near future.” (Folkman and Moskowitz, 2004) It “can minimize the impact of the event by helping the individual manage risks and maximize coping efforts” (Harrison and Beatty, 2011; Schwarzer and Knoll, 2003).

A young woman who lost her mother when she was 24 explained how divided she felt when her mother was dying: “She was in denial. I wasn’t. And I must admit that, to be honest, I was waiting for her death to come because the situation had become so intolerable. But I didn’t want the physicians to accelerate her death. To me, it would have killed the last hope. On a spiritual point of view, I am convinced that there is no limit to what we can hope for.”

In sum, end of life imposes a change in individuals’ life’s rhythm, a new temporality intrinsically linked to their status and role in that precise situation.

Conclusion

Nowadays, the medical profession no longer consists in respecting life only, but it consists in managing life (Thiel, 2003). Ethical questions come up at the level of a need for exchanges when “individuals are constrained to adapt to new practices” (Fuchs, 1996, p. 89). The society is structured by an interactive system between groups that have to meet and exchange, justify and legitimate or modify their practices so that they can remain unique and open.

The findings of the current study underline two major challenges. Firstly, there is a shared need for pedagogy. Pedagogy dedicated to medicine students so that they get informed and trained to the specificities they meet while accompanying dying patients. Senior physicians recommend such and initial training to help the junior ones tackle the public debate and have time to elaborate their own positioning in their active life deeply linked to spirituality, medical deontology and medical decision-making. Secondly, there is another call for professional supervision all along physicians’ careers to help them better connect with their patients while remaining faithful towards their own beliefs. Balint groups are proven to be powerful, helpful and efficient. Still, an individual supervision could also be offered to physicians so that they could have a better chance to unveil social taboos within a dedicated space of free speech.

On the side of patients and relatives, or let’s say on the global side of citizens, there is a strong need of pedagogy too to inform and explain the differences between palliative care, euthanasia and assisted suicide, what is legalized and what is forbidden, and how to access to such specific care.

References

Boutinet, Jean-Pierre (1999), L'immaturité de la vie adulte [The immaturity of adult life]. Paris, PUF.
Folscheid (D.), Feuillet-Le Mintier (B.), Mattei (J.-F.) (1997), Philosophie, éthique et droit de la médecine [Philosophy, ethics and medical law]. Paris, PUF.
Increasing Organ Donation Registration in the United States

Matthew D. Meng, Boston University
Barbara Bickart, Boston University
Roberta Clarke, Boston University

Keywords: organ donation, barriers, priority, regulatory, policy change

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Questions
Under a priority system, an individual would be given priority to receive an organ should they need one if they themselves register as an organ donor. Therefore, we aim to answer the question: would introducing a priority system in the U.S. increase the likelihood of individuals registering as organ donors?

Method and Data
Online-based surveys using Mechanical Turk workers were used to examine the likelihood of individuals registering as organ donors under a priority system in the U.S. Standard statistical methods were employed to analyze the data.

Summary of Findings
In Study 1, participants were significantly more likely to register as an organ donor when priority would be given compared to the current system that does not give priority, particularly those who are motivated by personal benefit.A principle components analysis resulted in three factors (“No Personal Benefit”; “Prior Beliefs”; “Lack of Knowledge”) that were influential on whether an individual was registered as an organ donor. The results of Study 2 suggest that wording the priority prompt to emphasize the personal benefit attained is the most effective way to increase the likelihood of influencing a non-donor to register. This prompt wording is particularly effective for younger individuals (who have more viable organs) and those who have lower trust in the organ donor registry (potentially due to prior beliefs).

Key Contributions
The purpose of this research was to explore the feasibility of giving priority in organ allocation to those who agree to donate in the event of their death. Overall, our results suggest that the priority system holds much promise for increasing donor rates by allowing individuals to overcome certain obstacles. Similar priority systems have been introduced in Singapore and Israel with some success and would face fewer barriers to implementation in the U.S. relative to other approaches. On the downside, issues with loopholes have been shown to have a negative effect on organ donation rates in priority systems. Further, priority systems have the potential to alienate minority segments of the population, who may perceive these systems as unfair. Our results provide specific guidance for how such a policy could be designed and implemented in the U.S. given the attitudes of various segments of potential donors.

References are available on request.

For further information contact: Matthew D. Meng, doctoral candidate, Questrom School of Business, Boston University (mdmeng@bu.edu).
Brush Reminder: Testing a Reminder Cue to Improve the Oral Health of Urban Head Start Children

Bridget Leonard, Indiana University–Purdue University Fort Wayne
Holli Seabury, McMillen Health

Keywords: oral health, children, reminder cues, social marketing

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
According to the American Association of Pediatrics, tooth decay is the most common chronic children’s disease in the USA, more common even than asthma and hay fever (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2000). More than 50% of children have at least one decayed or filled tooth by age 5 (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2000). Children living in poverty suffer more severe tooth decay, and tooth decay that is more likely to be untreated than children not living in poverty (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2000). Dental decay in young children is associated with difficulties eating, speaking, and functioning well in school, and significantly increases the risk of dental decay later in life (Peretz et al, 2003; Jackson et al, 2011). Frequent tooth brushing is a major step in the prevention of dental decay, however only about half of preschool aged children are reported to brush their teeth twice a day (Huebner & Riedy, 2010). The objective of this study is to examine the effectiveness of a mirror cling reminder cue in increasing tooth brushing frequency in low income preschool-aged children.

Method and Data
In a longitudinal study, participants were randomly assigned to one of two groups: an intervention group that received a mirror cling intended to remind their children to brush their teeth twice a day; and a control group that did not receive a mirror cling. After completing an initial survey, participants were assigned to either the intervention group or the control group through a simple randomization process. Both groups completed a final survey 5 weeks after the mirror clings were sent to the intervention group to assess frequency of tooth brushing and perceptions of the usefulness of the mirror cling. Participants were drawn from a sample of parents with children enrolled in urban Head Start programs.

Summary of Findings
Findings indicate that while parents felt that the mirror cling helped to remind both them and their children to brush twice a day, and that their children really liked the mirror cling, an examination of the reported frequency of tooth brushing at the initial and final surveys reveals no support for the hypothesis that the cling would increase the frequency of tooth brushing. The positive perceptions of the mirror cling indicate that this type of reminder cue may be regarded as a positive part of a social marketing program, even if it is not sufficient to induce behavior change.

Key Contributions
Although many social marketing programs use stickers and mirror clings as reminder cues, there is very little research that tests their effectiveness over the long term, and in particular, tests their effectiveness on young children.

References are available on request.

For further information contact: Bridget Leonard, Assistant Professor of Marketing, Indiana University-Purdue University Fort Wayne (leonardb@ipfw.edu).
Consumer Reactions to Off-Label Prescriptions

M. Paula Fitzgerald, West Virginia University
Farnoush Rashadi, West Virginia University
Matthew E. Sarkees, St. Joseph’s University

Keywords: off-label drug marketing, consumer behavior, healthcare

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
This paper is based on two premises: (1) many consumers are unaware that physicians can, and do, legally write off-label prescriptions and would be surprised to find out that off-label is common, and (2) prescribing healthcare providers are not required (or even nudged) to inform patients that the prescription is off-label. We discuss two predictors of consumer perceptions of off-label prescribing: social norms and attitudes towards prescription drugs. We then examine how off-label drug perceptions influence two important outcome variables: (1) trust in the prescribing healthcare provider, who in this case is the front-line service provider as well as the “salesperson” suggesting a particular treatment among a variety of options and (2) attitude toward the drug itself. We propose that three factors, (1) fair balance perceptions, (2) negative surprise reactions to learning that a drug is prescribed off-label, and (3) the situational variable regarding when the consumers learns that the drug is prescribed off label, influence the relationship between perceptions of off label prescribing and the key outcome variables.

Method and Data
Hypotheses were tested using an experiment. Respondents read a scenario in which they imagined that they were having trouble sleeping and decided to talk to a doctor about their condition. The doctor recommended a fictitious drug. Respondents were randomly assigned to one of two conditions (aware that the drug is off-label “before” or “after” the drug was prescribed). In the “before” condition, the doctor explained that the drug was off-label prior to writing the prescription. The respondent then received an overview of benefits and risks of the fictitious drug. Respondents randomly assigned to the “after” condition imagined that the next day, after taking a dose of the medicine, they googled the drug and found the identical information (explanation of off-label and benefit/risk information) on their local hospital’s website. All respondents viewed a prescription pad which had affixed to it a circular dark blue “off-label” label which stated, “Off-Label. The Food and Drug Administration has not approved for this use,” in an effort to reinforce that the drug was off-label. All respondents then completed social norms, negative attitude toward pharmaceutical drugs, perceptions that off-label prescribing is unethical, fair balance, negative surprise, trust in the healthcare and attitude toward the brand.

Summary of Findings
We find despite the fact approximately 20% of prescriptions are off-label, this practice tends to violate consumer norms of how the prescription drug marketplace works. This in turn, leads to consumers perceiving that a perfectly legal and rather common marketplace occurrence (healthcare providers writing off-label prescriptions without informing patients) is unethical. When consumers view this practice as unethical, they perceive lower benefit-to-risk profile for the drug, which will reduce the attitude toward the brand as well as trust in the healthcare provider.

Key Contributions
In this paper, we move significantly further down the consumer decision-making process to information provided...
either in the doctor’s office or after consumption of the drug—information about off-label prescribing. From a public policy perspective, we advocate identifying ways to actively inform patients that the drug is being used off-label. This could facilitate more communication between the provider and his/her patient, leading to a more informed decision.

References are available on request.
Exploring the Innovation-Decision Process in the Adoption of Products in Stigmatized Domains

Edna G. Ndichu, University of Wyoming
Terri L. Rittenburg, University of Wyoming

Keywords: diffusion of innovations, innovation-decision process, product adoption, stigma, stigmatized products

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

Research Question
Marketers and policy makers may want to encourage the adoption of certain products, but the stigma surrounding such products may hinder the acceptability, uptake, and sustained use of the products. Research on the relationship between stigma and consumption has focused on how different aspects of stigma may result in unsatisfactory marketplace experiences for consumers, as well as the strategies that consumers resort to in order to navigate the marketplace. For instance, age segmentation cues such as senior discount labels may result in elderly consumers rejecting such discounts in order to avoid stigmatization (Tepper 1994), while consumers may adopt strategies in their everyday purchases to cope with low literacy (Adkins and Ozanne 2005). The purpose of this research is to extend the literature on stigmatized consumption by examining the adoption process of a stigmatized product. We utilize the innovation-decision process, drawn from the diffusion of innovations theory (Rogers 1995), to explore how consumers make sense of a new product in a stigmatized domain, and what aspects encourage or hinder adoption. In particular, we explore these questions: how do consumers navigate the adoption of stigmatized products? How can marketers and policy makers encourage both adoption and sustained use of such products?

Method and Data
To gain insights into our research questions, we utilize the context of the stigmatized domain of women’s reproductive health, and specifically the adoption of the menstrual cup, a new, unconventional, menstrual hygiene product. Semi-structured interviews were conducted in Kenya in summer 2015 with 28 women who are menstrual cup owners. The informants were all female, ranging from 20 to 51 years old. Most of the informants are regular users of the product, while a few are occasional users or used the product only once or a few times and then stopped using it. In addition, one informant is a non-user of the product, even though she is still in possession of the product. The interviews were all audio recorded and for this article, 12 interviews have been transcribed. This interview data yielded over 150 pages of single-spaced text. The interviews were analyzed using a hermeneutical approach (Thompson 1997), first involving intra-text (each interview transcript) and then inter-text analysis, in which patterns and differences across the different interviews were examined. This was an iterative process, involving comparing emergent themes in the data with existing literature.

Summary of Findings
An analysis of the interview data revealed two broad themes related to the innovation-decision process of a product in a stigmatized domain: reaction to product form and functionality, and overcoming body-product fit and functionality concerns. The first broad theme reveals consumers’ reaction to knowledge or awareness of the product, and how this impacts persuasion or the attitudes toward the product. The second addresses aspects and strategies in the decision, implementation and confirmation stages that enable the consumers to overcome concerns about the product. Participants’ accounts of their reactions (as well as the reactions of others that they have told about the product) further reveal two sub-themes: (1) concerns over body-product fit, and, (2) concerns over product reliability and violating of social norms. Findings reveal three sub-themes that help users

For further information contact: Edna G. Ndichu, PhD student, University of Wyoming (endichu@uwyo.edu).
overcome concerns about the product: (1) curiosity/novelty seeking, (2) consumer education and knowledge acquisition, and (3) strategies for coping with social concerns.

**Key Contributions**

Certain products and practices may be beneficial to consumers (e.g., healthier or more sustainable). However, the stigma surrounding such products may hinder the acceptability, adoption and sustained use of the products. By highlighting the innovation-decision process of a stigmatized product that marketers and policy makers may want to encourage consumers to adopt, this research may offer insights into how policy makers can encourage adoption and sustained use of beneficial products in stigmatized domains. In particular, curiosity to try a new product, consumer education and knowledge acquisition, and consumers' adoption of strategies to cope with social concerns provide impetus for participants to adopt and continue using the product.

References are available on request
Owning Community

Meredith R. Thomas, University of Wisconsin Madison
Thomas O’Guinn, University of Wisconsin Madison

ABSTRACT

What is the nature and character of community that is marketed, sold, and purchased in New Urban Communities? Specifically, this paper addresses the extent and nature of consumer satisfaction/dissatisfaction with the delivery of promised community in Pleasant Valley. This provides some insight into the evolving concept of and desire for geographically located community, a treatment of traditional community as a consumer product, and hopefully contributes to evolving community theory. Our data also reveal aspects of the role of conspicuous consumption (Veblen 1899), in a neighborhood in which it is said to be actively discouraged. Finally, we examine the roles of social stratification, status and class-consciousness within the New Urban setting. It is our hope that this research may lead to a greater understanding of the impact of New Urban design on community development, consumer behavior, satisfaction, quality of life, and heretofore declining participatory citizenship. This research can inform public policy makers, such as urban planners, in their efforts to create quality, mid-to-high density communities that foster informal interaction, resulting in meaningful social ties among neighbors.

Keywords: community, urban planning, social stratification, environment, sustainability, residential density, homophily

One early marker of status in the United States was a home in the country. In Post-WWII America, for most Americans, that meant a house in the suburbs. More land and bigger homes imperfectly indicated greater suburban social status. While still more true than not, preferences for where and how to live, at least for some more fortunate Americans, have changed. For one, there is a growing trend of re-urbanization (Bardhi and Eckhardt 2012; Gallagher 2013) in which consumers are opting to buy in higher density neighborhoods closer to city centers. A key benefit of these neighborhoods is supposedly the greater proximity to neighbors and thereby higher likelihood of meaningful relationships with neighbors. In fact, some neighborhoods and cities are purposefully designed to create and foster social relationships that result from residential proximity (Zukin 2009; Dreier, Mollenkopf, and Swanson 2013). These projects are often touted as examples of the New Urbanism, a citizen-consumer movement that seeks to reclaim the cherished American ideal of traditional community through thoughtful residential planning and urban design, construction or redevelopment of neighborhoods (Talen 1999; Katz, Scully, and Bressi 1994). The consumer behavior of purchasing, owning, and reproducing on-going community impinges upon several significant sociological dynamics. New Urban residential developments offer community as the defining consumer benefit, along with sustainability and living with like-minded others. In neighborhoods like Pleasant Valley, the site of our research, community is explicitly marketed, purchased, and consumed. This paper reports partial and preliminary findings of 14 months of ethnography centered on the nature of that consumer behavior.

Specifically, this paper addresses the extent and nature of consumer satisfaction/dissatisfaction with the delivery of promised community in Pleasant Valley. This provides some insight into the evolving concept of and desire for geographically located community, a treatment of traditional community as a consumer product, and hopefully contributes to evolving community theory. Our data also reveal aspects of the role of conspicuous consumption (Veblen 1899), in a neighborhood in which it is said to be actively discouraged. Finally, we examine the roles of social stratification, status and class-consciousness within the New Urban setting. It is our hope that this research may lead to a greater understanding of the impact of New Urban design on community development, consumer behavior, satisfaction, quality of life, and heretofore declining participatory citizenship. This research could better inform public policy makers, such as urban planners, in their efforts to create quality, mid to high-density developments that attract and serve consumers at all economic levels.

For further information contact: Meredith R. Thomas, University of Wisconsin Madison (meredith.thomas@wisc.edu).


Literature

Community

Community, specifically its breakdown and decline, has been discussed since the transition from a predominantly agrarian society to urban modernity in the late-19th century. Simmel’s (1900) Philosophy of Money explained that a growing emphasis on economic exchange was replacing earlier, more qualitative and informal methods of barter involving greater reliance on social relationships. He posited that in modern society, money would become the prevalent connection between people, replacing many important personal ties. This is a common theme in canonic works of early sociology (Marx and Engels 1848; Durkheim 1893). The world presumably became less personal and trustworthy, and more calculating and regulated, as in Ferdinand Tonnies’ (1887) discussion of the transition from Gemeinschaft to Gesellschaft (community to society). According to this founding sociological dynamic (and lament) was that a more authentic, legitimate and morally superior way of life succumbed to a more mechanistic, inauthentic and uncaring modernity, and market capitalism was the engine that drove it all. Consumption was thus forever problematized, and thrust into opposition to authentic community.

Consumer research on communities has largely overlooked or sidestepped the consumption of, and market interaction with traditional notions of community, in favor of community centered around brands, products, tribes, pastimes (Muniz and Schau 2005; Cova and Cova 2001; Muniz and O’Guinn 2001) and more imagined (Anderson 1991) or technologically mediated forms of community (Jayanti and Singh 2010; Kozinets, De Valck, Wojnicki, and Wilner, 2010; Cayla and Eckhardt 2008; Mathwick, Wiertz and de Ruyter 2008; Thompson and Coskuner-Balli 2007). While entirely understandable given the currency of mediated and imagined community, the consumer behavior literature is noticeably quiet when it comes to more traditional forms of community, the face-to-face and civic-oriented, the community of place, and the one whose supposed disappearance has been long lamented by scholars from Weber (1922) to Putnam (2000), Bauman (2001) and Sennett (2011). A notable exception is a recent study by Saatcioglu and Ozanne (2013). While not taking the community issue head-on, they do assert the need to understand moral habitus and status hierarchies in resource-constrained environments. Our study addresses their call for future research by exploring issues related to moral capital and habitus in a resource-rich neighborhood.

Into this relativity paucity of published work, we offer the present study through the lens of traditional community studies. In Pleasant Valley, face-to-face traditional community, and all that implies, constitutes the brand platform and consumer promise. Pleasant Valley is also a place where a way of life, including how one consumes, is marketed, sold and, in turn, consumed. This study is in debt to Bourdieu (1986) in that we are studying cultural capital and status in a consumption community rich with economic and cultural resources and guided by a dominant (New Urban) ideology. The fact that the ideology is actually marketed in the form of a place extends this study’s contribution to the consumer literature.

Neighborhood Community

Traditionally, community was specified by place. In American modernity, it could be a neighborhood. Middletown (Lynd and Lynd 1929) provided deep description of American small-town community, but its greater significance was revealing the ways traditional community was being threatened by modernity, including increasing reliance on isolating technologies, emphasis on material possessions as expression of wealth and status, and a market-driven focus on innovations of material goods rather than improvements to social institutions. Putnam (2000) famously carried on this tradition by marshaling a wide variety of data on civic participation rates, from bowling leagues to voting. His assertion was that retreat from face-to-face community was even greater in the late-twentieth century and now significantly threatened meaningful citizenship and participatory democracy. Increased individualism, diminished social institutions and a more laissez a fare and neo-libertarian ethos are all implicated. Bauman (2001) argues something very similar throughout his works on community’s decline, and directly implicates market capitalism and its product, consumerism. Throughout more than a century of literature lamenting traditional community’s decline, commercial forces have been cast as the main offender.

Since the end of the Second World War, the United States has experienced mass suburbanization, at least until very recently. After 1945, government housing policies incentivized citizens (mostly whites) to move out of the inner cities into the suburbs, where they could use federal housing loans to purchase a single family house near the country, a dream that previously was out of reach for most Americans. Retail followed consumers to the largely white suburbs (Cohen 2000) in the form of shopping malls. The Interstate and other advanced highway systems built in the 1950’s and 60’s further facilitated automobile transportation to and from downtown work, and it encouraged continued suburban sprawl (Dreier, Mollenkopf, and Swanstrom 2013).

While offering the promise of the American dream in the suburbs, there were also costs. Suburban homes are typically not located within walking distance from where residents
worked, shopped, or sought entertainment. More cars on the road results in more greenhouse gas emissions, and longer commute times have contributed to more sedentary lifestyles. Even the promise of knowing one’s neighbors, and having meaningful community in the suburbs began to reveal its vulnerability as the twentieth century drew to a close. The isolation and the hyper-individuality of contemporary American society seemed to overpower the idea of community in the suburbs.

In her 1961 book, The Death and Life of Great American Cities, Jane Jacobs bemoaned the destruction of community and social life from the suburban explosion and urban decline of the 20th century. Casual interaction among neighbors declined in the suburbs (Putnam 2000), despite what occurred on television’s idealized social reality. Significantly, Putnam attributes the American population shift from small town to suburban neighborhoods as a cause of decline in real social capital over the past several decades. In A Consumer's Republic (2003), Cohen sees things similarly in the replacement of the town square with the suburban mall as the center of an impoverished U.S. civic life. Recent work in sociology has discussed the effects of density, various forms of diversity, and segregation on the development of social capital and community.

New Urbanism

New Urbanism emerged in the early 1980’s, and the movement has grown ever since. Through the Council for New Urbanism, a group of passionate architects, city planners, commercial developers, and social scientists, the movement seeks to advance not only traditional neighborhood communities across the country and around the globe, but also greater environmentally and socially conscious living, sustainability, and a diminished role for conspicuous consumption. New Urbanism claims to utilize physical design to enable communities to regain their authenticity and legitimate community (Zukin 2009). New Urbanism is driven by the accepted assessment of community’s severe decline, and a desire to replace what is seen as missing: social ties among neighbors, which foster a culture of reciprocity, and social bonds in which community will flourish. Peter Katz’s 1994 book The New Urbanism, Toward an Architecture of Community, discusses the New Urban movement and emphasizes the benefits sought of traditional communities: safety, accessibility to resources, and connection to neighbors.

The New Urban ideal promotes the creation and restoration of diverse, walk-able, compact, vibrant, mixed-use communities composed of the same components as conventional development, but assembled in a more integrated, livable fashion. These neighborhoods contain housing, work places, shops, entertainment, schools, parks, and civic facilities essential to the daily lives of the residents, all within easy walking distance. The neighborhood designs include common green spaces with a focus on children’s play and shared alley-driveways as places of communion, where most homeowners enter and leave through adjacent garages. Home sites invite, or demand, greater interaction with neighbors, through the prominence of large front porches, short front lawns, and small yards. Most New Urban neighborhoods, Pleasant Valley included, enforce a rigid architectural code ostensibly to encourage aesthetic harmony, a distinctive neighborhood identity, and discourage significant individualization of homes.

Research linking a sense of community (MacMillan and Chavis 1986) and similar ideas preceding New Urbanism have been studied. However, according to Talen (1999), there has not been any successful empirical work studying the impact of neighborhood design on traditional community. A study by Lund (2008) sought to study the impacts of New Urban design on neighborly interaction, but was limited in its quantitative analysis of pedestrian travel and social interaction. The present work seeks to produce a more thorough analysis of social and cultural implications of the New Urban product. Rosenblatt, Cheshire and Lawrence (2009), conducted a two-year study among Australian master planned communities (MPCs), focusing on involvement in formal social organizations within the MPCs, based upon Putnam’s (2000) emphasis on organizational memberships as a measure of community. Gans’ 1967 study of Levittown, New Jersey, provides an early and highly relevant analysis of one of the earliest American planned suburban communities. Our study, more than half a century later, focuses on many of the same things: the presence and form of community in a planned neighborhood, formal and informal social interaction with neighbors, and though not yet formally conceived, the acquisition of social capital (Bourdieu 1986). The present study expands upon this by examining the effects of using New Urban planning and design to affect social behavior, as well as the resulting impacts on consumption.

Method

To date, we have conducted semi-structured, depth interviews with 37 current residents of the Pleasant Valley neighborhood. Interviews took place in residents’ homes or in locations where we could openly discuss the social and cultural aspects of living in the neighborhood. “Grand-tour” questions (McCracken 1988) were used, as well as specific probes to fully access consumers’ unique experiences of living in Pleasant Valley. Interviews were recorded and transcribed, and then analyzed using a hermeneutical process, iterating between individual inter-
views and emerging themes from the entire collection of textual data (Thompson 1997), until theoretical saturation was reached (Given 2008). Informants were recruited via snowball sampling or through flyers posted near the community mailboxes and in neighborhood coffee shops. In addition to the interviews, we have spent time in outdoor public areas such as parks, sidewalks, walking paths, and neighborhood commercial spaces (local cafés and frozen yogurt shop) where we collected observational data by taking detailed notes and photographs.

We have also collected data from an online social network site composed uniquely of Pleasant Valley residents, which they use to communicate, buy, trade, and share things. These geographically-based, online social networks are a relatively new phenomenon and provide rich textual evidence of bringing the use of technology to impact hyper-local networks of people. We have just begun analysis of this data, and are seeing very interesting trends.

Pleasant Valley includes approximately 400 residences including single-family homes, apartments, condominiums and townhomes. The neighborhood houses nearly 1400 inhabitants, 48% of whom are male, 28% are under age 18, and 92% are Caucasian (U.S. Census 2010). Median annual household income in Pleasant Valley is $144,574 (U.S. Census 2010) and average house value is $476,476 (Trulia.com).

Preliminary Findings
From an analysis of our depth interviews with nineteen informants, several consistent findings have emerged. To accommodate guidelines for paper length, we will focus on three.

Feels Like Community (Sort of)
Of primary concern was whether or not those who paid to live in Pleasant Valley felt that it has delivered on the central brand promise of community. Generally, the answer is yes.

Calvin: Here there are sidewalks, virtually no front yards, and, I mean, you’d see your neighbors ... you’d see people. You’d see them again and again. Sometimes you’d sit and talk for a little bit. Sometimes you’d see someone you knew, and you’d talk a little longer. And, but there just was a sense of belonging that I never felt in any of the other places we lived.

Even though Craig was the informant who most openly indicated his general preference for less interaction with others, he still reflected very positively on the existence of strong ties with his neighbors, and the sense of community they “bought into” when they chose Pleasant Valley.

Craig: But people watch out for one another, which is a nice thing, you know. We’ve had one or two people pass away, and the outreach was genuine, you know, and the loss felt was also genuine. Not like a close family member, but everybody knew Ike two doors down who finally died a year later.... And everyone knew how his wife had struggled to give him home care, and this was a sad thing for people. And stuff like that happens....

Beyond these affirmations, informants noted that while Pleasant Valley is “set up” for community, it takes a little effort and the “right kind” of people to make community really deliver. Caroline She described a certain type of person who lives in the neighborhood as making a difference. She also credited the Pleasant Valley “folks” for making community “happen.”

Caroline: This place created the environment for that type of thing to happen, and the whole sitting on the front porch ... people's stories and who they are just came to the forefront, especially in the beginning. People didn’t just scurry into their garages and go in their house, and you never knew who they were, which is what everyday life typically is.

Here, Caroline mentioned neighbors who interact while on their porches. She was not alone; this was one of the most common aspects of the design noted by informants. Yet, she was one of the only informants to confirm actually observing the behavior. Every house in Pleasant Valley has a front porch, ostensibly to serve as the main loci of neighborly communion. But almost no one uses them for that purpose. Instead, it is the less iconic and less nostalgically remembered alleyways where social interaction occurs. Some were aware of the contradiction, others not.

The shared alley/drive ways seem to serve as a contemporary socio-cultural adjustment to the nostalgic physical design. Luke referred to the “alley culture,” where the garage doors were signifiers that neighbors were emerging and opened up the alley for socialization. Most respondents discussed taking part in alley parties, like Kevin’s accounts of the “Rally in the Alley” where there were “bounce houses for the kids and half barrels (of beer) for the dads.” An emphasis on children’s play is central to the discussion, which indicates an interesting turn from the focus on the pristine, unused front porches facing the streets, to the private alleys, where only those connected to the alley are privy to the social activity. Some, like Rich, discussed community as an external activity; produced by “them” (the governing association, “other neighbors”) rather than something he actively took part in.
Rich: They do make efforts to have community here. They’ll have events and whatever. They try to get, you know, alley parties going. And it seems to follow a ripple. If you’re in the first phase, you’ll get it. Then it fades out as community. Then it follows, as you get into the newer and newer areas. And you’ll get some neighborhood relationships going.

Among those who felt this way, there was sometimes a sense of unreality and a lack of authenticity. These informants were puzzled that artifice seemed to only bother some in the neighborhood.

Luke: If you just drive around you think like a neutron bomb went off, which, you know, only takes out people and not structures.

Andrea: No one uses the porches, it’s creepy.

Caroline: At first, I felt like I was in a movie.

Kevin: (in the streets) ... this is so hard to say, but sometimes there’s a Desperate Housewives/Truman Show feel to the neighborhood.

Rich: You feel that around here on the porches they should have robot figures that wave at people…. Sometimes I think I’ve (walked onto a) stage set.

For a few, the neighborhood has under-delivered on the brand promise of community.

Andrea: …When we first moved there, I thought it would be a little more, you know … shiny happy people neighborhood, and ... it’s not really like that.

Allyson: I think, to me, just living close to someone doesn’t necessarily mean you’re going to meet your neighbors…. I think a lot of it has to do with the amount of time you spent home and outside…. So I know a lot of people by, “hi,” you know, whatever. But do I really know people??

Yet, those who believe that Pleasant Valley delivers on its community promise are acutely aware that not everyone feels that way. Their modal explanation is one that places the shortcomings on neighbors who may not understand the involvement required to produce community.

Luke: You get out of it what you put into it…. I think you still have to sort of, you know, show up and be friendly ... all that fun stuff doesn’t just automatically happen because of proximity.

Kevin posits that the New Urban ideal may be challenged by cultural emphasis placed on the American value of property ownership.

Kevin: I think they (neighbors) buy into the concept, but I really think American notions of property ownership, how that’s been culturally constructed, is that it’s very hard to imagine sublimating your own interests to some sort of collective good.

A central theme that has emerged from our interviews was that nearly all informants indicated a decent awareness of how traditional community exists in Pleasant Valley, and that it was something they knowingly bought as a part of their home purchase. This indicates a strong desire from some consumers to buy a home and a lifestyle in a neighborhood with hopes for personal connection and valuable relationships.

Getting Down with the Joneses

One common observation when discussing the identity of Pleasant Valley residents is the emphasis on an “anti-consumerist,” community ethic, and informants saw the neighborhood as a community of people who deliberately do not consume expensive items. The culture of the community is perceived as more socially and environmentally conscious, less materialistic.

Although each home in Pleasant Valley is architecturally distinct, homes must be in the late 19th or very early 20th century Arts and Crafts style, which physically points to the period immediately preceding modern consumer culture. The homes have smaller footprints on smaller lots and the neighborhood itself has formal restrictions on commerce. New Urbanism is marketed, in part, as a rejection of rampant consumerism. So, it is no surprise that the degree to which this promise is realized, or not, is apparent in the neighborhood.

Just as with the first finding, there is disagreement on this. For many, less conspicuous consumption or “under-consuming” should be conspicuous and communally celebrated. Others question the underlying motivations of these consumption norms. Luke discussed the type of people who live in Pleasant Valley.

Luke: And it sort of has this upper-end practicality feel to it that people can afford maybe a little bit more expensive car than they actually end up buying. I think it attracts an interesting hybrid-type person, because at these price points people could get a much larger house and much more land.

Caroline fully embraces this aspect of the neighborhood, but like others, has to confront some of its inconsistencies.
Although they own three other cars, including a Porsche, when talking about their Ford Escape, Caroline says she feels ostentatious driving around in “such a big car,” and her husband would be embarrassed if she was seen “in a Lexus or something.”

Caroline and Bob are conflicted, and feel a little guilty. They try not to drive their less eco-friendly and more “showy” cars in the neighborhood too often, or even drive around the edges, or out the “back way.” Caroline thinks that instead of keeping up with the Joneses’, in Pleasant Valley it is “getting pressurized by the Joneses” or “being schooled and influenced positively with the Joneses.”

Caroline: If anything, it’s the opposite to downsize, to de-consume, to un-consume, to consume better. And that almost becomes like reversed pressure, the guilt. That’s what you feel. And the whole car thing, we are completely impervious, even though my husband loves nice cars. But we are practical in that regard. So I don’t feel it. I don’t feel it.

Caroline also told us about getting involved with a neighborhood social group that was focused on living greener. She says that “goodness” and “citizenship” are the “currencies” in Pleasant Valley. This is a clear example of the field-dependent cultural capital (Bourdieu 1986) that can be derived from consuming more “responsibly” or modestly in Pleasant Valley.

Craig deliberately goes to a coffee shop a few miles away from the neighborhood for its “decent” cup of coffee and doughnut selection. He seems proud of the simplicity of his coffee shop in contrast to the “higher-end” coffee shops in Pleasant Valley. This is a clear example of the field-dependent cultural capital (Bourdieu 1986) that can be derived from consuming more “responsibly” or modestly in Pleasant Valley.

Craig: That (his favorite shop) feels much more like us than sitting in a Wi-Fi Starbucks where Taylor Swift is piped in over the speakers and everybody is coming through in their spandex running outfits and $300 running shoes.

Others detect insincerity and classism in other residents who consume more environmentally conscious products or buy less than they can afford. Kevin discussed what he calls the “Prius effect.” Since he moved to Pleasant Valley, he has tried to resist the common consumption habits that fit the image of the neighborhood. In Pleasant Valley, he feels his “good” behavior is a bit coerced, and insincere.

Kevin: It’s not enough to drive a hybrid. You have to drive the hybrid that screams out to everybody, ‘Look at me, I’m driving a hybrid. Look at me, I’m a member of a CSA.’… And it’s, what I worry about is if you live in Pleasant Valley like I do, and you drive a hybrid like I do, and you join a CSA like I do, you can very easily convince yourself that I’m basically a good person and I’m doing a world of good and I’m saving the earth…. It’s a huge danger. And, you know, and certainly my family outside of (city) just laughs at that. Finds that to be the most ridiculous sort of nonsense.

Some informants believe that the apparent concern for sustainability and frugality is really another form of conspicuous self-expression, and empty social posturing. Jake and Allyson question the motives of fellow Pleasant Valley residents, and Jake expressed his desire to “burn whale oil,” in opposition to the focus on energy sources that are viewed as environmentally conscious, and debate with people around the neighborhood, challenging their true understanding about solar power and energy issues.

Jake: I think there are a lot of people who really (are sincere) in general, but I feel like in this neighborhood, (those) who are really into conserving energy and doing what they think is, you know, best for the environment, I’m not so sure. I mean, I suppose some of them maybe do it for like, the fuel efficiency. Like savings of their money. But I get a sense (it’s) …

Allyson: A statement. I think it’s a statement.

The Houses on the Ridge: Class Consciousness and Income Inequality

Although not explicitly promised by the developer/marketer, our Pleasant Valley informants expected a fairly flat consumer democracy. Part of the New Urban ideology was to create a neighborhood of people with a wide range of incomes, living in similarly sized homes. It was supposed to have diversity in terms of income and wealth, but not in visible display. The idea of affordability, reasonably sized, responsible and “non-showy” use of money is a recurrent Pleasant Valley theme, especially when it is believed to be violated. Violating the image of class sensibility and modesty is really another form of conspicuous self-expression, and empty social posturing. Jake and Allyson question the motives of fellow Pleasant Valley residents, and Jake expressed his desire to “burn whale oil,” in opposition to the focus on energy sources that are viewed as environmentally conscious, and debate with people around the neighborhood, challenging their true understanding about solar power and energy issues.

As Pleasant Valley developed, all lots appreciated, but not wildly. Homes were required to have a minimum square footage, and the small lot size dictated a practical maximum. All plans had to have Pleasant Valley (developer) approval. As a result, there was very little variation in home size and appearance. As of 2012, six lots had been left off the market. They were slightly larger than average, and occupied a promi-
nent ridge that afforded very nice views of the city and lake below. When they came on they market, the lots sold rapidly, at a price that was more than double the average lot sale price, some over $300,000. The six houses that were built were considerably larger, averaging close to 5,000 sq. feet, and all sold at a price between $1-1.5 million. The neighborhood average had previously been less than $500,000.

This has caused a rift in the community. We spoke to no informant who approved of the new homes. They believe that it calls the authenticity of the neighborhood devoted to sustainable community, into question. Our informants believed that the “reasonable” size of homes is symbolic of Pleasant Valley (resident’s) commitment to their goals of reclaimed neighborhood community. Beth refers to their neighbor’s house, which is significantly larger than other houses on the street, as the “community center.”

Beth: You know, there’s this giant house…. And I thought they were more environmentally conscious than they are. Nice people, but … [eye roll].

When asked, Theresa and Rich reflected on conspicuous consumption, and have decided that it only has a real impact on the Ridge.

Theresa: That’s the most egregious example, I suppose. But when you start getting in three-car garages, then you get a little bit more than you really need. I mean, how many do you need? … And usually, it’s a couple with a kid and a dog that live there, and I go, “why?” you know? It turns me off.

Rich: It is such a waste, a waste in resources of various kinds, whether it’s to heat the house, whether it’s materials, whether it’s money that could be used more effectively elsewhere. We use our spare money to support the Humane Society. So you know, again, some people might, they can use their money any way they want…. But again, personal choice, again, that’s one advantage of living, of course, should I say, in America, where you’re not straight jacketed as far as how big a house.

This is an example of conflicting ideologies within residents, one that has been long in conflict in America: libertarian free market and communitarian (Putnam 2000), and its social expression as taste. Rich tries to hold on to his libertarian ideology by saying residents have their personal choice of what kind of house to live in, but it is bounded by his stated sensibilities and cultural moral values related to house size and how discretionary money should be spent when community should be the goal.

Craig is another informant who says he wants people to mind their own business and live as they wish, but he too does not look favorably on the larger homes in the neighborhood. He indicates that it impacts the way he sees the neighborhood and that it affects the collective image by bringing in ostentatious displays of wealth.

Craig: I never was planning to live in a $2 million house neighborhood, you know. I would avoid one if I had any choice just because I, that’s not what I aspire to…. I don’t know who they are. There’s one couple that I assume like must own the Ferrari dealership … there’s a red and a black Ferrari now that come zipping in and out of there.

Interviewer: So would you rather they would have been more in keeping with the rest of the neighborhood?

Craig: You know, I think I would, yeah…. It feels like the range of the community is different … there were cottage lots which were intended to be affordable homes…. If you had four or five smaller lots where, you know, a young family or a couple without kids could buy a nice house … but not feel obligated to build a McMansion on it.

Kevin brings up the social comparison that goes on when considering the largest homes in the neighborhood. He says they should not even be classified as New Urban.

Kevin: So that’s what we, you know, assuage our own guilt in that we’re not as bad as those people. I say that ironically, but it’s, you know. . . I just shudder every time I drive by those.”

Discussion
In this early analysis, we have identified three findings that offer some insight into how consumers are pursuing a greater sense of community by buying into a neighborhood where it is marketed as a prime brand benefit. In contemporary society, transient lifestyles and mass suburbanization have inhibited traditional community from developing organically in residential settings (Bardhi, Eckhardt, and Arnould 2012). However, traditional community is apparently something that is still desired. New Urban neighborhoods allow consumers (who can afford it) to buy a piece of this somewhat romantic and utopian vision. This is an interesting turn in studying resource-rich consumers who are seeking out these neighborly social relationships, which are traditionally based upon norms of reciprocity and interdependence. Previous work has indicated that those who have greater economic capital rely less on social relationships (Marcoux 2009).
Informants in our study reveal a strong awareness of the brand promise of community in their neighborhood. Most feel that some level of community has been achieved. Their ideas diverge more when it comes to how the community is produced and the extent of its authenticity. Some respondents refer to community with neighbors as something that is produced by others (the developer, other neighbors) for resident consumption. Others indicate that any weakness of community within the neighborhood is due to a misunderstanding by residents, of how to actively engage in the production. To these residents, the Pleasant Valley brand is a collective co-creation.

In terms of conscious consumption, Pleasant Valley residents seem to be quite aware of neighbors’ consumption behaviors. However, rather than a one-upsmanship in terms of expenditure, one-downsmanship is closer to the expected norm. Residents seem to be in agreement that the consumer culture of Pleasant Valley centers not on being materialistic or ostentatious, but rather more socially and environmentally conscious. Some embrace this as a sincere movement towards their utopian social ideal. Others consider the ways in which Pleasant Valley residents choose to spend their money as merely alternative forms of conspicuous consumption. Some informants reported always having their current tastes, (Caroline, Rich and Theresa), while others developed them after living there for a while (Kevin, Craig, Al and Betty). Thus, there is evidence of a consumption habitus and field-specific cultural capital (Bourdieu 1986) guiding consumption norms in Pleasant Valley.

Perceptions of social stratification have become an issue in Pleasant Valley. Informants were acutely aware of the homes on the Ridge that deviate from the standard size of homes in the rest of the neighborhood. They see the larger homes as contradicting the ideology of New Urbanism and threatening the collective identity of Pleasant Valley. A collective identity of pragmatism, and relative modesty indicate a desire for a level of social solidarity.

**Conclusion**

New Urban neighborhoods are products offered through the marketplace that offer the promise of a ready-built, traditional community. The current consumer literature has not yet explored traditional, neighborhood-based, face-to-face forms of community. Nor have there been any studies of the New Urban neighborhood allow residents to experience the ideal of community, and perhaps ways by which they may feel constrained.

American neighborhoods portrayed in popular culture from the first half of the 20th century showed a simpler way of life in which people knew and trusted their neighbors. This often idealized past can be a driver of consumption, stemming from “a longing for the past” or a “fondness for possessions and activities associated with days of yore” (Holbrook 1993). Therefore, a marketed notion of community may be a form of commercial mythmaking, in which “consumers are active co-creators of meaning, who themselves selectively use and variously interpret commercialized representations of the past” (Thompson and Tian 2008). However, New Urban lifestyles may also be based on marketed cultural reproductions (Maclaran and Brown 2005; Penaloza 2000; O’Guinn and Belk 1989). Decisions on where and how to consume a domestic lifestyle are clearly missing from the consumer literature. Furthermore, the idea of community has been at the core of social thought for well over a century, but the tension between community and consumer society has been at times shallowly dogmatic, and has in consumer behavior lately leapt over traditional face-to-face forms of community to instead study its imagined and mediated forms. There is certainly room to examine this long-standing tension in the context in which it was originally theorized, in the face-to-face, neighbor-to-neighbor, close proximal sense. We strive to do that here.

**References**


Environmental sustainability research frequently draws on the twin tropes of catastrophe and ecotopia: Current consumption levels are extrapolated to future scenarios of environmental collapse (e.g., McDonagh and Prothero 2014), and utopian hopes of rebalancing our relationship with nature are offered as a solution (e.g., Kilbourne, McDonagh and Prothero 1997). Through this focus on ecological utopias of simplicity, sufficiency, and harmony between humans and nature (de Geus 1999), previous research was able to root sustainability in socio-cultural frameworks (e.g., Burgh-Woodman and King 2012) and highlight social tensions of sustainable lifestyles (e.g., Chatzidakis et al. 2012).

However, previous explorations of ecotopian desires tend to embrace “assumptions about the taken-for-granted stability and materiality of nature […] that have been thoroughly deconstructed and declared untenable within recent social and cultural theory” (Garforth 2006, p. 12). As a result, this work has not yet systematically explored how material forces of naturespace—such as severe climate events (e.g., Phipps and Brace-Govan 2011) or natural disasters (e.g., Baker, Hunt and Rittenburg 2007)—might complicate consumers’ attempts to enact ecotopian ideals. The goal of this research is therefore to explore how consumers pursue ecotopia despite their experience of material-natural dangers that contradict ideals of sufficiency and harmony.

We draw on spatial conceptualizations of utopia (e.g., Garforth 2006) and the spatial turn in environmental philosophy (e.g., Nash 2013) in order to analyze how back-country hikers pursue ecotopian ideals while facing dangers of material nature. The first author participated in six overnight back-country hiking trips (four to eleven participants) that typically lasted from Friday noon to Sunday late at night. Four trips took place during fall, and two during winter. Through selecting these “rougher seasons” and specific locations in Ontario and New York State, we purposefully skewed the sample towards more extreme weather conditions, capturing heavy rain and snow storms. Data collection trips were documented through 114 pages of field notes and about 2,150 photos. Post-hike interviews (ranging between 60 and 150 minutes) were conducted with 15 individuals to complement the data set.

The first theme (“Social Dreaming for Ecotopia”) describes how informants desire romantic experiences of a sacred and peaceful nature, which is construed in sharp opposition to civilization. Consequently, informants strive to be as much in “real nature” as possible, which is marked by the absence of technology, infrastructures, and other markers of civilization. It is there that they can fully feel like “being at one with nature” (Albert). Theme 2 (“Ecotopia on Shifting Ground”) finds that hikers’ relationship with nature is highly ambivalent: On the one hand hikers seek out dangerous situations because they offer opportunities for experiencing harmony and community; hallmarks of ecotopia. However, the flip side of these dangers is that hikers feel dominated by nature, as they are “put (...) in a place of danger” that makes them feel terrified as much as exhilarated (Jasser). These material dangers therefore prompt hikers to long for a more managed nature because “it just feels like it’s unsafe” (Evelyn). Theme 3 (“Controlling Ecotopia”) explores how changes in material nature shift the meanings consumers assign to technological objects that are used during hiking. Even though many informants adopt ecotopian sufficiency ideals by claiming that they “would love to be able to do all this without technology” (Bonnie), they use a whole range of technologies that they do not think disturb their pursuit of ecotopian ideals. Quite on the contrary, most discussions about
technology centered on how specialized gear can guarantee comfort and safety while camping in the winter or hiking in bad weather.

This study provides a more nuanced understanding of ecotopia and the human/nature relationship by drawing out the spatial dimensions of enacted ecotopias. While previous research often assumes that the sheer will to participate in ecotopian projects will bring about a better world, the ecotopian projects that are enacted in this backcountry context are fraught with conflict. Materialities of nature complicate consumers’ desires for ecotopia, requiring informants to engage in practices that seem to otherwise contradict ecotopian notions of sufficiency and embeddedness in nature: They have to build barriers—physical and mental—to reduce embeddedness, and they have to control nature through technologies in order to avoid that their ecotopian dreams crush down on them and turn into dystopian nightmares. In contrast to previous research that presents harmony with nature as to be found outside civilization (e.g., Canniford and Shankar 2013), we find that hikers achieve harmony with nature through civilization. Altogether, these contributions challenge the potential of Romantic Idealism to serve as a suitable framework for sustainable consumption.

References
“Why Wouldn’t I Be Sustainable?”
Structuring Sustainability with No Mandated Policy in Greensburg, KS

Matthew Lunde, University of Wyoming

ABSTRACT
In the United States (U.S.), sustainability is a major area for marketing and public policy researchers, among others. The Brundtland Commission defines sustainability as the ability to “meet the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs” (World Commission on Environment and Development 1987, p. 27). There are studies that have examined communities with mandated sustainable policies and how they have either succeeded or failed (Booth and Skelton 2011; Kennedy 2010; Kruijsen, Owen, and Boyd 2014; Tilbury and Wortman 2008). However, at the time of this writing, no extant studies investigate how a community’s non-mandated sustainable plan affects the sustainable actions of its residents, and how those actions affect the current and future sustainability of the community.

Keywords: sustainability, community policy, structuration, sustainable action

“Why wouldn’t I be sustainable? It isn’t a marketing ploy. It’s just smart living ... um, it not only affects me, my family, and the residents of Greensburg, but by living smart, I affect the environmental, economic, and future sustainability of my community....” (Samuel, age 61).

Briefly, the context of this case study is centered on Greensburg, Kansas, a small agricultural community located in Midwest Kansas, currently with a population of 780 (U.S. Census 2014). Greensburg was struck by an EF-5 tornado on May 4, 2007 (Hagelman et al. 2012). The sustainability plan was not a policy; rather, they structured the comprehensive plan as a non-mandated, community-driven initiative. It appears that Greensburg’s non-mandated sustainability plan positively influenced the residents’ sustainable actions. This is not a study of Greensburg’s horrific tornado, but rather the purpose is to investigate how a community has used a non-mandated sustainability plan to influence people’s sustainable actions and how those actions affect the current and future sustainability of the community. This study strives to provide insights for policymakers and researchers by extending structuration theory into sustainability policy literature. This qualitative study asks two questions:

1. How does a non-mandated sustainability plan affect people’s sustainable actions in the community?

2. How do people’s sustainable actions affect the sustainability plan and sustainable future of the community?

Review of Literature
Previous studies have concluded that consumers will not consistently be sustainable when sustainability is being mandated and enforced through a policy (Booth and Skelton 2011; Kua and Gunawansa 2013; van Bueren and de Jong 2007). The policy could also backfire, where the community members resist the policy (Booth and Skelton 2011). In adopting sustainable actions, people need to be treated as active participants in sustainable decision making through education (Brown, Dawlatabadi, and Cole 2009), creating a structure of place (Sherry 1998), and reducing individual (i.e. lack of interest), responsibility (i.e. lack of motivation), and practical barriers (i.e. lack of time, money, and information) (Kollmuss and Agyeman 2010).

To motivate sustainable action, policymakers may decide to create a sustainability policy, promote sustainability through marketing and education alone, or let consumers make their own decisions (Prothero et al. 2011). Van Bueren and de Jong (2007) analyzed policy successes and failures in sustainability. They concluded that many policies fail to be carried out as intended.

For further information contact: Matthew Lunde, University of Wyoming (mlunde2@uwyo.edu).
This study uses Anthony Giddens’ (1984) structuration theory. Giddens coined “structuration theory” as a micro- and macro-level sociological theory to illustrate how individual actions can reshape larger social structures (i.e. communities) and norms, (i.e. sustainable actions), while at the same time showing how social structures and norms can reshape individual actions (Elliott 2014). Structuration theory emphasizes the relation and interplay “between action and structure, agent and system, individual and society” (Elliott 2014, p. 57). This theory best illustrates how larger social structures, like communities, can be changed through its residents’ actions, while at the same time extending the theory to demonstrate how residents can be changed through action taken by the community. In sum, rules, norms, and resources of the community and its sustainability plan are used to construct social structures, which are used in the systems of interaction (Turner 2013).

**Methodology**

This study uses a qualitative method of 17 semi-structured, depth interviews, observations, and document analysis. Through drawing emergent themes from the interviews, the author develops a conceptual model for policymakers, marketers, and others. The model illustrates how Greensburg used a non-mandated plan to lead its residents to act sustainably, thereby becoming one of the most sustainable communities. (GreensburgKS.org 2015).

As shown in Table 1, the purposive sample was composed of eight men and nine women (labeled by pseudonym), with an age ranging from 33 to 76 years old and an average age of 50.5 years. All participants were consumers of the community. The semi-structured interviews ranged from 50 to 90 minutes (M = 60 minutes). An interview guide of around 20 questions was used to further discussion and prompt additional questions. All interviews were digitally audio-recorded, with the permission of each participant. Once interviews were completed, all interviews were transcribed verbatim into 330 single-spaced typed pages.

**Findings, Discussion, and Conclusion**

Four preliminary themes emerged that illustrate how Greensburg became a sustainable city without using a sustainable policy, rather by using a non-mandated plan. Themes are divided into micro and macro levels as shown in the conceptual model (see Figure 1).

**Keeping Politics Out**

First, throughout the analysis, individuals in the community kept emphasizing how keeping politics out of the plan, their discussions, and marketing helped Greensburg presently and for the future. Politically charged sustainability words such as global warming and climate change create a divide between in people’s views. By keeping them out, the residents could work together in creating a sustainability plan.

---

**Table 1. Demographic Information of Research Study Participants**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Professional Background</th>
<th>Community Members</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Samuel</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Administrative</td>
<td>LW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suzy</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Medicine</td>
<td>W</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Maintenance</td>
<td>W</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Josh</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>LW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lucy</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Tourism</td>
<td>LW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Molly</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Building</td>
<td>LW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shirley</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Policy</td>
<td>LW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travis</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Administrative</td>
<td>LW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luis</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Administrative</td>
<td>LW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anna</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>LW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kelly</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>LW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natalie</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>LW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eric</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Business Owner</td>
<td>LW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andrew</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Law</td>
<td>W</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katrina</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>W</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connie</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Administrative</td>
<td>LW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jack</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>W</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In turn, Greensburg’s sustainability plan helped the residents be more sustainable. Samuel stressed the importance of keeping politics out:

We keep politics out of the equation ... it is not a political agenda or ideology. It is about doing the “right thing” — and the responsible thing.... Too many times, people contribute green or sustainability with liberal, left-winged ideology. But when in fact, our pioneering ancestors were the original green/sustainable people. They lived under the resources they had available based on the climate they knew. They utilized those things that were provided by the environment. So, that is one thing that I think is the most important part. It is about conservation values. (Samuel, age 61).

**Education for All**

Second, many of the studies highlighted above emphasized education as part of an individual’s success to sustainable action (see Brown, Dawlatabadi, and Cole 2009; McDonald et al. 2012, among others); however, many of the studies did not view education as paramount from the individual and group levels. In Greensburg, education for the individual and entire community was paramount in the success of its non-mandated sustainability plan. Luis and Lucy spoke of education as being crucial to Greensburg’s success.

We have been working together trying to educate our residents on sustainability, and I think that will be helpful for people to realize that green and sustainability isn’t the same exact thing ... the best way to educate is by using sustainability ... to create a sustainable future for our children and grandchildren. I want to leave Greenburg knowing my grandchildren one day will still be living in a very sustainable city. (Luis, age 35)

... So just trying to educate people on those little things because I think some of us who are more involved on a daily basis with those things, we know them. I think we tend to maybe take for granted that just everybody knows it…. We really want our people and a lot of aspects to be ambassadors [of sustainability] for a lot of you know, for everything here in town…. I think it all just goes back again to education.(Lucy, age 33)

**Interaction and Connection with Each Other**

Third, many of the residents of Greensburg emphasized their interaction and connection with others as vital to Greensburg’s sustainability success. Many participants focused on the residents’ interaction with the city council, with others, and with the future success of the community. By focusing on the “human” aspect of the city, rather than the streets or buildings, it helped give them a deeply rooted connection to the community. Jack (age 35), stated, “Without people, without community interaction, there is no community, there is not sustainability....” Many residents understood that they needed to work together, interact with each, and connect with other if Greensburg was going to be successful and sustainable for future generations. Molly spoke highly of the community connections, how people worked together after the tornado to rebuild a sustainable community.

Community interaction and sustainability starts with having to keep people motivated, and keep people excited and keep them engaged ... otherwise it would be very easy to settle back into that slow-paced farm town that’s
just slowly fading…. We like Greenburg now as a sustainable community. I know most of us want our children and grandchildren to have a bustling sustainable community as well…. If we work for the community, the community will work for us. (Molly, age 35)

**Smart Living for the Future of the Community**

Lastly, many credited that idea to a shift in thinking of the residents. That shift came through thinking about the future through “smart living.” By creating the idea of “smart living,” many residents felt the success of Greensburg’s sustainability came from the idea of what Samuel stated, “Why wouldn’t I be sustainable?” Many of the participants spoke of “building smarter … it’s just the smart and economical thing to do” (Shirley, age 59), “creating smarter infrastructure” (Molly, age 35), “educating our kids in a smart way” (Josh, 55), and to “just live smart” (Travis, age 35). Anna emphasized the idea as of why would someone not be sustainable through smart living.

It’s just smart living, don’t even put the word sustainability just say it’s smart living and that changes people’s focus if you say smart living or if you say conservation it’s a lot different than if you say sustainability. (Anna, 68)

**Conceptual Model**

Figure 1 illustrates the conceptual model that emerged from the four themes. The conceptual model is rooted in Giddens (1984) structuration theory.

As illustrated in the conceptual model, the four themes interconnect with each other: they interplay with each other: the macro and micro levels. The sustainability of Greensburg helps create sustainable action in its residents. The interplay creates individual sustainable action for the future of Greensburg. To create a sustainable community through a non-mandated sustainability plan, connections between the different levels and in between the different themes come into play. These four themes work together to create a sustainable community for today as well as for the future without the need of a mandated policy.

**Conclusion**

Sustainability is always going to be a highly researched topic in individual decision-making, academic research, business practices, and policymaking. As the world’s limited resources become scarcer, sustainability will emerge as a larger goal for many individuals, businesses, communities, and countries. As shown in previous literature, sustainable plans and/or policies do not always result in sustainable actions. However, when sustainable actions do result, they not only benefit the individual, but also provide benefits to their community and world around them. Using Giddens’ (1984) structuration theory as a theoretical framework, this sustainability study of Greensburg, Kansas found that, not only did a non-mandated sustainability plan lead participants’ sustainable actions, but also the non-mandated plan help focus their actions on the future sustainability of the community. Key contributions to literature include extending structuration theory to sustainability and policy literature and understanding how to market, implement, and create sustainable action without the need for a mandated sustainable policy.

**References**


Author Index

Adams, Leen 88  Gau, Roland 3
Adkins, Natalie Ross 12  Geuens, Maggie 88
Akiyeva, Alla 70  Gifford, Heather 92
Anderson, Rolph E. 10  Gollnowhofer, Johanna F. 12
Audrezet, Alice 90  Grover, Aditi 12
Austin, Caroline Graham 14  Gruber, Verena 1
Baker, Stacey Menzel 7, 74  Gwozd, Wencke 31
Ball, Jude 92  Hamby, Anne 56
Bartholomew, Gregory 7  Hamilton, Kathy 12
Bartolo, Daniel 61  Handelman, Jay M. 141
Bell, Monique 119  Henderson, Geraldine Rosa 7
Bennett, Aronté 7  Hoek, Janet 92
Benoit-Moreau, Florence 54  Holweg, Christina 1
Bickart, Barbara 126  Hunsberger, Monica 31
Bourjot, Julien 53  Hutton, Martina 7
Bratton, Virginia K. 14  James, J.P. 7, 83
Brinberg, David 56  Keisler, Aysha 102
Brinson, Nancy H. 21  Khare, Aporov 7
Cabano, Frank 9  King, Skyler 118
Chaaban, Aida Mimouni 91  Klein, Sheri 61
Charry, Karine 53, 89, 90  Konstabel, Kenn 31
Chen, Zoey 59  Kopp, Steven W. 70
Chester, Jeff 83  Kovacs, Eva 31
Clarke, Roberta 126  Krueger, Kem P. 57
Cohen, Alex H. 10  Kwak, Hyokjin 119
Cook, Laurel Aynne 66  Lambert, Cait Poynor 16
Coskun, Ayşen 107  Landers, V. Myles 117
Crosby, Elizabeth 12  Langenderfer, Jeff 70
Cross, Samantha 7  Leary, R. Bret 72
Dadzie, Charlene A. 68  Lee, Chris 41
Dadzie, Kofi Q. 68  Lee, Kyungwon (Kyung) 83
Davis, Cassandra 12  Lee, Y.K. 23
Diamond, William D. 51  Leila, Elgaaded 109
Dunnett, Susan 12  Leonard, Bridget 127
Eastin, Matthew S. 21  Liu, Richie 118
Eha, Marge 31  Luca, Nadina R. 101
Eiben, Gabriele 31  Lunardo, Renaud 54
Ekpo, Akon 7  Lunde, Matthew 74, 143
Elisa, Monnot 109  Łuszczy, Edyta 31
Elliot, Esi 9  Maas, Peter 64
Erick, Stephanie 92  Machin, Jane E. 12
Eslami, Hossein 108  Mandel, Naomi 9
Fanny, Reniou 109  Mathras, Daniele 9
Fitzgerald, M. Paula 16, 128  Matias, Jess
Fresneda, Jorge E. 10  Mazur, Artur 31
Gabler, Colin 117  Menaud, Xavier 120
Garcia, Stephen 23  Mende, Martin 30
Gardner, Meryl 9  Mendl, Edina 31